MOVING FORWARD IN SERVICE RESEARCH:
A CONCEPTUAL AND EMPIRICAL CONTRIBUTION

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (by Publication)

Christopher James White

School of Economics, Finance and Marketing
Business Portfolio
RMIT University
March 2008
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to thank my supervisors, Professor Tim Fry and Senior Lecturer Con Starvros for their support and constructive comments in writing the integrative paper. I would like to thank the co-authors for their assistance in completing two of the articles attached below. I would like to thank all of the anonymous reviewers whose comments and feedback enabled the publication of the articles that formed the basis of this submission. Mostly, I would like to thank my wife Ting for all she has done and God for unconditional support and guidance throughout my life.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

## LIST OF FIGURES AND TABLES

## SUMMARY

1. **INTRODUCTION**
   
   1.1 Background
   
   1.2 Research aim

2. **THEORETICAL DOMAIN**
   
   2.1 Tri Component model of attitudes

3. **METHODOLOGY**
   
   3.1 Approach
   
   3.2 Research design
      
      3.2.1 Data collection
      
      3.2.2 Sampling procedure
      
      3.2.3 Data analysis

4. **DISCUSSION**
   
   4.1 Foundation phase
      
      4.1.1 Research aims
      
      4.1.2 Major findings
      
      4.1.3 Contribution to knowledge and practice
      
      4.1.4 Limitations
   
   4.2 The search for predictors phase
      
      4.2.1 Research aims
      
      4.2.2 Major findings
      
      4.2.3 Contribution to knowledge and practice
      
      4.2.4 Limitations
4.3 Construct development and refinement phase
  4.3.1 Research aims 41
  4.3.2 Major findings 41
  4.3.3 Contribution to knowledge and practice 44
  4.3.4 Limitations 45

4.5 Consolidation phase
  4.5.1 Research aims 46
  4.5.2 Major findings 46
  4.5.3 Contribution to knowledge and practice 49
  4.5.4 Limitations 50

5. CONCLUSION
  5.2 Impact of research 52
  5.3 Directions for future research
     5.3.1 Personal reflection 56

REFERENCES 59

APPENDICES
  Appendix 1: Bibliographic details of research program articles
  Appendix 2: Hard copy of all articles.
LIST OF FIGURES AND TABLES

Figure 1: A Framework for analysing services
Figure 2: Schematic representation of research program evolution
Figure 3: Mean scores of cultural value profiles for both groups
Figure 4: Re-specified emotion model
Table 1: Publications in relation to the three components of attitudes
Table 2: Broad characteristics discerning Qualitative and Quantitative paradigms
Table 3: Questionnaire distribution, relevant articles and response rate
Table 4: Data analysis technique and publication
Table 5: Relationship between constructs
Table 6: Correlations between the components
Table 7: Summary of response to the perception and image questions
Table 8: Emotion components and loadings
Table 9: Predictors of loyalty intentions for mood states
Table 10: Cited articles
Table 11: Ranking of journals by publications
Summary

The aim of this research program was to advance theoretical and practical understandings of three constructs; service quality, customer satisfaction and customer loyalty intentions, that singly or collectively, have become a major concern for both practitioner and academic. As early as 1960, Motorola USA had implemented a proactive customer satisfaction program, and the former Vice President of the Consumer Products Division declared ‘… customer satisfaction is not some new addition to the nations’ economic system, but the very guts of it’\textsuperscript{1}. One year later, Ron Cunningham writing in the \textit{Harvard Business Review}, stated the importance of focusing on customer loyalty,\textsuperscript{2} and recent evidence suggests that firms who take these areas seriously, are more profitable\textsuperscript{3} and successful in the long term.\textsuperscript{4}

While industry has been aware of the significance of these constructs for some time, academic attention was relatively slow to catch up. For example, the seminal work of Parasuraman, Zeithmal and Berry on what constituted service quality and its measurement was published in 1988. Richard Oliver’s work in the early 1980s raised questions regarding the antecedents of customer satisfaction. Customer loyalty intentions in the service domain has lagged further behind, with the first comprehensive model proposed by Zeithaml, Parasuraman and Berry in 1994.

\textsuperscript{1} Edward P Reavey et al. (1973) Ideas for action, \textit{Harvard Business Review}, November/December
\textsuperscript{2} Cunningham, R (1961) Customer loyalty to store and brand, \textit{Harvard Business Review} Jan/Feb
\textsuperscript{3} Hart, C (2007) \textit{Harvard Business Review}, March
\textsuperscript{4} http://welcome.hp.com.html
Since those early attempts, research on these constructs has flourished, as 35, 104 and 56 peer reviewed articles that focused on service quality, customer satisfaction and customer loyalty respectively, have been published in the *Journal of Marketing* and the *Journal of Marketing Research* since the year 2000. No doubt this trend will continue as globalisation, regional economic agreements and information technology redefine the way services are produced and consumed.

The service sector is a broad term that encompasses industries as diverse as transportation, health care and finance, and within these categories, equally diverse subcategories of firms exist, (with large banks for example at one end and financial advisors’ working from home at the other). While there are basic factors that distinguish most services from other forms of production, the diversity and complexity of activities conducted between service firms necessitates industry-focused research, resulting in the proliferation of service sector specific journals over the last 15 years. The industry that provided a context for the current research program was the tourism industry, and this decision was taken because it is the world’s fastest growing economic sector, in terms of foreign exchange earnings and job creation,⁵ and the present author had worked in that industry for many years.

The current research program began in 2003 with the first published output appearing in 2004. The program was completed in 2007. It consists of nine peer reviewed publications that have been classified into three distinct phases. In many respects it was an evolutionary process, in that earlier findings identified the questions for proceeding

---

⁵ http://www.world-tourism.org/aboutwto/eng/menu.html
research, and while service quality, customer satisfaction and customer loyalty intentions were of primary concern, other constructs were also examined. These were cultural values, work values, consumption emotions, mood and destination image. The unit of analysis in all of the articles was individuals, as opposed to organisations, and as such, the theories and concepts that were examined and tested throughout the research program have their origins in psychology. As a consequence, the research findings have implications not only for the tourism industry, but any service that involves an interaction between people.

The integrating paper that follows this summary provides a background to the research program and states the overall aim. The theoretical perspective that underpins the program is addressed and the research approach is discussed and justified. The Discussion Section concentrates of each of the three phases by providing for each an overview, the research aims, the major findings, how they contribute to knowledge and practice, and limitations. The integrating paper concludes with a summary of the research program’s impact from an academic and personal perspective and proposes direction for future research.
1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

According to the Business Council of Australia (‘Services economy,’ 2007) ‘The service industry is now the major driver of growth in the global economy and will increasingly determine Australia’s future growth prospects.’ Services differ from other forms of production, in four main ways (Lovelock, Patterson, & Walker, 2004). First, services are acts, ideas or concepts and as such cannot be inspected or trialled before consumption. Second, most services are produced at the moment they are consumed thus requiring a service provider and a customer to be present in order for the service to occur. Third, a service cannot easily be stored and brought out on demand, and finally, the delivery of services is susceptible to variations, as the wants and needs of customers and service personnel are heterogeneous.

Clearly, the responsibility for providing a successful service experience involves more than just frontline service providers (Woods, 2002). The systems and processes necessary to produce a service need to work cohesively and be easily understood by the customer, a responsibility that falls within the realm of operation managers. Employees need to be motivated and trained to provide quality service, a human resource function, and adequate budget allocations are required to align staffing levels to demand. Figure 1 represents the relationship between the various entities that are involved in producing a service, in order to achieve the outcomes that are central to success, satisfaction, quality and loyalty.
Not only do services differ from other industries, they also differ among themselves. For example the services provided by a medical practitioner are vastly different than those provided by a supermarket attendant, and various classification schemes have been developed to identify and cluster services with similar characteristics. This further disaggregating of the service industry has important implications for both practice and theory, as managing and operating a telephone call centre has a different set of priorities, and expertise, than managing a five-star tourist resort. Moreover, the knowledge of broader sector practices, operations and administration is often seen as prerequisite to generating good research, thus many service researchers have chosen to specialise at the sector level.

In order to fully account for the unique nature of services, service research has steadily evolved into an identifiable body of knowledge. Some scholarly publications such as The Service Industries Journal and The Journal of Service Research have taken a broad approach and were launched in 1981 and 1998 respectively. The Journal of Services Marketing (1989) and The International Journal of Service Industry Management (1990) adopted a more discipline focus, while others targeted individual service sectors.
Despite the different themes and approaches taken by journal editors, theories and concepts drawn from social psychology are commonly used in service research to address employee or customer research problems. For example, Maslow’s hierarchy of needs has been applied to understand customer and employee motivation as has Hofstede’s cultural values framework (Hofstede, 2001). The Theory of Planned Behaviour has been used in marketing and management contexts, and an array of social situations (Armitage & Conner, 2001). Customer loyalty (Oliver, 1999) and organisational commitment models (Mowday, Steers, & Porter, 1979) have both been conceptualised as consisting of a cognitive, affective and conative component, in line with early conceptualisations of attitudes (Bootzin, Bower, Crocker, & Hall, 1991).

As with the examples provided above, the theories and concepts that have been used in the development of the publications that form the basis of this research program, either originated from, or have been strongly informed by psychological research and literature. Various models and constructs have been identified, and applied to understanding the mental processes and functions that influence evaluations and judgements of customers, potential customers and employees. The rationale for such a focus was based on the present author’s experience as a national and international manager in that area, and 11 years teaching undergraduate and postgraduate tourism and hospitality related courses.
1.2 Research aim

The broad aim of this research program has been to advance theoretical and practical knowledge of service quality, customer satisfaction and loyalty intentions. This was achieved by refining existing models or concepts, testing relationships between constructs that have not previously been examined, or applying constructs that have been well understood in a specific academic domain, in a service industry context.

The objective for the past seven years has been to consistently review literature related to these constructs from psychology, tourism, marketing and management literature and to actively pursue research opportunities as they emerged out of this process, as well as opportunities generated out of the primary research. That is, much of the earlier research listed in Figure 2 paved the way for later publications.
The articles that form the basis of this submission have all been published in internationally recognised journals, and have all been subjected to a double blind refereeing process. The evolutionary focus of the research program is displayed in Figure 2, and can be classified into three distinctive phases. The full bibliographical details of each article can be found in Appendix 1.

The foundation phase (phase 1) provided interesting insights into service quality from an internal customer perspective, and highlighted the limitations of taking a single construct approach to a complex topic. The articles in this phase (White & Rudall 1999; White 2001) do not form part of this research program as the journals in which they were published no longer exist. They have been included here because they provided the

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase</th>
<th>Focus</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Foundation (not included for examination)</td>
<td>Service quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>White &amp; Rudall (1999)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>White (2001)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The search for predictors</td>
<td>Values: White (2005b)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Emotions: White &amp; Scandale (2005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Image: White (2005c)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>White (2006b)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>White (2006a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>White (2005a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construct development and refinement</td>
<td>Satisfaction, loyalty intentions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>White (2005c)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>White (2004)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Synthesis</td>
<td>Values, emotions, loyalty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>White (2005a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>White (2007)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 2: Schematic representation of research program evolution
impetus for the following phases and background information that may assist the reader in understanding how the development of the program evolved. The search for predictor phase (phase 2) was concerned with examining three constructs to determine their suitability in terms of meeting the aims the research program. Of the three, emotions held the most promise, as indicated by the solid line, and influenced the work conducted in subsequent phases. While values were not to become a major focus, the outcomes generated from this work were deemed important for researchers working in the value domain, and were discussed at length in a later publication, hence the dotted line.

The work on destination image, while fruitful, was deemed unsuitable for the current research program and work on this area ceased after White (2005). The third phase, construct development and refinement, deepened understandings of the relationship between emotions and consumer behavioural intention, and the synthesis phase (phase 4) pulled together many of the threads that had been conceptually and empirically explored in earlier phases. Each phase will be dealt with at length in Section 4. The following sections address the theoretical perspective upon which the research program was based, a description and justification of the methods employed and an in-depth discussion on how the articles within each phase have contributed to and enhanced theoretical and practical knowledge in the service domain.
2. THEORETICAL DOMAIN

2.1 Tri component model of attitudes

The theoretical perspective, upon which the articles presented in Figure 2 are based, has its origins in the study of attitudes. Attitudes have been defined as ‘... an evaluative response to a particular object, idea, person, or group of people’ (Breckler, 1984), and while there have been a number of well known approaches taken to understanding attitudes (White, 2005a), one of the most enduring of these proposes that attitudes consist of three components; cognitive, affective and conative. In this view, the cognitive component consists of knowledge and perceptions that take the form of beliefs about an object. The affective component consists of the emotions, moods and feelings one has toward the object and the conative component relates to the likelihood or tendency that one will behave in a particular way toward the object. One appealing feature of this model, when compared to other attitude theories, is the inclusion of an affective component as leading scholars have observed (Trafimow et al., 2004):

“We began our investigations with the traditional premise that people’s behavioral intentions are the result of a reasoned process. In contradiction to this traditional premise, the between-participants analyses demonstrated that exactly the reverse was actually true. This finding, which has been replicated across three studies, suggests that researchers should give affect more credit as a determinant of behavioral intentions than has been true in the past. (p. 220)”
Despite the appeal of the tri component model, consensus on the relationship between the components has not been reached. Some authors have reported that the three components are correlated, yet distinct, and mutually influence each other (Breckler, 1984) while others have reported that the convergent and discriminant validity of the model holds only in certain circumstances (Bagozzi, 1978). More recent work suggests that cognitive appraisals are an antecedent of affect (Roseman, 1996) which in turn influences intentions – a view that is well supported in the consumer behaviour and marketing literature (Spreng, Shi, & Page, 2005; Caruana, 1999).

Regardless of the lack of agreement on the relationship between the components, they still play a vital role in guiding consumer behaviour research. The inclusion of an affective component has particular relevance for the tourism and hospitality focus of the current research, as according to Swarbrooke and Horner (1999), the decision to purchase a holiday involves a significant emotional investment. For the purposes of this research, perceptions of service quality operationalised the cognitive component (Choi, Cho, Lee, Lee, & Kim, 2004; Montoya & Horton, 2004; Spreng, Shi, & Page, 2005), emotions and mood, the affective and behavioural intentions, the conative component.
Table 1: Publications in relation to the three components of attitudes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cognitive</th>
<th>Affective</th>
<th>Conative</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White (2006b)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1 organises eight of the nine articles displayed in Figure 2 according to where they primarily relate to each of the three components and the discussion will now proceed with a review of the methodology.
3. METHODOLOGY

3.1 Approach

For Burrell & Morgan (1979 p. 4), ‘… all social scientists approach their subject via explicit or implicit assumptions about the nature of the social world and the way in which it may be investigated’ and attempts to categorise approaches based on the assumptions have usually resulted in the formation of two broad and bipolar dimensions or paradigms (Marsden & Littler, 1996).

The term paradigm was used by Kuhn (1962) to refer to a particular and concrete achievement that defines by example the course of all subsequent research in a scientific discipline: Newton’s law of gravity or Skinner’s work on operant conditioning for example. In a postscript to the *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions* he broadened his interpretation of the term to encompass the entire cluster of problems, methods and theoretical principles that guide the way scientists conduct their research and used the term ‘disciplinary matrix’ to describe such clusters (Bird, 2004). It is important to note the latter description did not override the former but rather complimented it as Kuhn believed that paradigm exemplars define the elements within a disciplinary matrix (Bird, 2004). According to Kuhnian perspective, a new paradigm must be based on an exemplar work that in most aspects can be distinguished from existing disciplinary matrices.

As mentioned above, research approaches tend to be categorised into two broad paradigms and while there are some differences between the theories that constitute each
one, few disagree that the two paradigms are not sufficiently different to warrant their own position within the practice and development of research and theory. Few however agree on what these paradigms are called. Some refer to them as quantitative and qualitative (Creswell, 1994; Onwuegbuzie & Leech, 2005), others as positivist and anti-positivist, positivism and social constructionism (Marsden & Littler, 1996), positivist and phenomenological (Barker, Nancarrow, & Spackman, 2001), and subjectivist and objectivist (Burrell & Morgan, 1979).

For the present author, labels are only a means of identification and of more importance are the issues the labels represent, namely, the assumptions made regarding the social world and the implications of these assumptions on the research process. For the purpose of this paper the terms quantitative and qualitative will be used to distinguish between these two broad research approaches.

The two approaches can be distinguished by assumptions made by researchers on ontological, epistemological, human nature and methodological grounds (Gioia & Pitre, 1990). The first set of assumptions are of an ontological nature and here researchers are faced with questions regarding reality; is reality external to the individual, imposed on consciousness from without? Or is it the product of individual consciousness: the product of one’s own mind?

Epistemological assumptions are about issues having to do with the creation and dissemination of knowledge in particular areas of inquiry. Questions are raised such as, ‘What are the necessary and sufficient conditions of knowledge?’ ‘What are its sources
and structure? ‘How can knowledge be communicated?’ (Steup, 2005) These are raised here and have implications for the forms of knowledge that can be obtained and how one can sort out what is to be regarded as true or false (Burrell & Morgan, 1979).

Assumptions about human nature involve questions about the relationship between the individual and the environment. Some perspectives in social science assume that human beings respond in a predictable and mechanistic fashion to what they encounter in the social world. Others assume that people actively create their own environment, are autonomous and free-willed.

The three assumptions described above have methodological implications as each influences the way knowledge is obtained. For example, if one assumed the social world consisted of an observable, external and objective reality, then the methodology would be concerned with examining the elements or construct within the social world, the relationships between them and the way they influence individuals. The emphasis here is to determine what is general and universal. Alternatively, if one assumed that the social world consisted of the subjective experience of individuals then the emphasis is on understanding how a person creates and modifies their environment and the emphasis here would be to determine the unique and particular (Burrell & Morgan, 1979). Table 2 provides a summary of the key differences between the two approaches.
Table 2: Broad characteristics discerning Qualitative and Quantitative paradigms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assumptions</th>
<th>Quantitative</th>
<th>Qualitative</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ontological</td>
<td>Reality is objective and singular.</td>
<td>Reality is subjective and multiple</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Epistemological</td>
<td>Researcher is independent from the research problem</td>
<td>Researcher interacts with what is being researched</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human nature</td>
<td>Individuals are a product of their environment</td>
<td>Individuals create their environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodological</td>
<td>Deductive process</td>
<td>Inductive process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cause and effect</td>
<td>Mutually simultaneous shaping of factors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Static design</td>
<td>Emerging design</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Context free</td>
<td>Context bound</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Validity and reliability</td>
<td>Integrity, authenticity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Statistical symbology</td>
<td>Words assigned meaning</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Adapted from: (Burrell & Morgan, 1979; Creswell, 1994; Creswell, 2005)

One of the problems with the two research paradigm concept is that it oversimplifies reality by focusing on the extremes and tends to polarise researchers into one camp or another, resulting in the neglect of many perspectives that exist between them (Ball, 1976; Onwuegbuzie & Leech, 2005). While acknowledging these limitations Table 2 is presented here as a very broad summary of the characteristics associated with both quantitative and qualitative approach and the implications of these characteristics for research methodology.

Criticisms of the quantitative approach mostly focus on the fact that human beings and their behaviours are not readily understood in terms of cause and effect, and the designs employed such as correlational, survey or experiment are too rigid to fully explain and describe elements within the social world (Creswell, 1994). The main criticisms of the qualitative paradigm are that the findings tend to be subjective and that in attempting to
interpret people’s behaviour researchers read into that behaviour too much meaning or meanings that were not there in the first place (Johns & Lee-Ross, 1998).

Some authors recommend that both approaches be used in a study (Creswell, 1994; Johns & Lee-Ross, 1998) to gain a richer perspective on a topic. Intuitively, the incorporation of both approaches into the research design would generate more robust and fruitful outcomes. However, as Creswell (1994, p. 7) warns, ‘… to use both paradigms adequately and accurately … extends dissertation studies beyond normal limits of size and scope.’ He continues, ‘… using both paradigms can be expensive, time consuming and lengthy, and researchers and faculty are seldom trained in the skills necessary to conduct studies from more than one paradigm.’ The paradigm that informs the methodology used throughout this research program is the quantitative and the rationale for this decision is discussed below.

Creswell (1994) suggests that there are four factors that need to be considered when deciding which paradigm to choose and these are addressed from the current researcher’s perspective. First, the researcher was comfortable with the philosophical assumptions that shape the qualitative paradigm. Second, the researcher has sufficient knowledge and expertise of statistics to identify the appropriate procedures and produce sophisticated analysis and accurate results. Third, the aim of the research program, refining existing models or concepts; testing relationships between constructs; or applying constructs that have been well understood in specific academic domains in a service industry context, clearly places the research program within a quantitative paradigm. Fourth, the quantitative approach has a long history and is widely adopted and
accepted in the literature related to the various constructs that were considered in this research program.

There are no right or wrong answers to the paradigm selection decision and it is pointless to argue that one approach is superior to the other. Rather, it is more important that a researcher is aware of the various assumptions that their approach is based upon and that decisions relating to research design and data collection procedures are consistent with the particular approach.

3.2 Research design

Research designs are the specific procedures involved in data collection, analysis and reporting results. For Creswell (2005), three kinds of designs are appropriate for a quantitative approach and can be classified as experimental, survey and correlational. In brief, experimental designs are used to determine whether an intervention influences an outcome between or within groups and allows a researcher to identify possible cause and effect relationships between independent and dependent variables. Survey designs involve surveying an entire population, or samples within a given population, in order to identify trends in attitudes, behaviours or opinions that can then be generalised to the whole population. Correlation designs share much in common with survey designs but here the focus is on identifying associations between constructs or variables. Correlation designs allow a researcher to explain and predict the strength and direction of relationships between individual or multiple variables.
The decision to choose a particular design is based mostly on the aim of the research project. If the aim was to determine what factors caused an outcome or to describe trends within a population, an experiment or survey design would be appropriate. As the aim of this research program was to advance and develop knowledge related to the constructs of service quality, satisfaction and customer loyalty, a correlation design was deemed most suitable and was adopted in eight of the eleven publications detailed above. Advances in statistical analysis software since the 1970s has enabled researchers to examine complex associations between variables in a time efficient manner (Creswell, 2005) and advanced correlation techniques such as path analysis now allow for the estimation of data/model fit statistics. Correlation designs are now commonplace within quantitative social science research and have been viewed as an acceptable alternative to traditional experimental designs (Kline, 1998).

3.2.1 Data collection

Questionnaires were the predominant data collection technique employed throughout this research program. The data from five of the papers displayed in Figure 2 were collected by self-administered questionnaires that were completed by the respondents. The data from White (2005c) was based on an interviewer-administered questionnaire where the researcher recorded participant responses to two structured questions. This interview strategy was chosen because in this study the participants needed to be prompted on successive occasions during the interview process and establishing this interviewer/participant interaction would have been more difficult in a self-administered setting. A full description and justification for this decision can be found by referring to White (2005c).
Questionnaires have the advantage of being able to capture complex information from individuals and are a cost and time efficient means of obtaining standardised data that can be presented in a succinct form. Questionnaire data are easily replicated and allow for comparisons between different populations and have been extensively used in attitude research (Ajzen, 2002; Alreck & Settle, 1995; Bagozzi, 1981; Godin & Kok, 1996; Hanson, 1996; Trafimow et al., 2004). Finally, self-administered questionnaires can provide for anonymity.

Any data collection method has a propensity for error and bias and the use of questionnaires in correlation designs is not an exception. Questionnaire data is generally obtained after an event has occurred and reliance on memory has been shown to be unreliable (Babbie, 1989). Moreover, respondents may not take the exercise seriously and answer in an *ad hoc* manner, or understate or overstate some aspects of the information being sought (Creswell, 1994). Additionally not all research topics are suitable for questionnaire collection methods – an issue that needs to be considered early in the research design stages (McGrath, 1982). Finally, respondents may not interpret a question or series of questions in the same way which can result in inaccuracies (Alreck & Settle, 1995).

In order to minimise the effects associated with these limitations, the following precautions were adopted when developing and administrating the various questionnaires that were used in this research program. In all cases, respondents were requested to indicate their perceptions and feelings regarding the various items in terms
of their current perspective and not required to recall past events, thus minimising memory deterioration effects. Participation in all instances was voluntary and no incentives were offered to increase response rates. Respondents were advised that they were free to leave out any question with which they had difficulties or problems, and were aware that they could withdraw from the project at any stage. As such, those who responded did so because they had an interest in participating and therefore would be less likely to provide inaccurate information.

With one exception, all questionnaires were in English and participants were either working in an English-speaking country or studying at an institution that had an English proficiency requirement so interpretation at that level was not considered problematic. One questionnaire was translated into Italian (White & Scandale, 2005) and a rigorous process was adopted to ensure conformance to the original version.

All of the scales that formed the basis of the questionnaires used in the various papers detailed in Figure 2 had been tested on, refined and administered to populations similar to the samples selected for this research program, so in many respects, random error associated with ambiguous or problematic item wording was minimised. Moreover, reliability statistics had been previously published and as such, areas that may have required re-wording or adjustment were easily identified. As a further precaution, questionnaire drafts were distributed to senior academics for comment and piloted-tested on samples of the actual population being investigated before being distributed. Any changes that were made as a result of this process were reported, if necessary, in the relevant published article, along with descriptive and reliability statistics.
All of the topics that were investigated throughout the research program fit neatly within the quantitative paradigm, lend themselves to a correlation design and were suitable for questionnaire techniques. The scales that operationalised each of the constructs that were employed in this research program were drawn from highly recognised researchers in the relevant field and had been published in leading academic journals. As such, there existed a large and accessible body of literature on all constructs considered and each theory had been subjected to substantial degrees of scientific scrutiny before being selected. A thorough critical evaluation and justification for scale selection was provided in all articles.

In all, the data used in the various publications that form the research program was collected by six specifically designed questionnaires. These questionnaires can be cited as appendices in each publication. Table 3 provides a breakdown of the articles that were derived from each questionnaire distribution and the number of respondents. In all cases the number of respondent to variable ratio exceeded levels that have been recommended for the data analysis techniques that were used.

**Table 3: Questionnaire distribution, relevant articles and response rate**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questionnaire Number</th>
<th>Articles</th>
<th>Number of usable responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>White (2005b)</td>
<td>562</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>White (2006b)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>White &amp; Scandale (2005)</td>
<td>368</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>White (2005c)</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>White &amp; Yu (2005)</td>
<td>347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>White (2006)</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>White (2007)</td>
<td>493</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.2.2 Sampling procedure

In survey design, where the aim may be to generalise findings from a sample to a larger population, ensuring that all elements from a population are randomly represented in the sample is of utmost importance. As correlation designs aim to examine relationships between constructs, less rigorous sampling procedures are common and with one exception (Schwartz & Bardi, 2001), all of the research articles that have been cited in the various studies conducted for this research program were based on non-representative samples.

Schwartz & Bardi (2001) had received substantial financial support for their project and the model tested in that study had undergone extensive scrutiny and development on non-representative samples before being administered at a national level. At length, the representativeness and generalisability of results are desired qualities however in reality very few studies in the social sciences actually achieve this outcome and the work presented here is no exception. This limitation has been clearly stated in the relevant part of Section 4 below, and acknowledged in all publications.

That said, the sample selection procedures that were used throughout this research program conformed to acceptable practices and have been thoroughly described in each article along with associated limitations. As such, while some sampling bias is inherent within the data sets, the validity of the findings had not been jeopardised and the fact they were considered suitable for publication by journal editors and reviewers supports this claim.
3.2.3 Data analysis

Table 4 displays the statistical techniques that were employed to analyse the data for each publication. Given the exploratory and correlational nature of the research, factor analysis and multiple regression were the most common techniques utilised. Factor analysis was used to identify a smaller set of underlying dimensions from a larger pool of items, and regression was mostly used to determine the strength and direction of the relationship between the dimensions, and or, the dependent variable. In all cases, the research questions influenced the choice of data analysis technique, and this was supported by current literature (Hair, Anderson, Tatham, & Black, 1998) and published work of previous researchers. Moreover, careful consideration was given to the assumptions underlying each technique.

Table 4: Data analysis technique and publication

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Publication</th>
<th>Correlation analysis</th>
<th>ANOVA analysis</th>
<th>Factor analysis</th>
<th>Regression analysis</th>
<th>Cluster analysis</th>
<th>Multiple Discriminate analysis</th>
<th>Structural equation modelling</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White (2005b)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White (2006b)</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White &amp; Scandale (2005)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*White (2005c)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>**White (2004)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White (2006a)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White &amp; Yu (2005)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>**White (2005a)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White (2007)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Descriptive statistics  ** Critical review
Table 5 depicts the relationships between dependent and independent variables in each of the studies. The dependent variables in the empirical studies are evaluations or judgements of internal service quality, satisfaction or intentions. The studies that listed values, image and visitation intentions as dependent variables were conducted during the search for predictors phase (see Figure 2). Both values and image had been posited to influence customer evaluations and judgements of services (Baloglu & Brinberg, 1997; Crotts & Erdmann, 2000) however there were concerns with these constructs that needed to be addressed before being deemed suitable predictor variables.

Table 5: Relationships between the various constructs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Publication</th>
<th>Focus / Dependent variables</th>
<th>Independent variables</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White (2005b)</td>
<td>Cultural values</td>
<td>Work values</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White. (2006b)</td>
<td>Satisfaction</td>
<td>Cultural values; work values</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White &amp; Scandale (2005)</td>
<td>Visitation intentions</td>
<td>Emotions; cognition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White. (2005c)</td>
<td>Image</td>
<td>Cognition; Affect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White (2004)</td>
<td>Image</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White. (2006a)</td>
<td>Loyalty intentions</td>
<td>Service quality; emotions; mood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White. &amp; Yu (2005)</td>
<td>Loyalty intentions</td>
<td>Emotions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White (2005a).</td>
<td>Emotions; values; behaviour</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White (2007)</td>
<td>Service quality; satisfaction; loyalty intentions</td>
<td>Emotions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It should be mentioned that the publication dates do not necessarily conform to the chronological evolution of the research program. The journal review process and times between acceptance and publication varied from one journal to the next.
This section has examined philosophical issues related to social science research and identified the assumptions inherent within the research program. At this level there are no right or wrong perspectives and a number of reasons were provided that justify the researchers choice of a quantitative approach. Three research design options that were suitable for a quantitative approach were discussed and it was argued that a correlational design was the most appropriate given the aim and objectives of the research program and its widespread use within relevant academic disciplines.

The data collection technique was then identified, critically evaluated and the precautions that were taken to minimise error and bias were discussed. This section concluded with an overview of the statistical analysis techniques that were used in the various studies and outlined the various dependent and independent variables for each study. Details relating to sample characteristics and selection procedures and data screening processes are fully explained within the methodology section of each article. The following section provides an in-depth discussion on each of the articles.
4. DISCUSSION

This Section will review each of the articles presented as part of this submission, according to the phases outlined in Figure 2. This approach has been taken as it will allow for a discussion of individual papers as well as indicate how each particular phase is linked, or has influenced the direction of subsequent phases. The discussion in each phase will adopt the following format: background and rationale for pursuing the topic, research aims, major findings, contribution to knowledge and practice, and limitations. Results from some of the studies have been included where appropriate, and the full articles accompany this paper.

4.1 Foundation phase

As mentioned above, the articles in this phase do not form part of the official research program and have been included here because of their pivotal role in influencing the subsequent stages. Service quality had been seen by many academics and practitioners as the driver of profitability, customer loyalty and business sustainability. The intensity and proliferation of research into service quality was partly due to the seminal work of Parasuraman, Zeithaml, & Berry (1988). Their research was the first serious attempt to define service quality, and a rigorous empirical investigation led to the proposition that customers evaluate the quality of a service on five dimensions.

These dimensions formed the basis of what became known as SERVQUAL and while this model has been criticised on conceptual and methodological grounds (Cronin &
Taylor, 1992), few would argue that it became the dominant model and reference point for service quality research. While much attention was being paid to service quality from an external customer perspective, surprisingly little attention had been given to services that were provided by departments or sections inside organisations and the articles in this phase addressed this deficiency.

4.1.1 Research aims

The aim of the research conducted in this phase was to:

1. Determine whether an instrument designed to measure service quality from an external customer perspective was applicable to internal situations.
2. Investigate the relationship between dimensions of internal service quality and different levels of internal customer expectations.

4.1.2 Major findings.

As was detailed in Figure 1, the traditional marketing approach focused on the organisation and the customer, however, because of the unique nature of the service encounter, attention needed to be given to the employees/organisation and employee/customer relationship, reinforcing the adage that a happy employee creates a happy customer. While this makes intuitive sense, when this research was conducted, few published studies (Gremler, Bitner, & Evans, 1994; Reynoso & Moores, 1995) had addressed the question, ‘Do internal customers use the same criteria to evaluate the quality of services provided by other departments as external customers?’ Moreover, none had considered the role of internal customers’ expectations and dimensions of internal service quality.
White and Rudall, (1999) through critical review of the relevant literature, developed a comprehensive model of the dimensions of internal service quality and tested this against SERVQUAL. The results indicated that the predictive ability of SERVQUAL was superior to the alternative model and that internal customers use five distinct dimensions to evaluate internal quality, and these closely resembled the original factor structure as proposed by Parasuraman et al. (1988). Based on these findings, the current author sought to further understanding of the role of expectations in an internal service context (White, 2001), and the findings indicated that different departments had different expectations of an internal service provider, and that desired and minimal levels of expectations were influenced by different dimension of service quality.

4.1.3 Contribution to knowledge and practice

This was the first time that SERVQUAL had been shown to be effective in an internal context, and that internal customers use similar dimensions to evaluate service quality. The results suggest that managers can use the same instrument to monitor external and internal service quality, and that training for internal service providers need consider not only technical competencies but interpersonal communication and internal customer relations skills as well. Results pertaining to the second article in this phase (White, 2001) indicated for the first time that expectations of internal customers were more complex than previously thought and that managers should consider segmenting the work force based on expectations, as different position levels within an organisation had different levels of expectation, and distinct actions are required to ensure that service provision satisfy these needs.
4.1.4 Limitations

Both studies were based on data from one property and as a convenience sampling procedure was used, the representativeness and generalisability of the findings cannot be assured. Moreover, emerging research suggested factors other than cognitive appraisals of service quality were likely to influence consumer behaviour and intentions, and the following phase addressed this shortfall.

4.2 The search for predictors phase

Taking into consideration the limitations associated with the previous studies, this phase of the research program sought to identify a broader range of factors that could provide richer insights into antecedents of customer decision making and behaviour. Three candidate areas emerged: cultural values, image and emotions, and a brief discussion on each of these follows. As a considerable proportion of tourism involves travel, and much of this travel is international – with tourists from different regions and countries travelling in unprecedented numbers (W. T. O., 2007) – the study of cultural orientations was deemed to be of particular relevance to the tourism and hospitality industry.

Since the seminal work of Hofstede (1980), a significant amount of effort has focused on conceptualising cultural values and orientations (Schwartz, 1999; Singelis, Triandis, Bhawuk, & Gelfand, 1995). However, research in the area of cultural values and consumer behaviour in a tourism context had been largely ignored (Crotts & Erdmann, 2000). As such this seemed to be a fruitful avenue to explore.
After an extensive review of the cultural values literature, it became evident that there were some fundamental questions that had not been adequately addressed. First, models of cultural values were not supported in empirical studies (Carter, 1991; Voronov & Singer, 2002). Second, there was considerable doubt about whether values were reliable predictors of attitudes and behaviour (Briley & Wyer, 2001; Schwartz, 1999; Smith, Peterson, & Schwartz, 2002). Third, others have posited that definitional inconsistency in values theory is endemic (Rohan, 2000), and as a result, frameworks of cultural values may overlap with values of a different nature, whether they be work or personal. Clearly more research was needed to clarify these issues, before values as a construct could be considered useful in meeting the aims of this research program.

The second candidate variable was image, a concept that had received considerable attention in the marketing and tourism literature since the early 1990s. Brand image had been defined by Keller (1998, p. 48) as ‘… perceptions about a brand as reflected by the brand associations held in consumer memory’. The associations included perceptions of product attributes and feelings, and these cognitive and affective elements featured prominently in models of destination image in the tourism literature (Ahmed, 1996; Baloglu & Brinberg, 1997; Baloglu & McCleary, 1999; Leisen, 2001). A critical review of this literature revealed that there were inconsistent definitions of image and that no attempt had been made to distinguish the concept of image from perceptions or attitudes. As with cultural values, more work was necessary to clarify basic understandings of image as a construct.
The third candidate variable was emotions, and work that had been evolving in the marketing literature suggested that emotions had been relatively neglected by researchers, and that more work in this area held much promise in addressing the general aims of this research program. Evidence indicated that emotions were stronger predictors of behavioural intentions and satisfaction judgements, than the more traditional cognitive measures (Dube & Menon, 2000; Liljander & Strandvik, 1997; Stauss & Neuhaus, 1997; Yu & Dean, 2001), and while emotions had been studied in a tourism context (Ahmed, 1996; Baloglu & Brinberg, 1997; Baloglu & McCleary, 1999; Leisen, 2001), at the time of conducting this research, it was not known if the same effect applied in a tourism context.

4.2.1 Research aims

1. To determine whether cultural values and work values are different constructs; to investigate the efficacy of values frameworks in predicting satisfaction judgements, and to identify whether the findings conform to theoretical expectations.

2. To determine whether an image is an identifiable construct that can provide insights above and beyond those of perception or attitudes.

3. To establish the relationship between cognitive and affective components in predicting visitation intentions in a cross cultural context.
4.2.2 Major findings

The aim relating to cultural values was addressed in two studies (White, 2005b; White, 2006b). In White (2006b) a literature review identified two values frameworks that essentially should have been measuring different things, and the results of a correlation analysis indicated that they probably were. Of the 16 possible correlations between the dimensions, only four exceeded 0.30 and there were no significant relationships between another five. Table 6 displays the correlations between all of the components.

Table 6: Correlations between the components

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Comfort</th>
<th>Stimulation</th>
<th>Affiliation</th>
<th>Achievement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HI</td>
<td>.363**</td>
<td>.338**</td>
<td>.028</td>
<td>.148**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>-.035</td>
<td>.124*</td>
<td>-.188**</td>
<td>.352**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VC</td>
<td>-.157**</td>
<td>.030</td>
<td>.214**</td>
<td>.284**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>.079</td>
<td>.041</td>
<td>.369**</td>
<td>.106*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

** Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).
* Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

Originally, the cultural values framework was posited as consisting of four dimensions, and Principal Components Analysis supported this conceptualisation. However, the work values framework did not conform to the 15 dimensions as theory dictated, as a four-dimension solution was generated. The ability of both frameworks to predict satisfaction with work was poor, with both explaining less than 12% of the variance in the dependent variable.

White (2005b) examined the cultural values and work value preferences of a sample of mainland Chinese and Western European, hospitality and tourism students. Some differences were observed in work preferences, however, the similarities far outweighed
the differences. In terms of cultural values, statistically significant differences did exist between the European and Chinese respondents, however, these were not consistent with existing theory. The Chinese sample exhibited characteristics that have been associated with Western cultures, such as Vertical Individualism (VC), while the European sample were more closely aligned with Horizontal Collectivism (HC), characteristics that have been associated with Eastern collectivists cultures (Hofstede, 1980, 2001).

![Figure 3: Mean scores of cultural value profiles for both groups.](image)

Taken together, the findings from White (2006b) and White (2005b) did not indicate that cultural values were a reliable and valid predictor of attitudes or behaviour and this coupled with findings that were theoretically inconsistent led the author to abandon further research in the cultural values domain. Many issues that surfaced during the process of working on these papers were elaborated on and published in a later article.
(White, 2005a) which will be discussed in Section 4.5. Thus, the dotted line from values, in the search for predictors phase, to the synthesis phase in Figure 2.

In terms of the second research aim in this phase, White (2004), raised questions about the way image was conceptualised and operationalised in the tourism and marketing literature, by critiquing a number of popular models of destination image (Baloglu & McCleary, 1999; Echtner & Ritchie, 1993). It emerged that the existing literature was unable to deal with basic questions about the relationship between image and other constructs, and whether ‘image’ as a construct can influence consumer evaluation and judgement processes, and the pursuit of answers to these questions led the author to literature related to philosophy and cognitive psychology.

Mental images, had indeed received considerable attention in both these areas. From Aristotle, to the twentieth century, images were viewed as the primary form of human mental representation. Some have ascribed a spiritual function to the mental image process and for Zalta (1997), they represent higher order thought processes. In the 1970s cognitive psychologists began to scientifically examine mental images and two dominant streams of research, that continued into the 1990s, failed to converge or provide conclusive evidence that image as a function can provide any richer information than a perception.

The literature review identified a lesser known perspective that is known as traditional psychology (c.f. Birch, 2002). According to this theory, mental images are conscious
entities that can be categorised into different types that differ subjectively according to the degree of conscious control one has over the image, and the degree of image vividness. Some aspects of this theory were drawn upon to interpret the findings from the second image article (White, 2005c), discussed next.

Before abandoning image as a unique and valuable contributor to the aims of the research program, White (2005c), sought to establish by using structured interviews, whether, and if so, in what way, image differs from perception. Participants were asked their image and perception of a specific destination and the tabulated responses can be found in Table 7.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nature of response</th>
<th>Perception</th>
<th>Image</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>+ cognitive specific</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- cognitive specific</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>generic</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>affective</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>animated</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>colour</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hesitation</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is evident that some differences did exist; responses to the image question were more animated, took longer to articulate (hesitation) and contained more general descriptions (generic) of the destination. Colour was also mentioned in relation to image and not perceptions, and image responses contained less negative comments. In short, while these differences were interesting and worthy of further study, image was still found to be a cognitive construct and as such would not meaningfully contribute to the aim of this
research program. After careful consideration of the insights and findings that were generated from White (2004; 2005c), the author decided to not devote more time and effort to research involving the mental images.

The third research aim in this phase was concerned with the relationship between cognition and affect, and intentions to visit a destination (White & Scandale, 2005). The sample consisted of American and Italian respondents and the results indicated that for both nationalities positive and negative emotions were, by far, better predictors of visitation intentions than cognitive perceptions of destination attributes. These nationalities were chosen because one of the authors had contacts in both those countries who were willing to participate. Given the superior predictive ability of emotions, coupled with the fact that the emotion framework used in the study conformed to theoretical expectations, it was strongly indicated that emotions were worthy of further research effort.

4. 2.3 Contribution to knowledge and practice

Two values frameworks were tested simultaneously and this was the first time such a study had taken place. From these findings, it appeared that cultural values and work values, as operationalised in White (2006b), were distinct constructs that measure different things. Unlike many studies that have focused on the relationship between culture and work, this study (White, 2006b) did not use a person’s country of origin to represent their cultural orientation, as the country of origin approach assumes that all people within that country share common cultural values. Such an assumption is clearly
problematic in multicultural countries such as Australia. Participants’ cultural orientations were identified independent of nationality and then used as variables in the analysis. Moreover, further evidence of the construct validity of the cultural values model was provided, which may benefit other researchers in the cross-cultural values domain.

Contributions to emerge out of White (2005b) included the identification of differences in work preferences between the Chinese and Western European samples and numerous recommendations were provided on how practitioners can use the results to enhance human resource management practices. Additionally, it was established that common perceptions of cultural value orientations may not be as universal as previously thought, as a predominantly Chinese sample exhibited value characteristics that more closely resembled those attributed to developed capitalist countries.

White (2004; 2005c) provided the first serious critique of destination image as a concept to appear in the tourism and marketing literature. Elaborate models had been previously proposed and tested but fundamental questions had not been addressed. For the first time, destination image was found to have no affective associations and researchers and practitioners were advised to abandon image, and focus on better known constructs including perceptions or attitudes until more research into this area has been conducted. To that end, the efforts devoted to this particular focus were not lost, as a number of potential avenues for future research on destination image, including the image type and the role of colour vividness in an image, were proposed.
In respect to the third research aim of this phase, this was the first time such a study had been undertaken in the tourism literature, and it supported the view that emotions were consistently stable predictors across different contexts and cultures, and explained considerably more variance than cognitive factors. A model that portrayed the relationship between attributes of a destination, emotional reactions and disposition towards a destination, was proposed along with recommendations for practice and further research.

4.2.4 Limitations

As with much published research, the use of convenience sampling here is not ideal. However, the costs associated with obtaining near representative samples are extremely high. Moreover, the findings related to differences in nationality, reported in White & Scandale (2005), need to be interpreted cautiously as the selection criteria required that respondents only lived in America or Italy. It did not take into consideration that some of the Americans may have been of recent European or Asia descent.

The use of single item dependent variables (White, 2005b; White & Scandale, 2005) to measure intentions and attitudes also limited the scope of these studies and a more focused study on how emotions influence a broader range of consumer behavioural intentions would be beneficial to practitioners and academics alike. Finally, White & Scandale (2005) recommended that mood, another affective component, may influence the relationship between emotions and cognition and that future studies follow up on this.
4.3 Construct development and refinement phase

Emotions, particularly in service consumption contexts have for some time now been the focus of academic interest (Alford & Sherrell, 1996; Bagozzi, Gopinath, & Nyer, 1999; Dube & Menon, 2000; Foxall & Greenley, 1999; Izard, 1977; White, 2005a) and as demonstrated above (4.24), have been found to be significant predictors of visitation intentions as well as firm loyalty (Yu & Dean, 2001), customer satisfaction (Mano & Oliver, 1993) and behavioural intentions (Morris, Chongmoo, Geason, & Jooyoung, 2002).

Emotions in marketing are usually obtained by self report, and a variety of multivariate techniques have been employed to analyse the data (Bagozzi et al., 1999). With few exceptions (Ny er, 1997; Ruth, Brunel, & Otnes, 2002), researchers operate at the general factor level, as opposed to focusing on individual emotions, as the latter has been shown to lack discriminate validity (Bagozzi, 1993), due to the sheer number of emotions that have been identified in consumer research. Laros & Steenkamp (2005) reported over 300 emotion words that had been used in 10 studies and attempts to determine a basic set of universal emotions has been frustrated as emotion theorists cannot agree on what constitutes the basic set (Ortony & Turner, 1990).

Even at the broad factor level consensus cannot be reached as to how many is enough, with Richins (1997) reporting 16 dimensions that included anger, shame and joy, while others found two, pleasure and arousal (Russell, Weiss, & Mendelsohn, 1989). That said, studies that have included both positive and negative emotions have mostly found that items load on two positive and negative affective dimensions.
Yu & Dean (2001) examined emotions in a service context and raised the possibility of a third dimension as the emotion anger, loaded on both positive and negative factors. Emotions were found to be significantly associated with a range of consumer behavioural intentions, but were not associated with complaining behaviour. The challenge in this phase was therefore to re-examine the dimensionality issue and to find an emotion set that could explain a full range of behavioural intentions.

Another area that had been neglected in the tourism and services marketing literature, and following recommendations made by White & Scandale (2005), was the role of ‘mood’. Mood has been seen to be a largely affective state that differs from emotion, in that it is less intense, longer lasting and occurs in the absence of a referent object. At that time, much was unknown about the relationship between and mood, emotions, cognition and loyalty intentions and the following research aims guided the efforts of this phase.

4.3.1 Research aims

1. To examine the dimensionality of consumption emotions, and establish the emotion/consumer complaining intentions link.

2. To determine the role of mood in influencing loyalty intentions.

4.3.2 Major findings

Instead of relying on a single item to capture behavioural intentions, a limitation of the research in phase two (4.2.4), White & Yu (2005) employed a scale based on five dimensions (Zeithaml, Parasuraman and Berry, 1994), including complaining behaviour,
and this scale was selected because it had been used widely in the marketing literature, and had been used with a similar population as the current study. A critical review of the marketing, services marketing and to a lesser extent, psychology literature, led to the identification of two emotions, regret and disappointment, that in a somewhat indirect way may have been able to account for complaining behaviour. These emotions were added to an existing emotion framework, and a Principal Components analysis generated a three component model of emotions, that included positive, negative and one the authors labelled ‘bi-directional’ emotions, results of which can be cited in Table 8. The bi-directional component consisted of the emotions ‘angry’ and ‘disappointed’ and correlated with all the intention dimensions, including ‘complaining’. All of the results pertaining to this article can be found in the full article which is attached below.

Table 8: Emotion components and loadings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Component</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. Positive Emotions</strong></td>
<td>1  2  3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hopeful</td>
<td>.882</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Happy</td>
<td>.847</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positively Surprised</td>
<td>.749</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2. Negative Emotions</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guilty</td>
<td>.836</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humiliated</td>
<td>.752</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Depressed</td>
<td>.701</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regretful</td>
<td>.561</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3. Bi- Directional</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Angry</td>
<td>.838</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disappointed</td>
<td>.797</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Extraction Method: principal Component Analysis.
Rotation Method: Varimax with Kaiser Normalization
White (2006a) adopted one scale from the behavioural intentions battery used above, that related to loyalty intentions in order to address the second research aim of this phase. The emotion framework developed by White & Yu (2005) was used here and single items were employed to capture perceptions of service quality and mood. The findings indicated that mood correlated with all variables supporting the view that it encompasses affective, cognitive and conative components.

Moreover, as indicated in Table 9, mood states (good and bad) were found to influence the way individuals form judgements, in that service quality perceptions were found to be the strongest predictor of intentions for those in a bad mood, whereas, positive emotions were the best predictors for those in good moods. Additionally, mood was found to contribute a significant 5% to explaining the variance in loyalty intentions, above that of emotions and service quality.

**Table 9: Predictors of loyalty intention for mood states.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Beta</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bad mood</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>[Constant]</td>
<td>2.911</td>
<td>.004</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Service quality</td>
<td>.507</td>
<td>6.896</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Positive emotions</td>
<td>.185</td>
<td>2.464</td>
<td>.015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Negative emotions</td>
<td>-.193</td>
<td>-2.357</td>
<td>.020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Good mood</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>[Constant]</td>
<td>2.676</td>
<td>.009</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Service quality</td>
<td>.271</td>
<td>3.037</td>
<td>.003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Positive emotions</td>
<td>.379</td>
<td>4.141</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Negative emotions</td>
<td>-.294</td>
<td>-3.318</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Dependent Variable: Loyalty intentions
4.3.3 Contribution to knowledge and practice

Substantial contributions were made during this phase. First, a nine item, three dimensional emotion model was developed, which accounted for consumer complaining behaviour, an association that had not previously been established (White & Yu, 2005). Second, for the first time the relationship between mood states, self-report emotions and loyalty intentions in a customer service context was examined simultaneously (White, 2006a). Third, findings were reported that mood states influence emotion and cognitive processes when forming loyalty intentions. That is, for individuals in bad moods, perceptions of service quality were stronger predictors of loyalty intentions than emotions. For individuals in a good mood, emotions were the better predictor.

From these findings, researchers have another viable and theory based option to choose from when affect or emotions are of interest. In the service marketing and management literature mood played a lesser role than affect or emotions, when considering behavioural intentions. However, findings from this research indicated that the role of mood state had been underestimated in the past. Hopefully, this work will stimulate other research in this area. Managers can also benefit from this work as the emotion model provides an efficient and comprehensive means of assessing the affective climate within their customer base, and the addition of a single item to capture customer’s mood can now allow for more accurate interpretation of the results.
4.3.4 Limitations

The exploratory nature of the data analysis related to the emotions model leaves some doubt as to whether it would stand up to a more rigorous test of construct validity, and a confirmatory factor analysis on the model would solve this issue. Two of the subscales within the behavioural intentions instrument (White & Yu, 2005) demonstrated weak reliability and were included in the analysis based on theoretical and practical grounds. Future researchers should consider using a broader range of dimensions to capture service quality perceptions, instead of a single item (White, 2006a) as this would allow for more precise practical and theoretical understandings.

4.4 Consolidation phase

In response to the view that theory related to tourist behaviour was descriptive and lacking empirical support, White (2005a) provided an extensive critical review of literature related to human and consumer behaviour, emotions and values and identified suitable models to operationalise these constructs in a tourism context.

The second paper in this phase (White, 2007) focused on all the key variables studied over the course of this research program, namely, emotions, service quality, satisfaction and loyalty intentions. Considerable work has been devoted to understanding the relationship between service quality, satisfaction and intentions and the dominant view posits that satisfaction mediates the relationship between service quality and intentions (Caruana, 1999; Spreng et al., 2005). In essence, what is posited here is that cognitive perceptions of quality evoke a largely affective construct, satisfaction (Spreng et al., 2005; Yu & Dean, 2001), which in turn influences behavioural intentions.
This view, while not conforming to the tri component conceptualisation, depicts a linear relationship between the components. In an earlier paper (White, 2006a), evidence indicated that both service quality and intentions may have an affective component and therefore could be influenced by affect, and this possibility was examined using structural equation modelling, at two different times during a service encounter.

4.4.1 Research aims

1. To critically review literature-related behavioural intentions, emotions and cultural values in a tourism and hospitality context and identify appropriate models to operationalise these.

2. To empirically test the three dimension emotions model developed by White & Yu (2005), and examine the influence of emotions on the service quality–satisfaction–word of mouth intentions process over time.

4.4.2 Major findings

The critical review was based on 100 research articles, 41 of which came from the psychology literature (White, 2005a). Theories and concepts that had not been adequately addressed or tested in the tourism realm were exposed and evaluated and the major findings can be summarised as follows: the three component model of attitudes held considerably more promise as a research tool in a tourism and hospitality context, on conceptual and empirical grounds, than a well known and tested alternative, the Theory of Planned Behaviour (Ajzen, 2002).
The three dimension model of emotions was posited as the best alternative when the research focus is on purchase consumption, as opposed to emotional reactions to nature or scenery, and a model of behavioural intentions was identified as being the most comprehensive and applicable to a tourism and hospitality context (Parasuraman et al., 1994; White, 2005a). Perhaps the most important finding was related to cultural value theory as two of the most dominant perspectives, that of Hofstede (2001) and Schwartz (1999), were posited as being unsuitable for measuring cultural values. Items making up Hofstede’s *Value Survey Module* were closely related to earlier work on individual and work values. Moreover both Hofstede and Schwartz, while recognising that culture is a collective phenomenon that includes beliefs, attitudes, values, norms and roles that are learnt and shared by people who live in the same social environment, have neglected to consider that the identification of cultural values must happen in relation to others. Both access cultural values from an individual perspective. Another alternative, that was presented in this paper was argued to be more appropriate on theoretical, conceptual and operational grounds and a full discussion regarding this claim can be found in White (2005a, pp 22-25).

In relation to the second research aim of this phase, a confirmatory factor analysis was employed to test the construct validity of the three dimension emotion model. This model was tested alongside the more common two dimension, positive/negative affect alternative and the results indicated that a three dimensional conceptualisation provided a better fit to the data. This model was then re-specified in order to improve overall
model fit and then cross validated using data from an independent sample. The results indicated that a 7-item, positive, negative and bi-directional emotion model, was indeed a valid and reliable alternative to other emotion models and the final model can be cited in Figure 4.

![Figure 4: Re-specified emotion model](image)

After identifying a suitable emotion model, the role of emotions on the service quality–satisfaction–word of mouth intentions process was examined. Positive and bi-directional emotions were found to be associated with both service quality and satisfaction but not word of mouth intentions, and negative emotions did not influence any stage of the process. In time two however all emotions were considerably more active, with positive emotions significantly influencing service quality, satisfaction and word of mouth. Bi-directional emotions significantly influenced both service quality and satisfaction, and negative emotions were positively related to satisfaction. All of the constructs explained 54% and 76% of the variance in word of mouth, at time one and two respectively.
4.4.3 Contribution to knowledge and practice

For the first time, a concise and critical literature review related to cultural values, emotions and behavioural intentions was published in the tourism domain. Concepts and theories from psychology, that had not received much attention in the tourism and hospitality literature, informed the discussion and numerous theoretical models were identified to assist researchers. Moreover, the controversial nature of some arguments will hopefully provoke and stimulate discussion among tourism researchers and scholars. Apart from the research implications, practitioners could also benefit by incorporating the emotion model into their current customer evaluation strategies. Many of the evaluation tools used in industry capture cognitive aspects of a service or product, and the knowledge that feelings play a more important role, could greatly enhance performance and profitability.

Again, for the first time White (2007) examined a combination of variables that had not been reported in marketing or tourism literature. The realisation that different dimensions of emotions simultaneously influence perceptions of service quality, satisfaction and word of mouth intentions, in different ways at different times, challenges a number of commonly held beliefs, and portrays a complexity than has not previously been recognised. The key message in these findings was that the bi-directional component, that comprises the emotions ‘angry’ and ‘disappointed’, should be a primary focus for researchers and practitioners. In time one, this component
significantly influenced perceptions of service quality, and in time two it additionally influenced satisfaction.

It should be mentioned that in time two, service quality, satisfaction and word of mouth intention mean scores declined significantly from time one and the bi-directional component appears to have played a role in this. Managers need to proactively monitor the emotional climate within their customer base, identify segments that have high bi-directional scores and remove or reduce the causes of anger and disappointment. In the past, researchers have been content to provide static snapshots of the relationship between affect, cognition and a dependent variable, however, they must now focus on understanding the dynamic interactions between emotion components, and how they work together to influence service quality, satisfaction and consumer loyalty.

4.4.4 Limitations

There are few limitations associated with this stage and this is mainly due to the fact that comments by reviewers were addressed prior to publication. There were more general limitations applicable to these publications and these are addressed below in Section 5.2 as future research recommendations.
5. CONCLUSION

The purpose of this integrating paper was to summarise the process and completion of a research program that began in 2003, and for the purposes of this submission concluded in 2007. Section 1 provided an overview of the research context, stated the overall aim of the research program and presented a framework that located the publications within an evolutionary process, and also identified where and how each publication contributed to the program. Section 2 described the theoretical perspective that bound and directed the development of the work. Section 3 identified and critiqued the approach and methods that were used in the various publications. Section 4 was concerned with elaborating on each of the research phases outlined in Figure 2 and addressed each publication in terms of the background, specific aims, an overview of the major findings, and the way these contributed to knowledge and practice. Additionally, limitations associated with each phase of the research program were discussed.

The research program described in this integrative paper consisted of nine academic articles and over time the program developed in both depth and breadth. In terms of the former, an inspection of the early work indicates that the references were overwhelmingly from the tourism marketing literature (White & Scandale 2005), and as the program progressed and the focused deepened, literature from social psychology began to play a major role in the design and direction of the research. The venture into the social psychology realm offered insights and knowledge that challenged a number of
commonly accepted views, and provided viable alternative perspectives. Additionally, more sophisticated data analysis techniques were used as the research program progressed, allowing the data to be examined in a way that was not previously possible.

In terms of breadth, the research program encompassed cultural values, work values, customer satisfaction, destination image, consumer behaviour, mood and emotions. Much of the data was collected while the present author was living in Switzerland, and included respondents that represented all continents on earth: a truly global audience. Two co-authors contributed to the publications, a Taiwanese and an Italian–American, and this involvement, while minor, added extra breadth and depth to the research program. It should also be recognised that all of the publications presented here were subjected to a blind peer review process (see Appendix 2), that generated copious comments and recommendations, which were subsequently incorporated in to each publication.

5.1 Impact of research

All of articles that formed the basis of this research program were published during or after 2004. As a result it is too early to gauge an impact as measured by citations, as the lead time from starting a research project to publishing the article can be considerable. Table 10 provides citations to date for two articles and it is evident that these were published earlier in the research program.
Table 10: Cited articles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Source: Google Scholar

It is expected that with time, and the fact that recent publications are in heavy traffic databases and well known journals, the citation count will increase. Another method of determining research impact is to use journal rankings. This is not an exact science, as agreed criteria have not been established, and such rankings are susceptible to bias. Table 11 provides an example of how rankings differ across countries and institutions.

The Griffith rankings are based on a 5 tier system, where 1 is the most desirable, and include over 200 service marketing and management, tourism and hospitality and sports management journals. Based on this scheme, two of the journals that have relevance here achieved a Tier 1, two a Tier 2 and 3 a Tier 3 ranking.

The ESSEC ratings are from 0 to 3, 0 being journals that are unanimously acknowledged as being the best in the field, such as the *Annals of Tourism Research, Journal of...*
Marketing and the Harvard Law Review. Level 1 consists of excellent scientific journals of international reputation and circulation, but not among the very top journals in their field. As with 0 rating journals, the review committees of these journals comprise influential, renowned experts in the field. This list consists of over 800 journals from many disciplines and three of the journals achieved a 1 ranking. Additionally, White (2006a) was the 12th most downloaded article for October–December 2006, in the International Journal of Hospitality Management (see Appendix 2).

Table 11: Ranking of journals by publication.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Journal</th>
<th>*Griffith University Ranking (Aus)</th>
<th>**ESSEC Business School (Fr)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Service Industries Journal (White, 2006a)</td>
<td>Tier 1</td>
<td>na</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management (White, 2005c; 2004)</td>
<td>Tier 2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Journal of Hospitality Management (White, 2006b)</td>
<td>Tier 1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Services Marketing (White &amp; Yu, 2005)</td>
<td>Tier 3</td>
<td>na</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current Issues in Tourism (White, 2005a)</td>
<td>Tier 3</td>
<td>na</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Journal of Tourism Research</td>
<td>Tier 2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management</td>
<td>Tier 3</td>
<td>na</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


5.2 Directions for future research and concluding reflections

All of the articles presented here provided recommendations for future research, some of the recommendations from the earlier articles were followed up in subsequent papers and so the research program in some respects generated its own momentum. Others remain in the various literature, and as mentioned above, hopefully can provide a
platform and impetus for researchers. Some of the research directions that were suggested within the articles have been followed up by researchers who were unaware that the present author’s article existed.

The recommendations from each article have either been addressed, still sitting there or superseded by other research. In looking back over the research recommendations made throughout the research program, there are two broad themes and several specific areas that remain potential research objectives. In terms of the former, there is a need to examine all of the findings, with the exception of White (2007), longitudinally and across different industries and populations. Sadly, much contemporary research neglects such focus, and there is wealth of information lying within the articles that is still relevant and worthy of broader scrutiny. Additionally, many of the recommendations made throughout this research program lend themselves to qualitative methods. For example, some sub-scales in an instrument that was used to capture respondents’ behavioural intentions (White & Yu, 2005) consistently exhibited poor reliability, and an inductive approach that revisited consumer intentions via in-depth interview, would benefit scholar and practitioner alike.

More specific research objectives that are still current concern the central theme of the research program: emotions. The complex role of emotions in influencing judgements of service quality, satisfaction and intentions at different times (White, 2007) during a service encounter, is an area that requires much more work. Qualitative work is needed to understand how negative emotions, that have an adverse effect on satisfaction levels, can be softened or redirected into emotions that are positive. Moreover, the role of
individual emotions, as opposed to components or dimensions of emotions, in influencing service related outcomes is also under researched. Finally, while destination image did not become a major focus in this research program, two very interesting research possibilities were advanced (White, 2005c), these being, to explore the relationship between the vividness of a mental image and behaviour, and the role of colour in mental images, in forming a disposition towards a destination.

5.2.1 Personal reflection

When one is immersed for a prolonged period in a subject or place, the effects resonate beyond the initial subject content, to influence deeper levels of awareness, and such is the case here. Personally, much has been gained from the process of conducting this research including understanding concepts and theories to an extent that can be matched by a relatively few people. Additionally, the ability to access, analyse and synthesise information to form questions or problems that can be scientifically investigated, acquiring the knowledge and technical skills to understand how to apply methods and techniques, and preparing documents to a scholarly standard will be invaluable for the future.

At another level, the process has made the author aware of a distinct gap between academic research and practice and the need for academics to become more practical and practitioners to become more academic. Ideas and solutions conceived within an academic environment rarely conform to the demands of practice, while practitioners have little time and interest to consider and integrate new ideas into business practice; two silos that at one stage may have been connected by a bridge, increasingly appear to be joined by a thin plank. As a result of this awareness, the present author, while
working as an academic will strive to facilitate a two-way flow of knowledge between university and enterprise.

Second, there seems to be a trend among academics and researchers to diversify their publications, to the extent that in theoretical terms, there is little connection between them. There are many reasons for this, including government and university research policies, journal editor preferences, and desire to break new ground. This trend has the potential to seriously weaken the creditability of research outcomes. This realisation has motivated the current author to further concentrate research efforts around the aims that drove this research program. Moreover, and connected to a previous point, efforts will focus not only on academic publications, but application of the research outcomes to the benefit of industry or society.

Finally, as an article reviewer for a recent tourism conference, the author was alarmed to see how many of the papers based their content solely on tourism and hospitality sources. One author stated that they had exhausted all the literature on the topic; another remarked that the work was exploratory as there was little information available. Both topics, while perhaps not covered in the tourism domain, had been extensively researched in other areas, and had not been recognised by these authors. One of the more enduring outcomes associated with the construction of this research program has been the realisation of the importance of psychology, sociology and economics to understanding management, marketing and tourism, and the importance of philosophy and mathematics to understanding psychology, sociology and economics. To this end, as
long as the present author remains in academe, efforts and actions will be directed
towards promoting and encouraging a broad based education program.
6. REFERENCES


61


Appendix 1
Bibliographic details of articles included as part of PhD by Publication


INTERSERVQUAL: An Investigation of the Dimensions and Measurement of Internal Service Quality in the Hospitality Industry

Christopher White  
*Victoria University of Technology*

Les Rudall  
*Victoria University of Technology*

---

**Abstract**

This exploratory study addresses issues related to the measurement of internal service quality in the hospitality industry by testing and comparing two instruments in a large entertainment complex. The first instrument, SERVQUAL, was designed to measure external customers' perceptions of service quality and the other, INTSERVQUAL, was developed after reviewing studies that focused specifically on the internal service domain and included dimensions not captured by the former. The results indicated that while the reliability of both scales was high, the superior construct and predictive validity of SERVQUAL suggested that it was more appropriate in conceptualising and measuring internal service quality.

**Keywords:** Internal Service Quality, Statistical Analysis, SERVQUAL, INTSERVQUAL

---

**Introduction**

Larger contemporary hospitality organisations include production, marketing, facilities maintenance, purchasing, finance, information technology, human resource management and other sections. For any organisation to perform effectively, interdependent individuals and groups within the organisation must establish working relationships across internal organisational boundaries. Individuals or groups within organisations depend on one another for information and support facilities so action can be coordinated and complementary (Ivancevich and Matteson 1987). Each individual or section within an organisation is, in effect, servicing other individuals and sections within the organisation. They are *internal providers* of services or *internal customers* receiving services.

Service quality and customer satisfaction has received significant scholarly attention, particularly in the marketing and management literature. In 1981, Berry suggested that service organisations should not only focus on the external customer, but also monitor the exchange of services within the organisation; that is, service provided by an employee in a department or section to an employee in another area of the firm. He added that such service recipients should be regarded as *internal customers* and traditional marketing techniques and methods could be applied to understanding and managing the internal service domain.

There are numerous methods employed to monitor and evaluate the quality of a service (Albecht 1990;
Ballantyne, Christopher and Payne, 1995), but for cost and convenience, the survey method is probably the most popular (Alreck and Settle, 1995). A well-tested survey instrument designed to measure service quality is SERVQUAL (Parasuraman, Zeithaml and Berry 1988) and while there exists much debate regarding the soundness of this instrument on both conceptual and operational grounds, (Brown, Churchill and Peter 1993; Cronin and Taylor 1992, 1994) it has been the dominant model in service quality research during the last decade (Hemmasi, Strong and Taylor 1994; Walker 1996).

Although SERVQUAL was designed to measure external customers’ perception of service quality, this article advocates that with little modification, it could also be applied to measure the quality of an internal service encounter (Parasuraman 1995). The assumption implicit in this claim is that internal customers use the same factors or criteria as external customers when evaluating the quality of a service. Not surprisingly, this assumption has been challenged in a number of studies (Gremler, Binner and Evans 1994; Reynoso and Moores 1995; Vandermerwe and Gilbert 1991) and the findings raise questions as to the appropriateness of applying SERVQUAL to the measurement of internal service quality. This exploratory inquiry seeks to determine whether or not SERVQUAL is the most appropriate model for such purposes, in a hospitality setting.

**Literature Review**

*Meading Service Quality*

In 1985, Parasuraman et al. identified ten key evaluative criteria that customers used to assess the quality of a service and these criteria were reduced to five after further empirical investigation (Parasuraman et al. 1988). Their model consisted of the following dimensions:

- **Tangibles**
- **Reliability**
- **Responsiveness**
- **Assurance**
- **Empathy**

In order to operationalise this model, Parasuraman et al. (1988), developed the SERVQUAL survey instrument that finally comprised twenty-one paired expectations/perceptions items. These purportedly assessed the quality of service by measuring the gaps, or difference scores, between consumer perceptions of actual service performance and consumer expectations of how the performance should be carried out. The SERVQUAL scale has been used in a plethora of service environments (Zeithaml, Parasuraman and Berry, 1990; Heskett, Sasser and Hart 1990; Babakus and Mangold 1992, Gronroos 1990), including banks, insurance companies and auto repair firms.

**Internal Service Domain**

Despite rigorous academic debate and attention to issues related to understanding service quality from an external customer’s perspective, research on the internal service domain is relatively new (Gremler et al. 1994). The importance of internal functions has been recognised and most researchers agree that internal organisational support activities and the quality of internal service operations are key links to external customer satisfaction and an overall service quality strategy (Adamson 1988; Davis 1992; Feldman 1991).

The notions of internal customers and internal services have received considerable attention in the marketing and management literature (Albrecht 1990; Berry and Parasuraman 1991; Gronroos 1984), although in the main, more as a subject of discussion rather than of practical research applications.

The concepts of employees as internal customers and the use of marketing techniques to understand and manage internal service functions have not gone unchallenged. Rafiq and Ahmed (1995) argued there are several problems associated with this notion. Firstly, the products sold or provided to employees may be unwanted or have a negative value, for example, new working arrangements that employees may have been forced to accept. External customers are different in that they do not buy products they do not want, while sometimes, internal customers have to accept services deemed compulsory by senior management. Moreover, external customers usually have a range of products and services to choose from, whereas in internal situations it is likely that only one policy or service provider will be on offer. While recognising that these differences do exist Rafiq and Ahmed (1995 p 128) still do not rule out the possibility of marketing concepts being applied to internal situations but caution that, ‘...great care needs to be taken as to how these concepts are applied’.

Given these concerns, one may ask whether the same instruments used to evaluate external service performance may be used to measure the quality of internal service performance. According to Zeithaml et al. (1990) and Parasuraman (1995) they may be used and moreover, they claim that the SERVQUAL instrument could be used for such purposes. Zeithaml et al. (1990, p.180), in discussing internal service quality, suggested that SERVQUAL can:

‘...with appropriate adaptation, be used by departments and divisions within a company to ascertain the quality of service they provide to employees in other departments and divisions’.
The adaptations required relate to the wording of individual items within the scale as Zeithaml et al. (1990 p.180) again explains:

'[The SERVQUAL can be modified by]... incorporating excellent data processing departments as a frame of reference throughout the expectations section and replacing "XYZ Company" with "XYZ's data processing department" in the perceptions section'.

The assumption implicit in this assertion is that the dimensions that have been posited to underlie an external service encounter apply also to internal service encounters, a claim examined in the present study.

Present Study

Table 1: Dimensions Associated with Internal Service Provision.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tangibles</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Has modern equipment.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Tangibles</td>
<td>Reliability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical facilities are appealing.</td>
<td></td>
<td>The condition and appearance of equipment.</td>
<td>Consistent level of quality.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>On time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reliability</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service is performed on time.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Reliability</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service is performed correctly.</td>
<td></td>
<td>To provide the service on time and correctly.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Right the first time.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Responsiveness</strong></td>
<td>Recovery</td>
<td>Helpfulness</td>
<td>Responsiveness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide prompt service.</td>
<td>Responds quickly to employee request.</td>
<td>Courteous, approachable, willing Promptness</td>
<td>Willingness to serve.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Willing to help.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Never too busy to respond.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Provide service promptly.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Empathy</strong></td>
<td>Spontaneity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gives individual attention.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Spontaneity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understands specific needs.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Pays attention to customer, does not act out of the ordinary.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There when needed.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Assurance</strong></td>
<td>Professionalism</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feel safe in transaction.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Professionalism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are consistently courteous.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Ability to provide service, skills, knowledge.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have knowledge and skills to deal with request.</td>
<td>Professionalism</td>
<td>Consideration Understanding, trust, honesty toward customer.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Confidentiality</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sensitive to handling sensitive matters.</td>
<td>Confidentiality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Adaptability</strong></td>
<td>Flexibility</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provides for special needs, preferences and adapts to customer error.</td>
<td>Flexibility</td>
<td>Respond to unexpected situations.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Communication</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keep internal customers informed of changes etc.</td>
<td>Communication</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Relevance</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The service is useful and easy to use.</td>
<td>Relevance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A review of a number of studies that used a variety of qualitative and quantitative approaches to investigate the dimensions of the internal service encounter challenged the Zeithaml et al. (1990) view. A summary of these findings can be found in Table 1, where the SERVQUAL dimensions are used as categories, to which similar dimensions have been assigned by the specific investigators (Gremler et al. 1994; Reynoso and Moores 1995; Vandermerwe and Gilbert 1991).

An examination of Table 1 suggested that while the five SERVQUAL dimensions featured to some extent in all studies, a general pattern of
dimensionality, with the exception of responsiveness, did not emerge. Of the dimensions that fell outside the SERVQUAL categories, flexibility and adaptability have been considered similar enough to form a single dimension, while relevance and communication were not common to any other category.

In essence, these findings question the appropriateness of conceptualising an internal service encounter using a five dimension construct and question the effectiveness of the SERVQUAL in measuring internal service quality. It is therefore proposed that an alternative model that encapsulates all the dimensions identified in Table 1 be developed and compared with SERVQUAL. Figures 1 and 2 display the conceptual framework of both models. For the purposes of distinguishing between the two, the alternative framework has been labeled INTSERVQUAL.

In order to test the conceptual and measurement properties of both models, the following research questions were devised:

**Question 1a. Is INTSERVQUAL a more appropriate conceptual model of internal service quality than SERVQUAL?**

**Question 1b. Will INTSERVQUAL explain more variance in internal service quality than SERVQUAL?**

**Methodology**

**Data Collection**

The data collection site was a large entertainment and gaming complex, chosen because the organisation was interested in possible outcomes of the proposal and was willing to cooperate. Four departments were identified for participation in the study, with the Maintenance Department selected as the internal service provider as it provided services to all departments within the complex. The service receiving departments were Food and Beverage, Guest Services (housekeeping) and Gaming. Members of these departments were surveyed to determine their perceptions and expectations of the services provided by the Maintenance Department.

---

**Figure 1: Service Quality as Conceptualised by SERVQUAL**

**Figure 2: Service Quality as Conceptualised by INTSERVQUAL**

---

AJHM 16 SPRING 1999
Sample

The study used a sample of employees who worked in the three receiving departments mentioned above and who had experienced the service of the Maintenance Department. The sample characteristics in terms of age and gender can be viewed in Table 2, with a breakdown of responses by department and position given in Table 3. A subsequent meeting with two department heads and a member of the Human Resource department substantiated that the sample of employees was representative of the actual demographic and position profile of the organisation. Moreover, ninety-eight of the respondents worked rotating shifts, that is, 70% of the sample had experienced the Maintenance Department’s service at various times throughout the day. In July 1998, the Human Resource department distributed a total of 180 questionnaires and 140 usable questionnaires were returned.

Instrumentation

The instrument used in this study contained the twenty-one SERVQUAL items, which were altered to suit the internal service environment, in accordance with Zeithaml’s (1990) instructions and six items (taken directly from the studies reported in Table 1) that were used to capture the dimensions not contained in the SERVQUAL. The main scale therefore consisted of twenty-seven items and provided the basis of the SERVQUAL and INTSERVQUAL models. One other item that measured the respondents’ overall perception of service quality was included to facilitate the use of regression analysis. A nine-point scale accompanied each item.

A pilot study resulted in a minor rewording of the instruction sheet and the establishment of the face validity of the instrument. Despite this precaution one question (see question 26, Appendix 1) had to be omitted, owing to misinterpretation as respondents either avoided the question completely or put a line through it.

Table 2: Survey Response by Gender and Age.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AGE</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18-25</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26-39</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40-55</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55+</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3: Survey Response by Department and Role.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DEPARTMENT</th>
<th>Employee</th>
<th>Supervisor</th>
<th>Manager</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gaming</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F&amp;B</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guest Services</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Data Analysis

The Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS) version 8 was used to analyse the data. Preliminary data screening was conducted to ensure that the data met the assumptions required by the statistical analysis methods employed (Kinnear and Gray 1997).

In order to address the research questions, the reliability of each scale was determined by computing the coefficient alpha and a principle components analysis was conducted, to assess the conceptual foundations of both models (Coakes and Steed 1997). A linear regression analysis was used to determine which model explained more variance in overall internal service quality evaluation.

Results

The Cronbach alpha’s for the twenty-one SERVQUAL and twenty-six INTSERVQUAL items of .94 and .95 respectively, indicated that the reliability for both scales was high. These results suggested good internal consistency among the items within each scale and comfortably exceeded the 0.70 cut off point recommended by Nunnally (1978). The slightly higher INTSERVQUAL result may be due to the extra items contained in that scale (Parasuraman et al. 1994).

The pattern matrix that resulted from the principle components analysis can be found in Table 4. Factors with eigenvalues less than 1 were rejected, although a fifth factor that had an eigenvalue of .993 was accepted for the SERVQUAL solution, because of its closeness to 1. Also there was a considerable gap between it and the subsequent factor that had a value of .735 (Tabachnick and Fidell 1989).

The following findings are relevant to the first research question. Of the five SERVQUAL factors obtained, only reliability (REL) items loaded on one factor (F2) and they were joined by RES1 (responsiveness). The first factor which explained 48.6% of the variance consisted of three empathy (EMP) items, one assurance (ASS), one responsiveness (RES) and one tangibles (TAN). The remaining tangibles were spread between factors 3, 4 and 5, and the rest of factor 5 was made up of empathy and assurance items.

Despite the fact that the items in SERVQUAL did not load as expected, the new factors, it could be argued, form relatively similar dimensions. Factor one for example could easily be interpreted as empathy, even though all the items assigned to that dimension by Parasuraman et al. (1985) were not represented there, and others are. For instance, an inspection of the item labels in Appendix I suggest that RES3, Willingness to help and ASS2, Being consistently courteous fit pretty well with EMP2, 3 and 4 which are concerned with caring, understanding and having employees’ interests at heart. Moreover, with considerable confidence (in the SERVQUAL analysis), factor 2 could be labeled reliability, factor 3 tangibles, factor 4, responsiveness and (omitting TAN5) factor 5 assurance. In fact there are only two items, TAN1 and TAN5 that do not nest comfortably within the co-grouped items and because of their low loadings, do not need to be considered in a labeling exercise (Tabachnick and Fidell 1989).

The results of the INTSERVQUAL solution were somewhat less clear, with four items loading on more than one factor. Factor 1 consisted mostly of assurance and empathy items and as with the SERVQUAL, factor 2 contained all the reliability items. Factor 4 contained two tangibles and the low loading flexibility item, FLX2 (recall that FLX1 was removed prior to the data analysis stage) and the relevance (RELV) and a responsive item (RES2), loaded on factor 5. Factor 3 of the INTSERVQUAL contained an interesting melange of items and included the three communication items.

It appears that on the basis of this study, the five SERVQUAL dimensions as displayed in Figure 1, do apply to internal service situations. This finding in a sense supports the construct validity of SERVQUAL in that it does relate to findings in other studies (cf. Parasuraman et al., 1988), and is consistent with theoretically derived hypotheses concerning the concepts being measured (Carmines & Zeller, 1979). Taken together, these findings suggest that INTSERVQUAL is not a more appropriate conceptual model of internal service quality.

In terms of the second research question, which aimed to determine which model explained more variance of overall internal service quality, two separate regression analyses were performed, with the overall service quality ratings being regressed on the total item scores for both scales. The linear combination of SERVQUAL and INTSERVQUAL were significantly related to the overall service quality score, F(21,23) = 3.817, p = .000 and F(26,36) = 2.862, p = .02 respectively, and the adjusted R-squared values were generally high, attesting to the predictive validity of both scales (Parasuraman et al., 1994). The higher R-squared value for SERVQUAL of .480 as compared with .439 for INTSERVQUAL suggested that the former had superior predictive validity and explained more of the variance in overall service quality.

Discussion

While there has been a considerable amount of attention focused on SERVQUAL in relation to external service provision, this exploratory study reports the first attempt to evaluate its effectiveness in conceptualising and measuring internal service quality. It should be mentioned that, while all precautions were taken to ensure the integrity of the research design, the fact that only one data collection site was used limits the extent to which the findings can be
Table 4: Factor loadings for principle components extraction and oblim in rotation for a five factor SERVQUAL and a five factor INTESRVQUAL solution. Factor loadings less than .4 have been omitted. Eigenvalues, factor variance and adjusted R-squared values for both scales are included.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pattern Matrix</th>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Pattern Matrix</th>
<th>Factor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMP4</td>
<td>0.95</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMP3</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMP2</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RES3</td>
<td>0.57</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASS2</td>
<td>0.50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAN1</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REL4</td>
<td>0.90</td>
<td>EMP3</td>
<td>0.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REL1</td>
<td>0.79</td>
<td>TAN1</td>
<td>0.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REL3</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td>RES3</td>
<td>0.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REL5</td>
<td>0.74</td>
<td>REL4</td>
<td>0.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REL2</td>
<td>0.69</td>
<td>REL1</td>
<td>0.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RES1</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>REL2</td>
<td>0.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAN2</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>REL5</td>
<td>0.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAN3</td>
<td>0.63</td>
<td>REL3</td>
<td>0.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAN4</td>
<td>0.64</td>
<td>RES1</td>
<td>0.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RES2</td>
<td>0.57</td>
<td>COM2</td>
<td>0.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASS4</td>
<td>0.85</td>
<td>COM3</td>
<td>0.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASS1</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>EMP4</td>
<td>0.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASS3</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>COM1</td>
<td>0.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMP1</td>
<td>0.71</td>
<td>TAN4</td>
<td>0.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAN5</td>
<td>0.40</td>
<td>TAN5</td>
<td>0.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>TAN2</td>
<td>0.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>TAN3</td>
<td>0.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>FLX2</td>
<td>0.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>RELV</td>
<td>0.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>RES2</td>
<td>0.48</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Eigenvalues  
10.22 2.43 1.19 1.06 .993  12.03 2.54 1.59 1.31 1.07

% of variance explained by each factor  
48.6 11.6 5.7 5.0 4.6  46.2 9.8 6.1 5.0 4.1

Total variance  
75.6% 71.4%

Adjusted RSQ  
.48 .44
generalised. Nevertheless, the results are interesting and should appeal to practitioners and theorists alike.

The findings suggested that while the reliability of both scales was high and the total scale variance similar, the construct validity and superior predictive ability of SERVQUAL confirmed the superiority of that model. Hence managers may, on the basis of these findings, apply SERVQUAL to monitor internal service quality provision.

Moreover, it appears that internal customers use five distinct dimensions that capture the areas of empathy, reliability, tangibles, responsiveness and assurance when evaluating internal service quality. Therefore, managers who are concerned with monitoring and improving the quality of internal services need to consider areas other than internal work processes, task knowledge and narrow skills-focused training activities. Developing employees' competence in areas such as customer relations and interpersonal communication may be as important to successful internal service exchanges as they are to external exchanges, given the first factor consisted of items related to the areas of empathy and assurance.

The fact that the dimensions that emerged in this study closely resembled the original factor structure as proposed by Parasuraman (1988) was interesting, given the mixed results reported in the external domain. It is perhaps a little premature to hypothesise why this is so and there are number of areas that future research could address to assist in this endeavor. For example, because this study focused on one organisation at a particular point in time, the application of SERVQUAL in internal situations needs to be more widely tested, both within organisations (longitudinal studies), and across different industry sectors. This kind of work is necessary to confirm the factor structure found in this study and to determine how internal customer perceptions are affected by variables such as seasonal variations in demand or changing internal or external economic conditions. The investigation also suggests that the relationship between the dimensions of internal service quality and the quality of service experienced by external customers could be a valuable focus of further inquiry.

References


Albrecht, K. 1990, Service Within: Solving the Middle Management Leadership Crisis, Homewood, Ill: Business One Irvin.


Christopher White spent fifteen years managing hotels in Australia, England and Switzerland and is now a service management consultant. Mr White has recently completed a Masters degree at the Victoria University of Technology.
Email: christo@smartchat.net.au

Les Rudall is a senior lecturer in Management at Victoria University of Technology.
Email: Leslie.Rudall@vu.edu.au
### Appendix 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SERVQUAL</th>
<th>INTSERVQUAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>ASSURANCE</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. ASS1</td>
<td>Have knowledge to answer questions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. ASS2</td>
<td>Being consistently courteous</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. ASS3</td>
<td>Instill trust and confidence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. ASS4</td>
<td>Make employees feel safe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>EMPATHY</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. EMP1</td>
<td>Receiving individual attention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. EMP2</td>
<td>Dealing with employees caringly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. EMP3</td>
<td>Understanding employees' needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. EMP4</td>
<td>Having employees interest at heart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>RELIABILITY</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. REL1</td>
<td>Providing service as promised</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. REL2</td>
<td>Dependably handling problems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. REL3</td>
<td>Performing services right, first time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. REL4</td>
<td>Providing service at promised time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. REL5</td>
<td>Informing when service will be performed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>RESPONSIVENESS</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. RES1</td>
<td>Providing prompt service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. RES2</td>
<td>A readiness to respond</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. RES3</td>
<td>Willingness to help</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TANGIBLES</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. TAN1</td>
<td>Have modern equipment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. TAN2</td>
<td>Having convenient operating hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. TAN3</td>
<td>Visually appealing facilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. TAN4</td>
<td>Have a neat professional appearance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. TAN5</td>
<td>Have clear, easy to read written materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>COMMUNICATION</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. COM1</td>
<td>Communicate plans and changes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. COM2</td>
<td>Provide feedback</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. COM3</td>
<td>Consulting on decisions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>FLEXIBILITY</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. FLX2</td>
<td>Responding to unexpected situations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26. FLX1</td>
<td>Willingness to bend the rules</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>RELEVANCE</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27. RELV1</td>
<td>Provide useful, relevant service</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Role of Expectations in Assessing Internal Service Quality

by Christopher White
Glio Hotel School
Bulle, Switzerland

Abstract
The usefulness of capturing an expectations score when assessing service quality has been the subject of considerable debate over the last decade. Numerous studies discussed in this paper support the view that, on psychometric grounds, a perception-minus-measure is superior to a perception minus expectation score, or a disconfirmation of expectations measure. Other studies, including this one, argue that the inclusion of an expectation component enhances a scale’s diagnostic capability by providing a standard against which perceptions can be compared, allowing practitioners to accurately pinpoint service shortfalls.

The aim of this study was to understand more about the nature of internal customers’ expectations of internal service providers. A questionnaire that included minimum and desired expectation scales was administered to employees in a large entertainment complex. The findings revealed that significant differences in expectations existed between different position levels within the organization, that expectations were influenced by the frequency of consumption regardless of position and that service attributes such as reliability and responsiveness were important in determining internal customers’ desired expectations.

Understanding Service Quality
Early writings on the topic have maintained that service quality resulted from a comparison of what customers felt a service provider should offer (their expectations) and the actual service provided (their perceptions) (Gronroos, 1984; Lewis & Booms, 1983). The notion that service quality was a function of the performance-expectations (P-E) gap was supported in a study conducted by Parasuraman et al. (1985), who then defined service quality as perceived by customers as “the degree and direction of discrepancy between customers’ service perceptions and expectations.”

The authors additionally proposed that perceived service quality existed along a continuum that ranged from ideal quality to totally unacceptable quality with satisfactory quality somewhere in between. Other work in the area proposed that several attributes may influence a customer’s perception of service or be used by the customer to assess service quality. Gronroos (1984) suggested that there were two types of quality: technical quality, what customers actually received from the service provider, and functional quality, the manner in which the customer received the service. Sasser, Olsen and Wyckoff (1978) proposed three attributes or dimensions (materials, facilities and personnel), while LeBlanc and Nguyen (1988) suggested that corporate image, internal organization, physical support, staff-customer interaction and customer satisfaction explained service quality. Consistent themes emerging from these frameworks suggested that customers may use more than the service outcome in assessing service quality, that the process may also be important and that service provision is multifaceted (Johnson et al., 1995).

Measuring Service Quality
Perhaps the most influential work that supported the notion that service processes influenced customer assessment of service quality was conducted by Parasuraman et al. (1985) when focus group interviews pinpointed 10 key evaluative criteria customers use to assess the quality of a service. These criteria were refined after further empirical investigation (Parasuraman...
et al., 1988) and reduced to five, which formed the basis of the SERVQUAL model as follows:

- **Tangibles** – equipment and physical facilities
- **Reliability** – ability to perform the service dependably and accurately
- **Responsiveness** – willingness to help customers and provide prompt service
- **Assurance** – the knowledge and courtesy of employees and their ability to convey trust and confidence
- **Empathy** – caring and individualised attention provided to customers

Based on this work, authors developed the SERVQUAL survey instrument (Parasuraman et al., 1988), which comprised a set of 22 paired expectations/perception items (later reduced to 21; cf. Parasuraman et al., 1994b) that purportedly assessed the quality of service by measuring the gaps, or difference scores, between consumer perceptions of actual performance and consumer expectations of how the performance should be carried out.

**Problems with the Perception Minus Expectation Algorithm**

The use of difference scores originating from the same respondent, as with the SERVQUAL scale, has been shown to be vulnerable to a number of measurement problems such as response bias (Brown et al., 1993) and inadequate reliability and validity (Barbakus & Boller, 1992). A number of studies have indicated serious problems in conceptualizing service quality as a difference score (Cronin & Taylor, 1994; Cronin & Taylor (1992), for example, found that the perception-only score explained more variance in customers’ perception of overall service quality, and similar findings have been reported elsewhere (Carman, 1990; Churchill & Surprenant, 1982; Hemmasi et al., 1994).

Another problem related to the use of an expectations component is that while most researchers agreed that customers made a comparison between the performance of a service and some standard, the standards have been defined in different ways (Bittner, 1990; Zeithaml et al., 1993). For instance, the service quality literature suggested the standard is what customers believed should happen (Spreng & MacKoy, 1996) while the satisfaction literature posited that customers used predictive expectations, or what they believe will happen. A number of other standards have also been tested including experienced-based norms, ideals, values and desires (Bolten & Drew, 1991; Spreng & MacKoy, 1996).

**Revised SERVQUAL**

In response to the above criticisms, Zeithaml et al. (1993) reconceptualized the expectations component of their earlier model. The new model allowed for a range of expectations; that is, a desired level of service (what customers believe "can and should" be provided) and an adequate level of service (the minimum level of service customers were willing to accept). Separating the two levels was a zone of tolerance that represented the range of service performance a customer would consider satisfactory.

Potential determinants of both desired and adequate service levels were included, some of which were posited to influence customers’ predicted service. Thus the model attempted to clarify the distinction between service quality and customer satisfaction assessment by specifying different kinds of expectations within a single framework.

In order to operationalize this model, the authors developed a questionnaire that consisted of three separate nine-point scales next to each item. The first scale measured respondents’ minimum service level expectation, the second measured respondents’ desired level and the third measured respondents’ perception of the actual service performance. A sample of this format can be found in Appendix 1.

In 1994, Parasuraman et al. reported a study that operationalized the revised model; an important issue examined in the study was the soundness of difference-score measures relative to that of perception-only measures. The results indicated that the difference-score mea-
sures performed as well as the direct measures on all psychometric criteria except predictive power, prompting the authors to state (Parasuraman et al., 1994b), "If maximizing predictive power is the principal objective, the perceptions-only scale is the best because it outperforms all other measures on this criterion. However, if identifying critical service shortfalls is the principal objective, the three-column format questionnaire seems the most useful." The authors pointed to the fact that the three-column format also provided separate perceptions ratings for those concerned with maximizing predictive power and suggested that companies wanting to adopt a service quality measurement system choose the three-column format because of its low response error and superior diagnostic capability.

The diagnostic properties of the three-column format is important in that it allows managers to pinpoint exactly where the service shortfalls are and direct resources accordingly. For example, if a service was assessed on a performance-only scale and the reliability and tangible dimensions had a score of seven on a nine-point scale, the manager may decide to allocate resources equally across those dimensions. However, locating the perception score within the customer's range of expectations may indicate that the tangible score actually exceeded the customers' desired expectation level while the reliability score barely met the minimum expectation level. Figure 2 provides an example that illustrates the utility of this method by depicting the views of different segments within an organization.

**Internal Service Environment**

The concept of internal customers in service organizations has been discussed in marketing literature since the early 1980s. Berry (1981) observed: "Marketing's scope has traditionally been restricted to the exchange that takes place between customers and organizations. Yet marketing is just as applicable to the exchange that occurs between employees and organizations. Employees are simply internal customers rather than external customers." Berry then added: "Internal marketing is especially important in labor-intensive service industries because in these industries employee performance is the product the external customer buys."

Since that time, the concept of internal customers and internal services has received considerable attention in marketing and management literature, although more as a subject of discussion than practical implementation (Albrecht, 1990; Berry & Parasuraman, 1991; Gronroos, 1985).

A study conducted by Vandermerwe and Gilbert (1989) reinforced Berry's observations and strongly advocated what was termed a "market-driven" approach to internal services. A survey of 300 executives in America and Canada revealed that approaches to internal services management could be categorized into three areas: the Accounting approach, which emphasized cost minimization; the Organizational approach, which focused on organizational structure; and the Operational approach, which was concerned with measuring efficiency (Vandermerwe & Gilbert, 1989).

The authors suggested that these areas should not be ignored, but viewed from a new perspective that focused on both the users and the usage of internal service. This shift, they asserted, "compels everyone involved in internal services to tune into their buyers. It forces them to ask: Who uses our services, and for what purpose (p. 85)?" Additionally, the authors argued that a market-driven focus, which matched internal services to users' expectations, would result in efficient internal exchanges among the various organizational members and departments. Support for this argument, in fact, had been advanced in a study by Heskett (1987) some years earlier.

He provided case examples of firms that adopted an internal service focus and demonstrated that such initiatives resulted in increased profitability, employee morale and external customer satisfaction.

**The Internal Service Process**

In 1987, Gummesson (in Gronroos, 1990) diagrammatically displayed the relationship between customer service providers inside an organization (Figure 3) and external customers. The model is instructive because it suggested that the quality of service performance, as perceived by the external customer, is directly related to the service performance of internal functions. This reinforces the notion that an organization that is concerned about the
quality of services delivered needs to focus not only on the interaction between the organization and external customers, but also on the interaction between internal providers and internal customers.

While the model suggested that the internal service process is relatively straightforward, Gronroos (1990) was quick to point out that this is not always the case. For instance, the outcome of one function may depend on internal services provided by two or more other functions, and at times some functions may serve each other. Moreover, Stauss (1995) cited two studies that reported strong variations in quality expectations between different position levels in a marketing research and human resource department. If this was common throughout an organization, the development and application of, for example, a generic instrument to measure internal service quality may be more difficult.

That is to say, if supervisors' expectations were significantly higher than employees' then this is likely to affect the overall service quality rating of services received. An average score for all staff in the department may appear adequate but in fact conceal significant dissatisfaction in one or more segments. The implications of this suggest that separate analysis and interpretation at the different levels may be necessary, thus increasing the data collection turnaround time and the ability to identify attributes of a population from a small sample and negating the advantages of using the survey method (Babbie, 1994).

Despite these concerns, the model did locate important stages in the service delivery process and identified potential "gaps," represented by the inter-cell arrows, that needed to be monitored to ensure quality service performance.

A study conducted by White and Rudall (2000) sought to contribute to understanding of the internal service domain, investigated issues related to measuring the quality of service provided by internal "cells" or departments, and focused on such relationships within a large entertainment complex. The study compared two instruments: SERVQUAL (discussed above) and INTSERVQUAL, an instrument developed by the present author after reviewing studies that focused specifically on the internal service domain. The results indicated that while the reliability of both scales was high, the superior construct and predictive validity of SERVQUAL suggested that it was more appropriate in conceptualizing and measuring internal service quality. This present study aims to develop the findings of the former by focusing on internal customer expectations.

**Research Questions**
Adopting the viewpoint that expectations serve as standards or reference points in customer assessments of service quality and that being able to locate a perception score relative to a customer's expectation helps to identify service shortfalls, this research aims to develop an understanding of the expectations of internal customers. The model described in Figure 1 provided the theoretical basis for this study in that two different expectation measures were sought: a desired and an adequate or minimum level. More specifically, this research seeks to determine:

**Research Question 1:** Whether individuals at different position levels within an organization have different expectations of the same service provider.

**Research Question 2:** Which factors are significant in influencing internal customers' expectations.

**Research Question 3:** Which dimensions of service quality are important determinants of internal customers' desired and minimum expectations.

**Methodology**
The data collection site was a large entertainment complex and was chosen because the organization was interested in the outcomes of the proposal and was willing to cooperate. A number of meetings with executive personnel resulted in the identification of four departments that were suitable for study participation. The Maintenance Department was subsequently chosen as the focus of this study because it provided services to all departments within the complex. The service-receiving departments were Food and Beverage, Guest Services (housekeeping) and Gaming; employees in these departments were surveyed to determine their expectations of the services provided by the Maintenance Department.

In all, 180 questionnaires were distributed. This figure was arrived at because departments heads felt that this amount reflected the number of

---

*Praxis* | *Fall 2000/Winter 2001* | *Praxis* | *Fall 2000/Winter 2001*
employees within each department who would be able to respond to the questionnaire, as not all employees came into contact with maintenance staff. In all, 140 usable questionnaires were returned, a response rate of 77%.

Population and Sample
The population in this study were the employees that worked in the three receiving departments mentioned above and who had experienced the service of the Maintenance Department. It was necessary to stratify the population because the research questions required an analysis of the responses from employees in different levels or positions within the organization—all levels needed to be represented in the sample. Additionally, the sample needed to include employees who worked rotating shifts since expectation levels might fluctuate at different times of the day.

A random sample within each segment would have been desirable, to minimize sample bias (Babbie, 1994); however, because the researcher was unable to control distribution of the questionnaires and was not aware which employees had experienced the Maintenance Department’s service, the department heads were informed of these requirements and requested to consider them. The sample characteristics in terms of age and gender can be viewed in Table 1 and a breakdown of responses by department and position can be found in Table 2.

A subsequent meeting with two of the department heads and a member of the Human Resource Department suggested that the employee sample obtained closely resembled the actual demographic and position profile of the organization, attesting to the representativeness of the sample. Moreover, 98 of the respondents worked rotating shifts; that is, 70% of the sample had experienced the Maintenance Department’s service at various times throughout the day.

The low responses from the employee and manager categories in Gaming and Guest Services, respectively, reflected the operations within those departments. For instance, a gaming operator is not allowed to leave the table and as a result will summon a supervisor or manager to deal with a maintenance problem. Guest Services and Food and Beverage, however, have far fewer designated manager positions, and problems are usually dealt with at the employee level. It should be mentioned that results relating to these subgroups have been interpreted cautiously.

Instrumentation
The instrument used in this study was SERVQUAL, a multiple-item scale designed to measure service quality from an external customer’s perspective (Parasuraman et al., 1988). The items contained therein were altered to suit the internal service environment in accordance with Zeithaml et al. (1990). This particular instrument was chosen because it had previously been tested in internal situations and was proven to be a valid and reliable measure of internal service quality (White & Rudall, 1999). The items can be viewed in Appendix 2.

Table 2: Survey Response by Department and Role

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Employee</th>
<th>Supervisor</th>
<th>Manager</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gaming</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F&amp;B</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guest Services</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In completion of the scale, respondents were requested to indicate on three separate nine-point scales their minimum expectation of service performance, their desired level of service performance and their perception of the actual service performance, respectively (see Appendix 1). Demographic information was also collected and included the length of time respondents had been doing their present work, gender, age, tenure and how often they required the assistance of the Maintenance Department.

Finally, a scale that provided a broad description of each dimension contained within SERVQUAL was included. For example, the Reliability dimension was described as “The ability of a Maintenance Department to perform the service accurately and dependably.” Respondents were asked to indicate on a nine-point scale how important each of the dimensions was to them. These scores were summed and averaged to provide an overall importance score, which was used as a dependent variable in regression analysis.

Data Analysis
The Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS) version 9 was used to analyze the data. Preliminary data screening was conducted to ensure that the data met the assumptions required
by the statistical analysis methods employed (Kinnear & Gray, 1997). An ANOVA procedure that derived two different estimates of population variance from the data and provided a statistic from the ratio of the estimates (Coakes & Steed, 1997) was used to address research questions one and two. The statistic (F values) indicated where differences in mean scores existed, and Tukey's HSD post-hoc test was then performed to indicate where the significant differences in mean desired expectations between levels within departments were located (Coakes & Steed, 1997).

To address research question 3, linear regression analysis was used to provide an equation that represented the best prediction of a dependent variable from several independent variables (Coakes & Steed, 1997) and to determine which explained more variance in the dependent variable. In this study, the independent variables were respondents' desired and minimum expectation scores for the five SERVQUAL dimensions, and a mean score for the overall importance respondents placed on each dimension was the dependent variable.

**Limitations of the Study**

This study is based on a quantitative research design, and as such is limited to characteristics of that particular paradigm. A deductive logic prevails where concepts, variables and hypotheses have been chosen before the study and remained fixed throughout; consequently the assumptions and outcomes will be influenced by previous studies (Creswell, 1994). The survey method adopted in this study also has limitations. For instance, a new and important variable that is not captured in the questionnaire may be operating in the realm of a study, and the researcher may not know of its existence and could do nothing about it in any event (Babbie, 1994).

More specifically, the possibility of sampling error could exist because of the absence of a controlled sampling procedure (department heads distributed the questionnaires), although no reason exists to believe any bias occurred. All department heads were genuinely interested in the study and had nothing to gain from manipulating the responses.

**Results**

Reliability refers to the consistency of a measure; different parts of a scale give similar results and similar respondents respond similarly. For Loewenthal (1996), a crucial hallmark of a professional test is the establishment of its reliability. The method used to assess the reliability of the scales in this study was Cronbach's coefficient alpha. This method takes into account the inter-associations among all items on a scale.

The alpha coefficient of the desired and minimum expectations scales were both .95. This comfortably exceeds the .70 suggested by Nunnally (1978) and attests to the cohesiveness of the scales. Reliability therefore is assured.

The primary threat to the scales used in this type of study is construct validity (Cronin & Taylor, 1992). Construct validity can be determined by assessing a scale's convergent and discriminate validity. Table 3 displays the correlation between the various constructs captured by the questionnaire. The scores for the total desired expectations (TDE), total minimum expectations (TME), total importance (TI), total service quality (TSQ) and overall service quality (OSQ) have been computed and shown. It is evident that the scales measuring service quality have converged and are strongly correlated (.66) as are the expectation scales (.65), attesting to convergent validity. Moreover, discriminate validity is assured because of the weak correlation between the expectation and perception measures. Construct validity has therefore been confirmed.

Research question 1 aimed to determine whether significant differences in expectations existed between different position levels within the organization, as had been reported elsewhere (Stauss, 1995). A one-way ANOVA was performed with the mean desired expectation score as the dependent variable and job roles as the independent variable. It can be seen that significant differences do exist between employees and managers: managers' desired expectations are greater than employees' (8.08 versus 7.44; see Table 4).

Further analysis of data relevant to research question 2 revealed that the length of time an individual spent on the job, age, gender and tenure were not statistically significant factors in influencing an individual's desired expectations (Table 5). The frequency of consumption, however, was significant at the .05 level (.034). The latter findings are instructive in that frequent users were found to be relatively evenly distributed across all job categories, suggesting that this finding has

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 3: Correlation Between Constructs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OSQ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TSQ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TDE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TME</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (two-tailed).
little influence on the managers’ desired expectation score discussed above.

In order to address research question 3, multiple regression was employed using as the independent variables the mean desired and minimum expectation scores for each of the five SERVQUAL dimensions. The dependent variable was the average of importance scores respondents placed on a broad description of each of the dimensions. A selected part of the results of these analyses can be found in Tables 6 and 7, and the relative strength of each dimension in predicting overall importance can be determined by analyzing the standardized beta weights (Coakes & Steed, 1995). In terms of desired expectations, the dimensions of reliability (Rel), assurance (As) and responsiveness (Res) are significant and rank as most important, with values of .380, .344 and .281, respectively. More will be said of this in the following section.

The results pertaining to respondents’ minimum expectations can be found in Table 7; again, the significant beta values .365 and .339 indicate that the best predictors here relate to empathy (Emp) and tangible (Tan) dimensions.

**Summary of Findings**

In all, the findings can be summarized as follows: First, differences in desired expectations did exist between different position levels of the organization studied; managers’ expectations were higher. A number of variables were tested to determine which influenced respondents’ desired expectations. These included age, gender, length of time in the job, tenure and how often they consumed the service. Only the latter proved significant; frequent consumption of a service resulted in significantly higher desired expectations.

Finally, it appears that factors such as reliability, assurance and responsiveness, all aspects that relate to the process part of service delivery, are important components of the desired expectation construct. On the other hand, respondents rated tangible and empathy-related factors – more subjective aspects – as important in satisfying their minimum expectations. The following section discusses the implications of these findings.

**Discussion**

From a managerial perspective, the important lesson in these findings is that internal customers in different roles have different expectations. Therefore, in order to effectively measure internal service quality, it is necessary to ensure that all the various segments are represented. Seeking the opinion of only managers or employees may not provide an accurate picture.

While the data captured in this study was unable to explain why managers’ desired expectations were higher than employees’, it did reveal that it was not a result of being in the job longer, being older or being male. Experience, in terms of the former two variables, as an explanation for high manager responses, does not appear to be a determining factor. The only variable that had a significant influence on respondents’ desired expectations was

---

Table 4: Results of ANOVA displaying significant differences in the mean desired expectations of service performance at the .05 level

| Employee | Supervisor
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.44**</td>
<td>Manager*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supervisor</th>
<th>Employee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.87**</td>
<td>Manager</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Manager</th>
<th>Employee*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.08**</td>
<td>Supervisor</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(F(2,1371) = 7.590, P = .001\)

*Indicates significant differences at the .05 level

**Mean score

---

Table 5: Correlation Between Constructs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Construct</th>
<th>Correlation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Time in job</td>
<td>.111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>.178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>.422</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tenure</td>
<td>.180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency of consumption</td>
<td>.034*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (two-tailed).

---

Table 6: Linear Regression Using Desired Expectations Scores of SERVQUAL Dimensions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unstandardized</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
<td>Beta</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>6.490</td>
<td>.828</td>
<td>7.843</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DesRel</td>
<td>-.242</td>
<td>.167</td>
<td>-.380</td>
<td>-2.546</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DesRes</td>
<td>.261</td>
<td>.148</td>
<td>.281</td>
<td>1.762</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DesAs</td>
<td>.372</td>
<td>.155</td>
<td>.344</td>
<td>2.396</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DesEmp</td>
<td>2.701E-02</td>
<td>.143</td>
<td>.026</td>
<td>.189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DesTan</td>
<td>-.129</td>
<td>.135</td>
<td>-.118</td>
<td>-.953</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Dependent variable: overall importance

p = < .05

---

Praxis  Fall 2000/Winter 2001
Table 7: Linear Regression Using Minimum Expectations Score of SERVQUAL Dimensions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>6.695</td>
<td>.462</td>
<td>14.484</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>MinRel</td>
<td>7.812E-02</td>
<td>.119</td>
<td>.110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>MinRes</td>
<td>-2.358E-02</td>
<td>.128</td>
<td>-.034</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>MinAs</td>
<td>4.764E-02</td>
<td>.114</td>
<td>.065</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>MinEmp</td>
<td>.262</td>
<td>.106</td>
<td>.365</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>MinTan</td>
<td>-.258</td>
<td>.103</td>
<td>-.339</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Dependent variable: overall importance

p = < .05

how often respondents consumed the service; the more frequently they consumed it, the higher their expectations. Because length of time in a job had no influence on this, it may be a result of a “recency effect”; that is, the closer (in terms of time) an internal customer has been to experiencing a service encounter, the higher expectations will be.

These findings have confirmed observations made by Stass (1995) that differences in expectations do exist among different levels within an organization, and emphasize the importance from a diagnostic point of view of locating a perception score relative to the expectations of the service receivers in order to accurately pinpoint and rectify service shortfalls.

Another important managerial issue identified in this study was that consideration should be given to how segments within a department are defined. It was clear from these findings that managers could be clustered together on the basis of their desired expectations. However, frequent users from all job categories share similar characteristics; therefore, usage may provide another base for segmentation.

Finally, the findings suggest that if managers want to meet their internal customers’ desired expectations, they should ensure that all members of the department have the knowledge to provide the service and that the processes and procedures within the department facilitate prompt and reliable service delivery. Human resource selection, training, communication and empowerment are important elements, and constant monitoring of internal service quality will assist in identifying problem areas and provide a direction for corrective action. Managers should also consider the determinants of internal customers’ minimum expectations and ensure that their operating hours are convenient, that the dress and equipment used by personnel are modern and presentable and that internal service personnel treat their internal customers in a caring and individualized way.

Implications for Future Research
There are a number of areas that future research could address. Because this study focused on one industry at a particular point in time, the expectations of internal service providers need to be investigated, both within organizations (longitudinal studies) and across different industry sectors. This kind of work is necessary to confirm how expectations are affected by variables such as seasonal variations in demand and changing internal or external economic conditions.

While the length of the questionnaire did not appear to bother respondents in this study, internal customers typically receive services from a number of departments. Evaluating all of them with the questionnaire used in this study may induce fatigue. Future research could examine the soundness of administering different parts or subscales individually. For example, the three columns of minimum expectations, desired expectations and perceptions of actual service could be administered separately to the same populations, thus reducing questionnaire completion time.

Finally, another important area for research focus is investigation of how internal customers form their expectations. Understanding how expectations are developed is important for decision makers because rectifying a service shortfall may involve redesigning the way a service is delivered or managing the expectations of the internal customers. In order to manage expectations, decision makers must understand how internal customers’ expectations are formed.

References
### Appendix 1: Three-Column Format

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>When it comes to providing prompt service...</th>
<th>My minimum service level is:</th>
<th>My desired service level is:</th>
<th>My perception of service level is:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Appendix 2: SERVQUAL

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assurance</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. AS1</td>
<td>Have knowledge to answer questions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. AS2</td>
<td>Being consistently courteous</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. AS3</td>
<td>Instill trust and confidence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. AS4</td>
<td>Make employees feel safe</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Empathy</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5. EMP1</td>
<td>Receiving individual attention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. EMP2</td>
<td>Dealing with employees caringly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. EMP3</td>
<td>Understanding employee needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. EMP4</td>
<td>Having employee interests at heart</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reliability</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9. REL1</td>
<td>Providing service as promised</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. REL2</td>
<td>Dependably handling problems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. REL3</td>
<td>Performing services right, first time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. REL4</td>
<td>Providing service at promised time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. REL5</td>
<td>Informing when service will be performed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Responsiveness</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14. RES1</td>
<td>Providing prompt service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. RES2</td>
<td>Readiness to respond</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. RES3</td>
<td>Willingness to help</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tangibles</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17. TAN1</td>
<td>Have modern equipment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. TAN2</td>
<td>Having convenient operating hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. TAN3</td>
<td>Visually appealing facilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. TAN4</td>
<td>Have a neat, professional appearance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. TAN5</td>
<td>Have clear, easy-to-read written materials</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


Phase 2
The Relationship between Cultural Values and Individual Work Values in the Hospitality Industry

Christopher White*
Hospitality & Tourism, Higher Education, Charles Darwin University, Darwin, Australia

ABSTRACT

This paper examines the relationship between cultural values and individual work values. Two-hundred and seventy-six hospitality management students from mainland China and western Europe were surveyed and grouped according to their value orientations and multiple discriminate analysis was used to identify differences in work value preferences between the groups. The results indicated that a group consisting of mainly Chinese participants valued characteristics that have been associated with developed Western nations, and unlike previous studies, both groups viewed intrinsic as well as extrinsic work values as being important. Copyright © 2005 John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.

Received 9 May 2005; Accepted 15 August 2005

Keywords: cultural values; work values; hospitality management; statistical analysis.

INTRODUCTION

The analysis of human values has attracted the attention of scholars for many years and has led to the development of value typologies (Rokeach, 1973), and understandings of the relationship between values and other constructs such as attitudes and motivation (Schwartz, 1999), emotions and decision-making (Dose, 1997). Values have been portrayed as beliefs that are experienced by an individual as standards that instruct how they should function. It is thought that they have cognitive, affective and behavioural dimensions and develop through the influences of culture, society and personality, so that individuals can meet their needs in a socially accepted manner (Rokeach, 1973).

The reason that values, as opposed to attitudes for example, are of interest to academics is because, unlike attitudes, they do not relate to a particular object or situation, are relatively few in number and are stable overtime (Dose, 1997). Because of these characteristics, and in light of increasing tends towards internationalisation and globalisation, cultural values have become an important medium through which differences in customer and employee behaviour can be understood and managed (Elizur and Koslowsky, 2001; Hofstede, 2001).

Despite the international nature of the hospitality industry, both because of the cultural heterogeneity of the work force and the geographical distribution of some segments of the industry, relatively few studies have examined the work values of those who intend to pursue a career in the hospitality industry (Pizam and Lewis, 1979; Pizam et al., 1980; Chen et al., 2000). Moreover, there is a distinct absence of research that has focused on the relationship between work values and cultural values in a hospitality context. As such, this study aims to rectify this shortfall by reviewing the relevant literature, identifying appropriate methods and participants, and finally presenting the results in a manner the will benefit researchers and practitioners alike.

*Correspondence to: Christopher White, Coordinator Hospitality & Tourism, Higher Education, Charles Darwin University, Darwin, Australia 0909. E-mail. christopher.white@cdu.edu.au
VALUES AND YOUNG PEOPLE

In 1991, a study conducted in Australia (Hartley, 1991) surveyed 132 young adults to determine what values they viewed as important. A factor analysis indicated that the 28 items used in the scale formed five dimensions and these were, jobs and security, interpersonal, family relationships, religion and involvement in society. The results that are relevant to this present study suggested that having an interesting job, a challenging job and developing a career were more important to males than females, whereas 66% of females compared with 57% of males valued planning for a secure future more importantly than males. Monetary reward was not an important value.

Hagstrom and Gamberale (1995), citing a longitudinal study conducted in Sweden from 1990 to 1993, reported that nearly 2400 senior high school students felt that interesting work, friendly work mates and work that was recognised and appreciated, were important characteristics of a future job. A closer examination of these results indicated that those studying the natural sciences were more likely to view intrinsic values, such as interesting work, more importantly than those that were involved in work-related courses, with the latter viewing extrinsic elements such as work conditions as being more important.

Research in the USA, which focused specifically on students that had chosen a hospitality management degree (Pizam and Lewis, 1979), reported that respondents placed a high value on obtaining a good salary, pleasant working conditions and a managerial position. Additionally, they valued good relations with superiors and co-workers and a desire to be of assistance to others.

These authors used an inventory of values that was developed in the 1960s to measure work values, known as the Work Values Inventory (WVI) (Super, 1970), and this particular model was chosen because the reliability and validity of the instrument had been extensively and thoroughly tested. An interesting observation relating to these results was that those studying hospitality management, an area that often involves work-related activities as part of the curriculum, also placed high importance on extrinsic values.

Further support for the view that hospitality management students seek extrinsic outcomes from work was provided by research that focused on hospitality and business administration students. The results indicated that a factor labelled working conditions significantly discriminated between the two groups. That is to say, that the hospitality management students were more likely to value security, economic return and supervisory relations than their counterparts (Pizam et al. 1980).

Using a Chinese version of the WVI (Chen et al., 2000) surveyed 311 tourism and hospitality students in Taiwan, and adopting a more sophisticated statistical analysis technique than the previous study, identified three distinct clusters within their sample. These they labelled achievement seekers, income movers and liberal workers and they accounted for 28.9, 11.9 and 59.2% of the respondents respectively. Common themes that emerged from these findings suggested that respondents valued having a comfortable work environment, ample leisure time and a fair and reasonable supervisor. Results of more recent work undertaken in Hong Kong on restaurant managers converge with these findings (Wong and Chung, 2003).

Taken together, the findings presented above indicate that hospitality management students from the USA and Taiwan are similar to students in Sweden who have chosen a work-related type course or career, in that extrinsic value preferences were deemed more important than intrinsic preferences such as challenging or interesting work. On the basis of these findings, it appears that there may not be a relationship between the work values of hospitality career aspirants and national culture, and if this is so, cultural value frameworks may not be appropriate for examining work related constructs such as job motivation or organisational commitment. Clearly, more work is necessary to enable better understanding of these issues and the following research questions have been devised to guide the subsequent inquiry.

(1) Do hospitality management students from mainland China and western Europe have significantly different cultural value orientations?

Is there a significance difference in work value preferences between hospitality management students with different cultural value orientations?

METHODOLOGY

Sample

The characteristics of the sample which participated in this study can be viewed in Table 1, and all of the respondents were studying hospitality management courses in English, at institutions in the UK and Europe. The Chinese sample included mainland Chinese only and the European sample comprised French, Swiss German, German and Spanish nationals, and these were aggregated because of the small number of respondents within each nationality. In all there were 276 (after data screening) respondents with 49% of them Chinese origin, and 71% of the respondents had spent some time working in the hospitality industry.

Instrumentation

The questionnaire, which was in English, was pilot tested before being sent out and this process led to the refinement of the completion instructions, and minor modifications to both scales in the questionnaire. Academics who were known to the present author and who taught on hospitality programmes at the institutions, distributed the questionnaires over three semesters and returned them, as they were completed, by post.

Participants work values were captured through the WVI, and this was selected because it had been applied to hospitality management students from different cultures on previous occasions and had demonstrated strong reliability and validity (Pizam et al., 1980; Chen et al., 2000). The WVI consists of 45 items capturing 15 dimensions of intrinsic and extrinsic work values (see Appendix 1) and a five-point scale accompanied each item. Respondents were requested to rate the importance of each, 1 being unimportant and 5 very important.

In recent times, studies that have focused on cultural values and work usually include, in one form or another, some reference to the work of Geert Hofstede (Hofstede, 1980, 1991), and there are well documented reasons why his model has attracted such popularity. Despite this appeal, some authors have raised doubts about the robustness of his model (Voronov and Singer, 2002) and these doubts have prompted the present author to review alternative measures.

Other researchers in the area of cross-cultural values have applied the constructs of individualism and collectivism (I-C) when attempting to understand differences in cultural value orientations. These two constructs, which were also identified by Hofstede, have attracted the attention of scholars from a variety of disciplines since the 1800s (Watson and Morris, 2002), although the notion that these two constructs formed bi-polar opposites, as suggested by Hofstede, has been questioned. Research conducted in 1991 found that an individual’s private and collective cognitions were stored in different memory locations thus constituting separate cognitive structures (Trafimow et al., 1991).

Further support for the multidimensionality of the construct was posited by (Triandis, 1995), who proposed that there were horizontal (emphasising equality) and vertical (emphasising hierarchy) aspects to individualism and collectivism and these aspects formed four distinct cultural patterns; horizontal collectivism (HC), vertical collectivism (VC), horizontal individualism (HI) and vertical individualism (VI). A description of each of the patterns (Singelis et al., 1995) can be found in Appendix 2.

Singelis et al. (1995) developed a 32-item scale that operationalised the four pattern
concept. The four subscales exhibited acceptable reliability and construct validity, and more recent work has further supported the psychometric properties of this model (White, 2005). As such, this model was adopted to capture participant’s cultural value orientations for this study. Each item was accompanied by a five-point strongly disagree—strongly agree scale, where 1 was strongly disagree and 5 strongly agree.

Data analysis
The alpha coefficients for the dimensions were V-I 0.79, H-C 0.73, V-C 0.67 and H-I 0.78 and, with the exception of V-C, all exceed 0.70 as recommended by Nunnally (1978). The cohesiveness of the WVI was confirmed with an alpha reading of 0.90. A number of multivariate outliers were identified and the extreme cases were removed. No further outlying cases were generated as a result of this precaution. Skewness and kurtosis statistics indicated that some departure from normality was to some extent evident in all variables, however, two variables had to be statistically transformed so as not to violate the assumption of normality.

Multiple discriminate analysis was used to analyse the data and it was chosen because it identifies variables that have large differences between the group means, and provides weights that indicate the size of the difference, in a way similar to beta weights in multiple regression (Hair et al., 1998). Discriminate analysis has an additional benefit of being able to classify individuals to one group or another with a known probability of error.

Limitations
The convenient nature of the sampling procedure, coupled with the fact that the majority of the respondents were under 30, will weaken the representativeness and generalisability of the findings. Moreover, as the western European sample comprised four different nationalities, the findings should be interpreted cautiously and broadly. Given the limited amount of research available on this topic, however, what is generated here will still be important for guiding future research and providing insights into an area that is worthy of much more academic attention.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION
The results from the step-wise procedure displayed in Table 2 indicate that all of the variables were entered into the analysis and formed one significant discriminate function. The coefficients in the structure matrix signify that V-I (0.632) had, by a substantial margin, the strongest discriminating power between the groups, followed by V-C and H-C. The H-I pattern will not be considered because of the low correlations.

The bar charts in Figure 1 visually displays the differences between both groups on each variable, and in fact portrays the distinct cultural profile of each group in terms of the four cultural patterns. The V-I cultural pattern, which represents a significant proportion of the Chinese sample in this study, traditionally has been associated with countries such as the USA and France (Singelis et al., 1995) and this represents a shift among young Chinese away from the more familiar collectivist orientation that has been reported in other studies (Hofstede, 1991; Singelis et al., 1995).

It is important to recognise that the Chinese respondents in this study came from a background that enabled them to study abroad and as such may not be representative of the broader society. Earlier work relating to values and national culture had identified a strong relationship between affluence and individualism (Triandis et al., 1990; Hofstede, 1991) and perhaps demographic variables such as the income or occupation of significant others, may be better predictors of value orientations than the particular cultural background of an

Copyright © 2005 John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.
individual. A thoughtful insight into the relationship between economic development and changes in value orientation has been provided by Triandis et al. (1990), who stated, ‘Perhaps the drive toward modernization erodes first those values that connect people, and only after a culture becomes modern can these values be emphasized again’ (p. 1015).

The second highest discriminating variable was VC and again this was a stronger characteristic for the Chinese than the European sample, and previous studies have also associated this pattern with mainland Chinese and other Asian cultures (Triandis et al., 1990; Singelis et al., 1995). When considering the third discriminate factor, HC, and given that there were no significant differences between the groups on HI, it appears that the key element separating these groups is the verticality aspect.

The Chinese seem more likely to believe that inequality between individuals within a society is acceptable whereas the tendency of the Europeans towards H-C largely reflects the welfare state model that has characterised much of western Europe over the past 50 years. At length, and in terms of cultural patterns, there were distinct and significant differences between both groups, with the largest of these differences being V-I followed by V-C and H-C, moreover, as indicated in Table 3, the discriminate analysis was able to predict correct group membership for 78.3% of the Chinese and western European respondents.

Rather than use nationality as a basis for comparing work values, it was decided to use the groups identified by the MDA. For example, group one (see Table 3) will from now consist of the 111 Chinese and 37 Europeans, and group two will consist of 105 Europeans and 23 Chinese. This decision was taken because of the recognition that values within a society are unlikely to be homogeneous and that it is probably more appropriate to identify groups of individuals with similar value profiles and use these to further explore relationships. That being said, it should be remembered that group one does include 82.8% of the Chinese sample and group two includes 74.9% of the western European sample.

Table 4 displays the mean importance rankings of the WVS dimensions (see Appendix 1) for both groups and in contrast to the findings presented in the literature review above, the

![Figure 1. Visual representation of cultural value profiles for both groups.](image)

Table 3. Predicted group membership compared with the actual group membership.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nationality</th>
<th>Predicted group membership</th>
<th>China (Group 1)</th>
<th>Western Europe (Group 2)</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Original count</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>134</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Europe</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>142</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>82.8</td>
<td>17.2</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Europe</td>
<td>26.1</td>
<td>73.9</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

78.3% of original grouped cases correctly classified.
intrinsic achievement value was ranked highly by both groups. Moreover, creativity, another intrinsic value was ranked fourth and sixth for groups one and two respectively.

Extrinsic values such as way of life, supervisory relations and economic return also featured prominently in the high rankings, as they have in previous studies, and this mixture of intrinsic and extrinsic preferences possibly indicates a change in the kind of individuals that choose hospitality as a career. Hospitality human resource managers therefore may need to rethink the way they accommodate new employees and indeed, important lessons may be obtained from the human resource (HR) practices in other industries, whom for many years have been attracting, developing and retaining employees that have a high need for achievement.

The most striking observation arising from these findings are the similarities between the two groups in terms of what is perceived as being important. In contrast to other studies that focused on hospitality students, security was not an important value for both groups, and this may be a reflection of the socio-economic status of much of the present sample.

The five work-value dimensions that were identified as significantly discriminating between the groups can be found in Table 5. The aesthetic and intellectual stimulation dimensions will not be considered in the subsequent discussion because of the low correlations. The variable with the highest discriminating power was variety, with group two finding this aspect of work more important than group one, which consists mostly of Chinese. The value ‘way of life’ was also more important to group two, whereas group one were more likely to prefer management type pursuits.

**MANAGERIAL IMPLICATIONS**

These findings raise a number of important issues for managing employees with different value profiles. The notion that individuals can be categorised according to their broader cul-
tural value orientations and then, as here, further categorised according to their work-values preferences, provide potential opportunities across a spectrum of HR practices. For example, the management value preference for the largely Chinese sample may be an artefact of this particular group’s vertical orientation and the acceptance of inequality and polarisation of power. The preference for directing and controlling the work of others therefore may be driven by a need to be at the controlling end of that dimension, whereas the more H-C orientation of group two does not stimulate this need.

When integrating employees from one group into a setting that reflects the characteristics of another group, consideration needs to be given to how prepared both the new employee and existing employees are to accept and adjust to the value orientations of others. In this case, those in group two for example may be more willing to allow subordinates discretion in decision making, or be more likely to challenge the decision of a superior than those with the value preferences of group one. Such behaviours, in an inappropriate setting, could seriously strain working relationships, and therefore training and gradual task and role immersion strategies should be considered seriously.

While the means for the way of life value are high for both groups, it is significantly more important for group two. At first this finding is rather disconcerting, particularly as these individuals have chosen a career in a service industry that relies on vast numbers of semi-skilled and part-time employees, functions continually and is highly susceptible to international political changes and pressures. Such conditions do not usually allow for well structured and organised work patterns, which, as a consequence, can interfere with family, personal and social pursuits, and research findings suggest that unsociable working conditions are one of the main reasons for turnover in the hospitality industry (White, 2001; Woods, 2002).

There are two possible responses to this issue. First, employ individuals who do not hold a way of life value as strongly as those in this study, or at least select those who are less likely to want a job that does not interfere with life outside of work, as those in group one. The second is to think hard about ways the organisation can create more stable and predictable work patterns for their employees, particularly at the supervisory and managerial levels. Flexible work times, job sharing and such techniques may go some way to addressing this issue, however, the established and often deeply institutionalised schedules, patterns and habits of some countries can complicate this initiative immensely.

The value dimension that had the strongest discriminatory power was variety and this was more important for group two. Jobs can be designed to incorporate as much, or as little, variety as necessary, and job rotation, job enlargement and job enrichment are all ways of achieving this outcome. The benefits of building variety into a job will not only satisfy employees with such a need, but will also benefit the organisation by developing a multiskilled workforce. The important thing to consider here is the person-job-fit and people who do not value variety should not be considered for jobs that require considerable amounts change.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

This study has made a substantial contribution to the body of knowledge relating to human values. Two levels of values were considered, cultural and individual, and two research questions were devised to frame the study. The first questioned whether there were differences in cultural value orientations between western European and mainland Chinese hospitality management students, and the findings indicated that statistically significant differences did exist. The second question was concerned with whether work values differed between the two groups and it demonstrated that five variables significantly discriminated between the two groups, the strongest of which was variety.

Additional insights that were generated out of this study indicated that common perceptions of cultural value orientations may not be as universal as previously thought, as a predominately Chinese sample exhibited value characteristics that more closely resembled
those attributed to developed capitalist countries. These findings supported the view that affluence and the value of individualism are closely linked, and that income or occupation may be a more appropriate independent variable than national culture.

Future research could examine the value orientations of members within the same society but from different socio-economic backgrounds. Additionally, longitudinal intergenerational research within developing communities or countries may help understandings of the relationship between wealth accumulation and changes in value orientations. Future research could also consider a broader range of nationalities and demographic types, and a more rigorous sampling procedure would strengthen the representativeness and generalisability of future findings.

APPENDIX 1

Creativity: work that permits one to invent new things, design new products, or develop new ideas.

Management: work that permits one to plan and lay out work for others.

Achievement: work that gives one the feeling of accomplishment in doing a job well.

Surroundings: work that is carried out under pleasant conditions; not too hot or too cold, noisy, dirty, etc.

Supervisory relationships: work that is carried out under a supervisor who is fair and with whom one can get along.

Way of life: work that permits one to live the kind of life he/she chooses and to be the type of person he/she wishes to be.

Security: work that provides one with the certainty of having a job even in hard times.

Associates: work that brings one into contact with fellow workers whom you like.

Aesthetic: work that permits one to make beautiful things and to contribute beauty to the world.

Prestige: work that gives one standing in the eyes of others and evokes respect.

Independence: work that permits one to work in his/her own way, as fast or slow as he/she wishes.

Variety: work that provides an opportunity to do different types of tasks.

Economic return: work that pays well and enables one to have things he/she wants.

Altruism: work that enables one to contribute to the welfare of others.

Intellectual stimulation: work that provides opportunity for independent thinking, and for learning how and why things work.

APPENDIX 2

Horizontal individualism: is a cultural pattern where an autonomous self is postulated, but the individual is more or less equal in status with others. The self is independent and the same as the self of others. The personal characteristic associated with this dimension has also been described as unique.

Horizontal individualism: is a cultural pattern in which the individual sees the self as an aspect of an in-group. That is, the self is merged with the members of the in-group, all of whom are extremely similar to each other. Equality is the essence of this pattern.

Vertical individualism: is a cultural pattern in which an autonomous self is postulated, but individuals see each other as different, and inequality is expected. The self is independent and different from the self of others. Competition is an important aspect of this pattern.

Vertical collectivism: is a cultural pattern in which the individual sees the self as an aspect of an in-group, but the members of the group are different from each other, some having more status than others. The self is interdependent and different from the self of others. Serving and sacrificing for the in-group is an important aspect of this pattern.

REFERENCES


Towards an understanding of the relationship between work values and cultural orientations

Christopher White*

Coordinator, Hospitality & Tourism, Charles Darwin University, Darwin, NT 0909, Australia

Abstract

The role of values in influencing behaviour and attitudes has been well documented; however, the relationship between various values has received little academic attention. This study aimed to investigate the relationship between work values and cultural orientations, and to determine which dimension of each predicted work and career satisfaction. Unlike many studies that have focused on the relationship between culture and work, this study has not used a person’s country of origin to represent their cultural orientation. Participants’ cultural orientations were identified independently of nationality and then used as variables in the analysis, and principal components and regression analysis were used to analyse the data. The results indicated that individuals with particular cultural orientations valued different aspects of work, and that work values and cultural orientations explained a minimal amount of variance in work and career satisfaction in the hospitality industry. Implications of the findings for practitioners and researchers are also addressed.

Keywords: Horizontal and vertical; Individualism and collectivism; Work values; Hospitality industry; Statistical analysis

1. Introduction

Interest in the analysis of human values has been growing for some time. Much of this interest has focused on the measurement and typology of values, and on the
relationship between values and constructs such as attitudes, emotions and decision-making (Elizur, 1996; Shafer et al., 2001). Values have been described as “beliefs that are experienced by the individual as standards that guide how he or she should function” (Brown, 2002, p. 49). It is believed that they have cognitive, affective and behavioural dimensions, are closely linked to motivation, and, according to Rokeach (1973), that they develop through the influences of culture, society and personality.

The reason for focusing on values as opposed to attitudes, for example, is that unlike attitudes, values do not correspond to a particular object or situation and are relatively stable over time. Furthermore, individuals have fewer values than attitudes (Dose, 1997) and many studies have found that values have influence over a variety of attitudes and behaviours (Brown, 2002).

Values related to work have received considerable scholarly attention for many decades (Hofstede, 1980; Super, 1970). Hertzberg et al. (1956) linked work values to motivation and job satisfaction, and others have demonstrated a strong link between having a high achievement value and being aggressiveness in and showing initiative in one’s work (Pizam et al, 1980). Work values have also been related to organisational commitment (Elizur and Koslowsky, 2001), vocational choice (Super, 1970), ethical decision making (Shafer et al., 2001) and cross-cultural management (Mellahi, 2001).

In an attempt to organise the various theoretical approaches to work values, Jennifer Dose (1997) proposed a framework that categorised them along two dimensions. The first identified whether the value had a moral component or was simply a preference for a particular type of work. The second was continuum between personal and social consensus values.

Fig. 1 shows the relationship between each of these categories, and illustrates how a number of popular approaches to work values can be classified. There is no doubt that this framework is useful for organising, identifying and clustering similar perspectives; however, it raises some conceptual questions.

One concern is to the assumption that personal values and socially constructed values fall along a continuum, as it may be more appropriate to conceptualise them as distinct. For example, while some individuals in a collectivist society may adhere to a particular social value, such as respect for tradition, others in that same society may also value the opportunity to work independently and challenge the status quo. In this sense two types of values are operating within individuals at the same time. Determining whether these values are distinct or in some way connected is of great importance to the question, as yet unanswered, of how they influence work-related behaviours or attitudes (Brown, 2002; Dose, 1997; Rohan, 2000). The aim of this study, therefore, is to investigate the relationship between work values and cultural orientations, and its role in predicting work satisfaction and career aspiration.

2. Personal work and social consensus value frameworks

A number of models for understanding personal work values are available, although empirical evidence suggests that little separates many of them (Zytowski,
Three popular models that differ in the way they conceptualise work values are the Minnesota Importance Questionnaire (MIQ), the Work Aspect Preference Scale (WAPS) and the Work Values Inventory (WVI) (Zytowski, 1994). For example, the MIQ views work values as needs that correspond to work reinforcers; the WAPS, as preferences, that is, what individuals like or prefer in their work; whereas the WVI assumes that values are goals that an individual seeks to attain in order to satisfy a need. Despite the conceptual differences between these models a study conducted by MacNab and Fitzsimmons in 1987 found that they essentially measured similar constructs (Zytowski, 1994).

In recent times, studies that have focused on understanding differences between national cultures and work usually include some reference to Geert Hofstede, and there are good reasons why his work is so often cited. First, the empirical findings of his initial study identified four dimensions of national culture that converged with the findings of prominent 19th century anthropologists and sociologists (Hofstede, 1991), suggesting a degree of content validity.

The second reason relates to the sample, which was drawn from IBM subsidiaries worldwide, and was closely matched from one country in age, gender and educational background. For Hofstede, the control of such variables was a unique opportunity to enable national characteristics to be identified and highlighted (Hofstede, 1980). The third reason is related to the formidable size of the sample: a data set of 116,000 responses.

Unfortunately, the wide appeal of his work has led many scholars in the management and marketing fields to accept this work uncritically, and in the process to neglect some impressive work that has been evolving in the psychology literature since the early 1990s (Schwartz, 1994; Schwartz and Bilsky, 1990; Singelis et al., 1995). Concerns about Hofstede’s work include whether there are four dimensions of national culture (a fifth was added in 1988) and whether the dimensions are representative of national cultural values or a result of a transient influence (Voronov and Singer, 2002).

**Fig. 1.** Value models characterised on the dimensions of moral/preference and personal/social. Source: adapted from Dose (1997).
The search for an acceptable model to discern cultural differences in value orientations has led the present author to the concepts of individualism and collectivism (I–C). These have attracted the attention of scholars from a variety of disciplines since the 1800s (Watson and Morris, 2002), and I–C has been used to explain cultural differences in family dynamics, conflict resolution, communication, leadership and resource allocation (Voronov and Singer, 2002).

The characteristics of I–C have been described by Singelis et al. (1995) as follows: individualists focus on ‘self’ concepts independently of the group and have personal goals that may or may not coincide with the group; whereas collectivists define themselves as part of the group and the goals of the group have priority over their personal goals. Moreover, relationships are extremely important to collectivists, while individualists will forgo relationships if they judge their costs to outweigh their benefits.

Despite the popularity of the I–C model some concerns have been registered. In reviewing findings related to I–C, Voronov and Singer (2002) noted that in 15 empirical studies that compared Japan (thought to be collectivist) and the US (thought to be individualistic), 14 did not support the common view. Moreover, in five of these studies the Japanese were found to be more individualistic than the Americans. Additionally, Rhee et al. (1996) reported that Koreans were more collectivistic towards their family members than Anglo-Americans, but less collectivistic than Americans towards non-family members.

The notion that these two constructs formed polar opposites, as suggested by Hofstede (1980), has also been questioned. Triandis (1995) proposed that there were horizontal (emphasising equality) and vertical (emphasising hierarchy) aspects to individualism and collectivism that formed four distinct cultural patterns: horizontal collectivism (HC), vertical collectivism (VC), horizontal individualism (HI) and vertical individualism (VI). A description of each of these can be found in Appendix B.

In 1995, Singelis developed a 32-item scale that operationalised the four pattern concept (Singelis et al., 1995). The four sub-scales exhibited acceptable reliability, and construct validity was established through a superior fit for a four-factor model over a two-factor model. Significant positive correlations with scales measuring similar constructs attested to the scale’s convergent validity, and this framework appears to provide an economic and robust alternative to more popular social values framework.

3. Summary and research questions

The role of values in influencing human behaviour has attracted much scholarly attention over the past decades, and work values have been examined for how they illuminate an individual’s work motivation, job satisfaction, vocational choice and decision-making style. In an attempt to distinguish the various approaches to defining work values, Dose (1997) proposed a framework that categorised work
values according to whether they were personally or socially constructed, and by whether they had a moral component or could be expressed as a preference.

Conceptualising work values on these dimensions raises questions about the relationship between types of values and the influence they exert on attitudes towards work or work behaviours. Given the absence of related empirical work, directional hypotheses cannot be formulated, and the following research questions have been devised to guide the investigation:

Question 1. What is the relationship between cultural orientation and work values?

Question 2. What dimensions of cultural orientations and work values best predict work satisfaction and career aspirations of those who work in the hospitality industry?

The study will now proceed with a description and justification of the methods that will be employed to address these questions.

4. Methodology

4.1. Sample characteristics

The sample consisted of hospitality management students studying in a variety of undergraduate and postgraduate programs offered in English in the UK, USA, Switzerland, France, Sweden, Spain and the Netherlands. The total number of nationalities represented in the sample was 54. The ratio between male and female participants was almost equal, and 62% of the total were aged between 26 and 30, and 27% between 16 and 20. Moreover, 74% had worked for an average of 12 months in the hospitality industry.

4.2. Data collection and instrumentation

The English-language questionnaire was piloted before being sent out, which enabled the instructions to be refined, and minor modifications to be made to both scales. Academics known to the author who taught in hospitality programs at the institutions in question distributed the questionnaires over three semesters and returned them by post.

The questionnaire consisted of three sections. The first captured demographic information such as age, nationality, gender and length of time spent working in the industry. The second section was based on Super’s (1970) Work Values Inventory (WVI), which was designed specifically to measure an individual’s personal work values, and was chosen because the validity and reliability of the instrument had been well established and documented (Brown, 2002; Chen et al., 2000; Dose, 1997; Pizam and Lewis, 1979; Pizam et al., 1980; Super, 1970). The WVI consists of 45 items that captured 15 intrinsic and extrinsic work value dimensions; a description of each of the dimensions can be found in Appendix A. Each item was assessed on a five-point scale, where 1 = unimportant and 5 = very important.
The third section consisted of 32 statements designed to capture the four cultural patterns first identified by Triandis (1995); a description of these patterns can be found in Appendix B. A five-point scale was employed, where 1 = strongly disagree and 5 = strongly agree. A single item ‘Overall, I believe that the hospitality industry will satisfy my work and career aspirations’, was included as a dependent variable to address the second research question and this was also accompanied by a five-point scale where 1 = strongly disagree and 5 = strongly agree.

4.3. Data analysis

Principle components analysis (PCA) was used to reduce the total number of variables by identifying a smaller set of underlying dimensions. The internal consistency between the items comprising the dimensions was determined by computing Cronbach’s coefficient $\alpha$ and correlation analysis and step-wise regression was used to determine the strength and direction of the correlations between the variables.

A number of assumptions that underlie the application of the statistical procedures employed in this study were tested. These were sample size, factorability of the correlation matrix, outlying cases, linearity and normality (Coakes and Steed, 1999; Kinnear and Gray, 1997).

5. Results

The sample size of 562 is an acceptable respondent to item ratio for the techniques that were employed here (Kinnear and Gray, 1997). Eight cases that exceeded three standard deviations from the mean were deleted from the data set. Skewness and kurtosis statistics indicated that no extreme values were present and scatter plots of the variables provided no evidence of a curvilinear effect between any combinations of variables. Therefore the assumptions of linearity and normality have not been violated.

Table 1 provides the PCA output for the cultural patterns framework and an inspection of the scree plot suggested that a four-factor solution, which explained 42.0% of the total variance, was appropriate. The KMO was .900 and Bartlett’s Test of Sphericity was high and significant ($p = .000$), and the $\alpha$ coefficients all exceed the recommended .70 (Nunnally, 1978). With few exceptions (see loading in bold type), these results replicate the factor structure first reported by Singelis et al. (1995).

The 45 items of the WVI were also subjected to a PCA, and the scree test indicated that a four-component solution was appropriate. The components explained 36.7% of the total scale variance, the KMO was .974, and Bartlett’s test was significant ($p = .000$). The four factors have been labelled comfort–independent, stimulation, affiliation and achievement and all of the $\alpha$ values exceed .70, attesting to the cohesiveness of the scales within each component (Table 2).

The cultural patterns framework has demonstrated acceptable reliability and content validity, given that the component structure closely resembled findings from
other empirical studies using the same instrument. The WVI did not conform to the 15 value dimensions as proposed by Super (1970), and on the basis of these findings, work values can best be conceptualised as a four-component construct across intrinsic and extrinsic value domains. For the most part, the achievement and

Table 1
Factor solution, loadings and α coefficients for the horizontal and vertical, individualism and collectivism framework

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>V–I (α = .79)</th>
<th>Loadings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I enjoy working in situations involving competition with others VI</td>
<td>.665</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winning is everything VI</td>
<td>.636</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Without competition, it is not possible to have a good society VI</td>
<td>.617</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competition is the law of nature VI</td>
<td>.616</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is important that I do my job better than others VI</td>
<td>.615</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When another person does better than I do, I get tense and aroused VI</td>
<td>.508</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It annoys me when other people perform better than I do VI</td>
<td>.452</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some people emphasize winning; I’m not one of them (rev) VI</td>
<td>.301</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>V–C (α = .72)</th>
<th>Loadings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I would do what pleases my family, even if I detest the activity VC</td>
<td>.745</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I would sacrifice an activity that I enjoy very much if my family did not approve of it VC</td>
<td>.585</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I usually sacrifice my self-interest for the benefit of my group VC</td>
<td>.578</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Before taking a major trip, I consult with most members of my family and many friends VC</td>
<td>.559</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children should be taught to place duty before pleasure VC</td>
<td>.436</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My happiness depends very much on the happiness of those around me HC</td>
<td>.344</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>We should keep our aging parents with us at home VC</td>
<td>.336</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I hate to disagree with others in my group VC</td>
<td>.330</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>H–I (α = .75)</th>
<th>Loadings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I enjoy being unique and different from others in many ways HI</td>
<td>.687</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am a unique individual HI</td>
<td>.672</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What happens to me is my own doing HI</td>
<td>.542</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When I succeed, it is usually because of my own abilities HI</td>
<td>.494</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I like privacy HI</td>
<td>.490</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I should live my life independently of others HI</td>
<td>.478</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I prefer to be direct and forthright in discussions with people HI</td>
<td>.382</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I often do my own thing HI</td>
<td>.360</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>H–C (α = .71)</th>
<th>Loadings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I feel good when I cooperate with others HC</td>
<td>.644</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The well-being of my co-workers is important to me HC</td>
<td>.610</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If a co-worker gets a prize, I would feel proud HC</td>
<td>.578</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is important to maintain harmony within my group HC</td>
<td>.556</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If a relative were in financial difficulty, I would help within my means HC</td>
<td>.402</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To me, pleasure is spending time with others HC</td>
<td>.402</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children should feel honoured if their parents receive a distinguished award VC</td>
<td>.314</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I like sharing little things with my neighbours HC</td>
<td>.312</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


αLoaded also on Factor 2 (.317).
Table 2
PCA of the 15 work values and associated $a$ coefficients

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component 1 Comfort–independent ($a = .86$)</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Have a boss who treats you fairly</td>
<td>.618</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have freedom in your area</td>
<td>.597</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have pay increases that keep up with the cost of living</td>
<td>.555</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have a way of life, while not on the job, that you like</td>
<td>.525</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Like the setting in which your job is done</td>
<td>.516</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have a boss who is reasonable</td>
<td>.514</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lead the kind of life you most enjoy</td>
<td>.496</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Can be the kind of person you would like to be</td>
<td>.493</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Get the feeling of having done a good day’s work</td>
<td>.471</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain prestige in your field</td>
<td>.462</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are paid enough to live right</td>
<td>.455</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do not do the same thing all the time</td>
<td>.424</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Know by the results when you have done a good job</td>
<td>.421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are sure of always having a job</td>
<td>.413</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Know your job will last</td>
<td>.403</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>See the result of your efforts</td>
<td>.399</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Look forward to changes in your job</td>
<td>.374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Can get a raise</td>
<td>.352</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component 2 Stimulation ($a = .79$)</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Create something new</td>
<td>.698</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Try out new ideas and suggestions</td>
<td>.692</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contribute new ideas</td>
<td>.645</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Make your own decisions</td>
<td>.574</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use leadership abilities</td>
<td>.535</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need to be mentally alert</td>
<td>.495</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do many different things</td>
<td>.481</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need to have artistic ability</td>
<td>.478</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Make attractive products</td>
<td>.452</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are your own boss</td>
<td>.452</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are mentally challenged</td>
<td>.424</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have to keep solving problems</td>
<td>.423</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component 3 Affiliation ($a = .76$)</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Feel that you have helped another person</td>
<td>.675</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Add to the well-being of other people</td>
<td>.627</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Help others</td>
<td>.582</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are part of the team</td>
<td>.517</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have good contacts with fellow workers</td>
<td>.475</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Form friendships with your fellow employees</td>
<td>.458</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Add beauty to the world</td>
<td>.435</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component 4 Achievement ($a = .72$)</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Are sure of another job in the company if the present job ends</td>
<td>.580</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plan and organize the work of others</td>
<td>.567</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are looked up to by others</td>
<td>.492</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have a good place in which to work (quiet, clean, etc)</td>
<td>.481</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have authority over others</td>
<td>.477</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have a supervisor who is considerate</td>
<td>.432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have adequate lounge, toilet and other facilities</td>
<td>.417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Know that others consider your work important</td>
<td>.410</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Extraction method: principal component analysis.
Rotation method: Varimax with Kaiser normalization.
Rotation converged in 10 iterations.
comfort–independent components captured the latter, while the stimulation and affiliation components could be considered more intrinsic. The scales within the WVI also demonstrated acceptable reliability.

A possible explanation for the differences in component structure of the WVI may lie in the kind of criteria that was used to determine the number of factors. A popular way of doing this involves selecting components with eigenvalues above 1, and if this had been used in this study, more components would have been extracted. This method, however, has been criticised for including too many factors, and the component extraction criteria of the scree test have been argued to be more rigorous (Tabachnick and Fidell, 1996).

An earlier study that employed the WVI also reported a four-factor solution (Pizam et al., 1980); however, unlike the analysis conducted here, these authors summated the original 15 value dimensions and then subjected them to a factor analysis. The different methods of computation complicate the conclusions that could be drawn from these findings, although a four-component model may be a more appropriate conceptualisation of work values.

The component scores from the various dimensions were saved and used as separate variables in the following analyses. Tables 3–7 display results that are related to Question 1. The Pearson correlations between the dimensions of the two frameworks can be found in Table 3, and while the majority of the correlations are significant, the strength of the correlations could be considered moderate to weak (Kinnear and Gray, 1997).

Tables 4–7 display more specific information on the relationship between the two frameworks. The results of the stepwise regression indicate the relative strengths and direction of each variable in predicting the dependent variable, and this is determined by examining the standardised beta weights. These indicate the standard deviation change on the dependent variable that will be produced by a change of one standard deviation on the independent variables concerned. The step-wise procedure adds the independent variables one at a time and excludes any that do not contribute reliably to the regression equation.

It is evident that the cultural patterns HI and VC explain 16.9% of the variance in comfort–independent values. HI has the strongest positive relationship, and the significant negatively signed VC indicates that as levels of VC increase, the importance of comfort–independent values decline. HI is again the best predictor of stimulation values and this time it is joined by VI. Together they explain almost 13% of the variance in the dependent variable.

The findings related to the affiliation component indicate that three of the cultural patterns, HC, VC and VI, explain 21.7% of the variance in affiliation. The negatively signed VI value of .186 again indicates an inverse relationship with affiliation. All of the cultural patterns are significantly related to the achievement component, with VC and VI being the strongest predictors. Together they explained 24.2% of the variance in achievement.

Tables 8 and 9 display regression output that relates to Question 2. In order to narrow the focus of this analysis, only respondents who had worked in the industry were included; the average time spent working was 18 months. Given the low
Table 3
Correlations between the dimensions of the work values and cultural patterns

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Comfort independent</th>
<th>Stimulation</th>
<th>Affiliation</th>
<th>Achievement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HI</td>
<td>.363(^a)</td>
<td>.338(^a)</td>
<td>.028</td>
<td>.148(^a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>-.035</td>
<td>.124(^b)</td>
<td>-.188(^a)</td>
<td>.352(^a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VC</td>
<td>-.157(^a)</td>
<td>.030</td>
<td>.214(^a)</td>
<td>.284(^a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>.079</td>
<td>.041</td>
<td>.369(^a)</td>
<td>.106(^b)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^a\)Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).
\(^b\)Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

Table 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Standardized coefficient (\beta)</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HI</td>
<td>.365</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VC</td>
<td>-.153</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(R^2\) .169. Dependent variable: Comfort-independent.

Table 5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Standardized coefficient (\beta)</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HI</td>
<td>.337</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>.122</td>
<td>.007</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(R^2\) .129 Dependent variable: Stimulation.

Table 6

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Standardized coefficient (\beta)</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>.370</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VC</td>
<td>.213</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>-.186</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(R^2\) .217. Dependent variable: Affiliation.

correlations between the two frameworks, the work values components and the cultural patterns were regressed against the dependent variable separately.

Table 8 indicates that all WVI components significantly contributed to explaining the variance of the dependent variable, and the best predictor was comfort–independent (.225) followed by affiliation, stimulation and achievement.

Table 9 indicates that those with strong HC characteristics are more likely to believe that the hospitality industry will satisfy their work and career ambitions. HC was joined by HI and VC, and each explained a significant, albeit smaller, amount of variance in the dependent variable.
In respect to Question 1, it is clear that there is a relationship between the two frameworks, cultural orientation and work values; however, the correlations are not strong or widespread, in that distinct clusters of cultural patterns are involved in predicting the various work value components. These findings also add support to the conceptualisation of the cultural patterns framework, in that there is evidence of convergence between similar components within each model.

For example, HC and VC supposedly reflect the individual as merged, or as part of the in-group, with the former emphasising equality and the latter serving and sacrificing for others. As expected, these are positively correlated with the affiliation component (see Table 2), while the competitive, independent characteristics of VI express a negative relationship with the same component. An inspection of the remaining output indicates similar patterns, and given that content validity of the

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standardized coefficient β</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>.327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VC</td>
<td>.289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HI</td>
<td>.154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>.113</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$R^2 .242$. Dependent variable: Achievement.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standardized coefficient β</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Comfort independent</td>
<td>.225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Affiliation</td>
<td>.201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stimulation</td>
<td>.150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Achievement</td>
<td>.111</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Dependent variable: Overall, I believe that the hospitality industry will satisfy my work and career aspirations $R^2 .116$.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standardized coefficient β</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>.268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HI</td>
<td>.170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VC</td>
<td>.120</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Dependent variable: Overall, I believe that the hospitality industry will satisfy my work and career aspirations $R^2 .115$.

6. Discussion

In respect to Question 1, it is clear that there is a relationship between the two frameworks, cultural orientation and work values; however, the correlations are not strong or widespread, in that distinct clusters of cultural patterns are involved in predicting the various work value components. These findings also add support to the conceptualisation of the cultural patterns framework, in that there is evidence of convergence between similar components within each model.
cultural framework has already been established, these findings also support the convergent validity of the model.

From a practitioner’s perspective, these findings have a number of implications. By comparison, those with an HI cultural pattern seek the most out of work and value a job that allows autonomy, a variety of challenging tasks, and pleasant working conditions with prospects of good pay and promotion. In many respects these are desirable managerial qualities; however, finding entry-level jobs in the hospitality industry that can satisfy these needs may be problematic, particularly if there are many employees within an organisation that share the same cultural characteristics.

This issue should not be underestimated, as the behavioural consequences of not being able to satisfy work values have been linked to a reduction in motivation and dissatisfaction (Hertzberg et al., 1956). Apart from providing acceptable work conditions, human resources management techniques such as job rotation, vertical and horizontal job enrichment and a variety of training programs, could be used to motivate and retain employees with strong HI preferences.

For those with strong VI characteristics, achievement and stimulation components are more important. These individuals value a clean environment, good relations with superiors and some managerial responsibility, and need to be mentally alert and creative. Given that there is no relationship between VI and the comfort–independent component, aspects such as pay and lifestyle outside of work are not a priority for this type, and, taken together, VI types may be easier to manage than HI. A possible concern with VI relates to the inverse relationship with affiliation values, as teamwork and an inclination to help others are important attributes in the production and consumption of most hospitality products.

From a HC perspective, helping others and contributing to harmonious relationships are important aspects of the work setting, and the hospitality industry would appear to suit individuals with strong HC characteristics. Complementing this finding is a small but significant need for comfort–independent and achievement components, and taken together, this combination would appear to balance the excesses and gaps associated with HI and VI.

What is not known is how those with a strong HC orientation would perform or behave in settings where interpersonal relationships were strained and this would need to be monitored. Moreover, as stimulation values are not important outcomes of work for HC, jobs that require some kind of creative input and are mentally demanding may not suit individuals with these cultural patterns.

Preferences for affiliation and achievement, no preference for stimulation, and an inverse relationship with the comfort–independent component indicate that employees with VC characteristics have another distinct set of needs. In this instance, the presence of affiliation needs differs from HC in that it has less to do with equality and more to do with serving and sacrificing characteristics. Individuals with strong VC patterns may be more committed to the firm and more suitable in customer contact roles than others; however, further study would be necessary to confirm this.

Question 2 aimed to determine which dimensions of the two frameworks best-predicted work satisfaction and career aspirations, and it is clear that the
explanatory power of both models are quite low. The components of the WVI, which has been used extensively for career guidance and job counselling purposes, accounted for only 11.6% of the variance in the dependent variable, indicating that factors outside the realm of this study exert considerably more influence.

Despite spending an average of 12 months working in the hospitality industry, and given that most turnover occurs in the first month (Woods, 1997), it is surprising to see that the comfort–independent component was the best predictor of work and career-aspiration satisfaction. Surprising, because factors influencing employee turnover in the hospitality industry have been reported to include low pay and poor working conditions, qualities that are incongruent with comfort–independent characteristics. The fact that respondents in this study are hospitality management students may explain this anomaly, as their future prospects are perhaps more optimistic than those who do not have formal qualifications.

As mentioned above, the ability to work in a team and get on with colleagues is an important attribute in labour-intensive service industries, so it is perhaps not surprising that the affiliation component was the second strongest predictor. Those who have achievement-type attributes appear least likely to be suited for a career in the hospitality industry.

The information displayed in Table 9 indicates that the cultural pattern of HC is the best predictor of work and career aspiration satisfaction, although the low $R^2$ values caution against the use of cultural patterns as predictor variables. Despite this caveat, the results reported here are still statistically significant, and would indicate that individuals who value comfort–independent attributes with a cultural orientation of HC will be most suited to a career in the hospitality industry.

7. Conclusion and research implications

The aim of this study was to examine the relationship between cultural orientations and work values, and the findings provide a rare insight into the relationship between these two constructs, as cultural orientation of respondents has not referred to their country of origin. Numerous studies that have investigated work/culture dynamics, where, for example, managers from two or more countries provided information on a topic, assume differences to be related to country of origin. Clearly, such an approach is problematic, particularly if the sample is from a country like the US, where respondents could be of many nationalities.

Two research questions were devised to guide the investigation, and in respect to the first, it was established that while the two frameworks were not strongly related, individuals with different cultural patterns did value different outcomes from work. An understanding of these differences will enable managers to enhance selection procedures and design jobs that complement the cultural orientations of individual employees. The findings related to the second research question can also assist managers by providing insights into the characteristics of individuals who are more likely to believe that the hospitality industry will satisfy their work and career aspirations.
From a theoretical perspective, it has been established that cultural orientations and work values are correlated, and of the two instruments that were used in this study, the horizontal and vertical, individualism and collectivism framework has demonstrated sound psychometric properties and appears to be a robust means of discerning differences in cultural orientations in individuals. The WVI components demonstrated acceptable reliability; however, the factor structure found in earlier studies was not replicated here. Moreover, caution needs to be taken when using this instrument for career guidance purposes, as it proved to be a weak predictor of work and career satisfaction in the hospitality industry.

7.1. Limitations

Despite the number of institutions involved in the study, and the extended data collection period, only 562 usable questionnaires were received. The length of the questionnaire (87 items) may have deterred students from responding (participation in the study was entirely voluntary).

The convenient nature of the sampling procedure, and the fact that the majority of the respondents were under 30, weaken the representativeness and generalisability of the findings. However, given that the hospitality industry employs many people in this age bracket, and the absence of research in this area, the findings should be viewed as providing foundation knowledge and a guide for future research activity.

Finally, while the length of time each of the respondents had spent working in the industry is known, the nature of the work is not. For example, some may have been working part-time while studying or undergone a practicum as part of their course, and this should be considered when interpreting the findings related to Question 2.

7.2. Future research

While it has been demonstrated here that there is a clear relationship between cultural orientations and work values, many questions remain. For example, future research could examine how long an individual will tolerate work that is incongruent with their values and identify the possible behavioural consequences: How long will HC or HI tolerate a job that does not meet their need for affiliation and stimulation? And are there differences in the way each would respond in such situations?

There is a need to examine each of the frameworks in conjunction with other organisational factors, such as commitment, work climate or organisation culture. This would overcome the limitation of using only one dependent variable and enable more detailed understandings of the characteristics associated with each of the cultural orientations and work value components. It is unlikely that individuals will have a strong preference for only one cultural orientation, most will probably have a blend of influences, and research that examines the ‘blend’ effect on attitudes or behaviour would be beneficial.

Finally, longitudinal studies could provide insights into the stability of both frameworks over time, and determine whether they are influenced by factors such as
age and changes in social conditions, or by training and development initiatives within organisations.

Acknowledgements

The author would like to thank Damian Morgan from Monash University, Australia, and the Glion Center for Cross-Cultural Hospitality Management Research, for assisting in the early stages of this project.

Appendix A

Creativity: work which permits one to invent new things, design new products, or develop new ideas.

Management: work that permits one to plan and lay out work for others.

Achievement: work that gives one the feeling of accomplishment in doing a job well.

Surroundings: work that is carried out under pleasant conditions; not too hot or too cold, noisy, dirty, etc.

Supervisory relationships: work that is carried out under a supervisor who is fair and with whom one can get along.

Way of life: work that permits one to live the kind of life he/she chooses and to be the type of person he/she wishes to be.

Security: work that provides one with the certainty of having a job even in hard times.

Associates: work that brings one into contact with fellow workers who you like.

Aesthetic: work that permits one to make beautiful things and to contribute beauty to the world.

Prestige: work that gives one standing in the eyes of others and evokes respect.

Independence: work that permits one to work in his/her own way, as quickly or slowly as he/she wishes.

Variety: work that provides an opportunity to do different types of tasks.

Economic return: work that pays well and enables one to have things he/she wants.

Altruism: work that enables one to contribute to the welfare of others.

Intellectual stimulation: work that provides opportunity for independent thinking, and for learning how and why things work.

Appendix B

Horizontal individualism: a cultural pattern where an autonomous self is postulated, but the individual is more or less equal in status with others. The self
is independent and the same as the self of others. The personal characteristic associated with this dimension has also been described as unique.

Horizontal collectivism: a cultural pattern in which the individual sees the self as an aspect of an in-group. That is, the self is merged with the members of the in-group, all of whom are extremely similar to each other. Equality is the essence of this pattern.

Vertical individualism: a cultural pattern in which an autonomous self is postulated, but individuals see each other as different, and inequality is expected. The self is independent and different from the self of others. Competition is an important aspect of this pattern.

Vertical collectivism: a cultural pattern in which the individual sees the self as an aspect of an in-group, but the members of the group are different from each other, some having more status than others. The self is interdependent and different from the self of others. Serving and sacrificing for the in-group is an important aspect of this pattern.

References


Towards an understanding of the relationship between work values and cultural orientations

Christopher White*

Coordinator, Hospitality & Tourism, Charles Darwin University, Darwin, NT 0909, Australia

Abstract

The role of values in influencing behaviour and attitudes has been well documented; however, the relationship between various values has received little academic attention. This study aimed to investigate the relationship between work values and cultural orientations, and to determine which dimension of each predicted work and career satisfaction. Unlike many studies that have focused on the relationship between culture and work, this study has not used a person’s country of origin to represent their cultural orientation. Participants’ cultural orientations were identified independently of nationality and then used as variables in the analysis, and principal components and regression analysis were used to analyse the data. The results indicated that individuals with particular cultural orientations valued different aspects of work, and that work values and cultural orientations explained a minimal amount of variance in work and career satisfaction in the hospitality industry. Implications of the findings for practitioners and researchers are also addressed.

Keywords: Horizontal and vertical; Individualism and collectivism; Work values; Hospitality industry; Statistical analysis

1. Introduction

Interest in the analysis of human values has been growing for some time. Much of this interest has focused on the measurement and typology of values, and on the

*Tel.: +61 8 8946 6278.
E-mail address: christopher.white@cdu.edu.au.
relationship between values and constructs such as attitudes, emotions and decision-making (Elizur, 1996; Shafer et al., 2001). Values have been described as “beliefs that are experienced by the individual as standards that guide how he or she should function” (Brown, 2002, p. 49). It is believed that they have cognitive, affective and behavioural dimensions, are closely linked to motivation, and, according to Rokeach (1973), that they develop through the influences of culture, society and personality.

The reason for focusing on values as opposed to attitudes, for example, is that unlike attitudes, values do not correspond to a particular object or situation and are relatively stable over time. Furthermore, individuals have fewer values than attitudes (Dose, 1997) and many studies have found that values have influence over a variety of attitudes and behaviours (Brown, 2002).

Values related to work have received considerable scholarly attention for many decades (Hofstede, 1980; Super, 1970). Hertzberg et al. (1956) linked work values to motivation and job satisfaction, and others have demonstrated a strong link between having a high achievement value and being aggressiveness in and showing initiative in one’s work (Pizam et al, 1980). Work values have also been related to organisational commitment (Elizur and Koslowsky, 2001), vocational choice (Super, 1970), ethical decision making (Shafer et al., 2001) and cross-cultural management (Mellahi, 2001).

In an attempt to organise the various theoretical approaches to work values, Jennifer Dose (1997) proposed a framework that categorised them along two dimensions. The first identified whether the value had a moral component or was simply a preference for a particular type of work. The second was a continuum between personal and social consensus values.

Fig. 1 shows the relationship between each of these categories, and illustrates how a number of popular approaches to work values can be classified. There is no doubt that this framework is useful for organising, identifying and clustering similar perspectives; however, it raises some conceptual questions.

One concern is to the assumption that personal values and socially constructed values fall along a continuum, as it may be more appropriate to conceptualise them as distinct. For example, while some individuals in a collectivist society may adhere to a particular social value, such as respect for tradition, others in that same society may also value the opportunity to work independently and challenge the status quo. In this sense two types of values are operating within individuals at the same time. Determining whether these values are distinct or in some way connected is of great importance to the question, as yet unanswered, of how they influence work-related behaviours or attitudes (Brown, 2002; Dose, 1997; Rohan, 2000). The aim of this study, therefore, is to investigate the relationship between work values and cultural orientations, and its role in predicting work satisfaction and career aspiration.

2. Personal work and social consensus value frameworks

A number of models for understanding personal work values are available, although empirical evidence suggests that little separates many of them (Zytowski,
Three popular models that differ in the way they conceptualise work values are the Minnesota Importance Questionnaire (MIQ), the Work Aspect Preference Scale (WAPS) and the Work Values Inventory (WVI) (Zytowski, 1994). For example, the MIQ views work values as needs that correspond to work reinforcers; the WAPS, as preferences, that is, what individuals like or prefer in their work; whereas the WVI assumes that values are goals that an individual seeks to attain in order to satisfy a need. Despite the conceptual differences between these models a study conducted by MacNab and Fitzsimmons in 1987 found that they essentially measured similar constructs (Zytowski, 1994).

In recent times, studies that have focused on understanding differences between national cultures and work usually include some reference to Geert Hofstede, and there are good reasons why his work is so often cited. First, the empirical findings of his initial study identified four dimensions of national culture that converged with the findings of prominent 19th century anthropologists and sociologists (Hofstede, 1991), suggesting a degree of content validity.

The second reason relates to the sample, which was drawn from IBM subsidiaries worldwide, and was closely matched from one country in age, gender and educational background. For Hofstede, the control of such variables was a unique opportunity to enable national characteristics to be identified and highlighted (Hofstede, 1980). The third reason is related to the formidable size of the sample: a data set of 116,000 responses.

Unfortunately, the wide appeal of his work has led many scholars in the management and marketing fields to accept this work uncritically, and in the process to neglect some impressive work that has been evolving in the psychology literature since the early 1990s (Schwartz, 1994; Schwartz and Bilsky, 1990; Singelis et al., 1995). Concerns about Hofstede's work include whether there are four dimensions of national culture (a fifth was added in 1988) and whether the dimensions are representative of national cultural values or a result of a transient influence (Voronov and Singer, 2002).

![Value models characterised on the dimensions of moral/preference and personal/social. Source: adapted from Dose (1997).](image-url)
The search for an acceptable model to discern cultural differences in value orientations has led the present author to the concepts of individualism and collectivism (I–C). These have attracted the attention of scholars from a variety of disciplines since the 1800s (Watson and Morris, 2002), and I–C has been used to explain cultural differences in family dynamics, conflict resolution, communication, leadership and resource allocation (Voronov and Singer, 2002).

The characteristics of I–C have been described by Singelis et al. (1995) as follows: individualists focus on ‘self’ concepts independently of the group and have personal goals that may or may not coincide with the group; whereas collectivists define themselves as part of the group and the goals of the group have priority over their personal goals. Moreover, relationships are extremely important to collectivists, while individualists will forgo relationships if they judge their costs to outweigh their benefits.

Despite the popularity of the I–C model some concerns have been registered. In reviewing findings related to I–C, Voronov and Singer (2002) noted that in 15 empirical studies that compared Japan (thought to be collectivist) and the US (thought to be individualistic), 14 did not support the common view. Moreover, in five of these studies the Japanese were found to be more individualistic than the Americans. Additionally, Rhee et al. (1996) reported that Koreans were more collectivistic towards their family members than Anglo-Americans, but less collectivistic than Americans towards non-family members.

The notion that these two constructs formed polar opposites, as suggested by Hofstede (1980), has also been questioned. Triandis (1995) proposed that there were horizontal (emphasising equality) and vertical (emphasising hierarchy) aspects to individualism and collectivism that formed four distinct cultural patterns: horizontal collectivism (HC), vertical collectivism (VC), horizontal individualism (HI) and vertical individualism (VI). A description of each of these can be found in Appendix B.

In 1995, Singelis developed a 32-item scale that operationalised the four pattern concept (Singelis et al., 1995). The four sub-scales exhibited acceptable reliability, and construct validity was established through a superior fit for a four-factor model over a two-factor model. Significant positive correlations with scales measuring similar constructs attested to the scale’s convergent validity, and this framework appears to provide an economic and robust alternative to more popular social values framework.

3. Summary and research questions

The role of values in influencing human behaviour has attracted much scholarly attention over the past decades, and work values have been examined for how they illuminate an individual’s work motivation, job satisfaction, vocational choice and decision-making style. In an attempt to distinguish the various approaches to defining work values, Dose (1997) proposed a framework that categorised work
values according to whether they were personally or socially constructed, and by whether they had a moral component or could be expressed as a preference.

Conceptualising work values on these dimensions raises questions about the relationship between types of values and the influence they exert on attitudes towards work or work behaviours. Given the absence of related empirical work, directional hypotheses cannot be formulated, and the following research questions have been devised to guide the investigation:

Question 1. What is the relationship between cultural orientation and work values?

Question 2. What dimensions of cultural orientations and work values best predict work satisfaction and career aspirations of those who work in the hospitality industry?

The study will now proceed with a description and justification of the methods that will be employed to address these questions.

4. Methodology

4.1. Sample characteristics

The sample consisted of hospitality management students studying in a variety of undergraduate and postgraduate programs offered in English in the UK, USA, Switzerland, France, Sweden, Spain and the Netherlands. The total number of nationalities represented in the sample was 54. The ratio between male and female participants was almost equal, and 62% of the total were aged between 26 and 30, and 27% between 16 and 20. Moreover, 74% had worked for an average of 12 months in the hospitality industry.

4.2. Data collection and instrumentation

The English-language questionnaire was piloted before being sent out, which enabled the instructions to be refined, and minor modifications to be made to both scales. Academics known to the author who taught in hospitality programs at the institutions in question distributed the questionnaires over three semesters and returned them by post.

The questionnaire consisted of three sections. The first captured demographic information such as age, nationality, gender and length of time spent working in the industry. The second section was based on Super’s (1970) Work Values Inventory (WVI), which was designed specifically to measure an individual’s personal work values, and was chosen because the validity and reliability of the instrument had been well established and documented (Brown, 2002; Chen et al., 2000; Dose, 1997; Pizam and Lewis, 1979; Pizam et al., 1980; Super, 1970). The WVI consists of 45 items that captured 15 intrinsic and extrinsic work value dimensions; a description of each of the dimensions can be found in Appendix A. Each item was assessed on a five-point scale, where 1 = unimportant and 5 = very important.
The third section consisted of 32 statements designed to capture the four cultural patterns first identified by Triandis (1995); a description of these patterns can be found in Appendix B. A five-point scale was employed, where 1 = *strongly disagree* and 5 = *strongly agree*. A single item ‘Overall, I believe that the hospitality industry will satisfy my work and career aspirations’, was included as a dependent variable to address the second research question and this was also accompanied by a five-point scale where 1 = *strongly disagree* and 5 = *strongly agree*.

### 4.3. Data analysis

Principle components analysis (PCA) was used to reduce the total number of variables by identifying a smaller set of underlying dimensions. The internal consistency between the items comprising the dimensions was determined by computing Cronbach’s coefficient $\alpha$ and correlation analysis and step-wise regression was used to determine the strength and direction of the correlations between the variables.

A number of assumptions that underlie the application of the statistical procedures employed in this study were tested. These were sample size, factorability of the correlation matrix, outlying cases, linearity and normality (Coakes and Steed, 1999; Kinnear and Gray, 1997).

### 5. Results

The sample size of 562 is an acceptable respondent to item ratio for the techniques that were employed here (Kinnear and Gray, 1997). Eight cases that exceeded three standard deviations from the mean were deleted from the data set. Skewness and kurtosis statistics indicated that no extreme values were present and scatter plots of the variables provided no evidence of a curvilinear effect between any combinations of variables. Therefore the assumptions of linearity and normality have not been violated.

Table 1 provides the PCA output for the cultural patterns framework and an inspection of the scree plot suggested that a four-factor solution, which explained 42.0% of the total variance, was appropriate. The KMO was .900 and Bartlett’s Test of Sphericity was high and significant ($p = .000$), and the $\alpha$ coefficients all exceed the recommended .70 (Nunnally, 1978). With few exceptions (see loading in bold type), these results replicate the factor structure first reported by Singelis et al. (1995).

The 45 items of the WVI were also subjected to a PCA, and the scree test indicated that a four-component solution was appropriate. The components explained 36.7% of the total scale variance, the KMO was .974, and Bartlett’s test was significant ($p = .000$). The four factors have been labelled *comfort–independent*, *stimulation*, *affiliation* and *achievement* and all of the $\alpha$ values exceed .70, attesting to the cohesiveness of the scales within each component (Table 2).

The cultural patterns framework has demonstrated acceptable reliability and content validity, given that the component structure closely resembled findings from
other empirical studies using the same instrument. The WVI did not conform to the 15 value dimensions as proposed by Super (1970), and on the basis of these findings, work values can best be conceptualised as a four-component construct across intrinsic and extrinsic value domains. For the most part, the achievement and

Table 1
Factor solution, loadings and \( \alpha \) coefficients for the horizontal and vertical, individualism and collectivism framework

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Loadings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Factor 1 V–I (( \alpha = .79 ))</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I enjoy working in situations involving competition with others VI</td>
<td>.665</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winning is everything VI</td>
<td>.636</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Without competition, it is not possible to have a good society VI</td>
<td>.617</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competition is the law of nature VI</td>
<td>.616</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is important that I do my job better than others VI</td>
<td>.615</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When another person does better than I do, I get tense and aroused VI.</td>
<td>.508</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It annoys me when other people perform better than I do VI</td>
<td>.452</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some people emphasize winning; I’m not one of them (rev) VI</td>
<td>.301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Factor 2 H–I (( \alpha = .75 ))</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I enjoy being unique and different from others in many ways HI</td>
<td>.687</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am a unique individual HI</td>
<td>.672</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What happens to me is my own doing HI</td>
<td>.542</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When I succeed, it is usually because of my own abilities HI</td>
<td>.494</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I like privacy HI</td>
<td>.490</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I should live my life independently of others HI</td>
<td>.478</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I prefer to be direct and forthright in discussions with people HI</td>
<td>.382</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I often do my own thing HI</td>
<td>.360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Factor 3 V–C (( \alpha = .72 ))</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I would do what pleases my family, even if I detest the activity VC</td>
<td>.745</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I would sacrifice an activity that I enjoy very much if my family did not approve of it VC</td>
<td>.585</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I usually sacrifice my self-interest for the benefit of my group VC</td>
<td>.578</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Before taking a major trip, I consult with most members of my family and many friends VC</td>
<td>.559</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children should be taught to place duty before pleasure VC</td>
<td>.436</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My happiness depends very much on the happiness of those around me HC</td>
<td>.344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>We should keep our aging parents with us at home VC</td>
<td>.336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I hate to disagree with others in my group VC</td>
<td>.330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Factor 4 H–C (( \alpha = .71 ))</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel good when I cooperate with others HC</td>
<td>.644</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The well-being of my co-workers is important to me HC</td>
<td>.610</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If a co-worker gets a prize, I would feel proud HC</td>
<td>.578</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is important to maintain harmony within my group HC</td>
<td>.556</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If a relative were in financial difficulty, I would help within my means HC</td>
<td>.402</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To me, pleasure is spending time with others HC</td>
<td>.402</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children should feel honoured if their parents receive a distinguished award VC</td>
<td>.314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I like sharing little things with my neighbours HC</td>
<td>.312</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


\({}^a\)Loaded also on Factor 2 (.317).
Table 2
PCA of the 15 work values and associated $\alpha$ coefficients

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component 1 Comfort–independent ($\alpha = .86$)</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Have a boss who treats you fairly</td>
<td>.618</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have freedom in your area</td>
<td>.597</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have pay increases that keep up with the cost of living</td>
<td>.555</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have a way of life, while not on the job, that you like</td>
<td>.525</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Like the setting in which your job is done</td>
<td>.516</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have a boss who is reasonable</td>
<td>.514</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lead the kind of life you most enjoy</td>
<td>.496</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Can be the kind of person you would like to be</td>
<td>.493</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Get the feeling of having done a good day's work</td>
<td>.471</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gain prestige in your field</td>
<td>.462</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are paid enough to live right</td>
<td>.455</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do not do the same thing all the time</td>
<td>.424</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Know by the results when you have done a good job</td>
<td>.421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are sure of always having a job</td>
<td>.413</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Know your job will last</td>
<td>.403</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>See the result of your efforts</td>
<td>.399</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Look forward to changes in your job</td>
<td>.374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Can get a raise</td>
<td>.352</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component 2 Stimulation ($\alpha = .79$)</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Create something new</td>
<td>.698</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Try out new ideas and suggestions</td>
<td>.692</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contribute new ideas</td>
<td>.645</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Make your own decisions</td>
<td>.574</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use leadership abilities</td>
<td>.535</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need to be mentally alert</td>
<td>.495</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do many different things</td>
<td>.481</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need to have artistic ability</td>
<td>.478</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Make attractive products</td>
<td>.452</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are your own boss</td>
<td>.452</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are mentally challenged</td>
<td>.424</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have to keep solving problems</td>
<td>.423</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component 3 Affiliation ($\alpha = .76$)</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Feel that you have helped another person</td>
<td>.675</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Add to the well-being of other people</td>
<td>.627</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Help others</td>
<td>.582</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are part of the team</td>
<td>.517</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have good contacts with fellow workers</td>
<td>.475</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Form friendships with your fellow employees</td>
<td>.458</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Add beauty to the world</td>
<td>.435</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component 4 Achievement ($\alpha = .72$)</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Are sure of another job in the company if the present job ends</td>
<td>.580</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plan and organize the work of others</td>
<td>.567</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are looked up to by others</td>
<td>.492</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have a good place in which to work (quiet, clean, etc)</td>
<td>.481</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have authority over others</td>
<td>.477</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have a supervisor who is considerate</td>
<td>.432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have adequate lounge, toilet and other facilities</td>
<td>.417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Know that others consider your work important</td>
<td>.410</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Extraction method: principal component analysis.
Rotation method: Varimax with Kaiser normalization.
Rotation converged in 10 iterations.
comfort–independent components captured the latter, while the stimulation and affiliation components could be considered more intrinsic. The scales within the WVI also demonstrated acceptable reliability.

A possible explanation for the differences in component structure of the WVI may lie in the kind of criteria that was used to determine the number of factors. A popular way of doing this involves selecting components with eigenvalues above 1, and if this had been used in this study, more components would have been extracted. This method, however, has been criticised for including too many factors, and the component extraction criteria of the scree test have been argued to be more rigorous (Tabachnick and Fidell, 1996).

An earlier study that employed the WVI also reported a four-factor solution (Pizam et al., 1980); however, unlike the analysis conducted here, these authors summated the original 15 value dimensions and then subjected them to a factor analysis. The different methods of computation complicate the conclusions that could be drawn from these findings, although a four-component model may be a more appropriate conceptualisation of work values.

The component scores from the various dimensions were saved and used as separate variables in the following analyses. Tables 3–7 display results that are related to Question 1. The Pearson correlations between the dimensions of the two frameworks can be found in Table 3, and while the majority of the correlations are significant, the strength of the correlations could be considered moderate to weak (Kinnear and Gray, 1997).

Tables 4–7 display more specific information on the relationship between the two frameworks. The results of the stepwise regression indicate the relative strengths and direction of each variable in predicting the dependent variable, and this is determined by examining the standardised beta weights. These indicate the standard deviation change on the dependent variable that will be produced by a change of one standard deviation on the independent variables concerned. The step-wise procedure adds the independent variables one at a time and excludes any that do not contribute reliably to the regression equation.

It is evident that the cultural patterns HI and VC explain 16.9% of the variance in comfort–independent values. HI has the strongest positive relationship, and the significant negatively signed VC indicates that as levels of VC increase, the importance of comfort–independent values decline. HI is again the best predictor of stimulation values and this time it is joined by VI. Together they explain almost 13% of the variance in the dependent variable.

The findings related to the affiliation component indicate that three of the cultural patterns, HC, VC and VI, explain 21.7% of the variance in affiliation. The negatively signed VI value of .186 again indicates an inverse relationship with affiliation. All of the cultural patterns are significantly related to the achievement component, with VC and VI being the strongest predictors. Together they explained 24.2% of the variance in achievement.

Tables 8 and 9 display regression output that relates to Question 2. In order to narrow the focus of this analysis, only respondents who had worked in the industry were included; the average time spent working was 18 months. Given the low
correlations between the two frameworks, the work values components and the cultural patterns were regressed against the dependent variable separately. Table 8 indicates that all WVI components significantly contributed to explaining the variance of the dependent variable, and the best predictor was comfort–independent (.225) followed by affiliation, stimulation and achievement.

Table 9 indicates that those with strong HC characteristics are more likely to believe that the hospitality industry will satisfy their work and career ambitions. HC was joined by HI and VC, and each explained a significant, albeit smaller, amount of variance in the dependent variable.

### Table 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Comfort independent</th>
<th>Stimulation</th>
<th>Affiliation</th>
<th>Achievement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HI</td>
<td>.363*</td>
<td>.338*</td>
<td>.028</td>
<td>.148*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>−.035</td>
<td>.124*</td>
<td>−.188*</td>
<td>.352*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VC</td>
<td>−.157*</td>
<td>.030</td>
<td>.214*</td>
<td>.284*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>.079</td>
<td>.041</td>
<td>.369*</td>
<td>.106*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*aCorrelation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

*bCorrelation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

### Table 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Standardized coefficient β</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HI</td>
<td>.365</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VC</td>
<td>−.153</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$R^2 = .169$. Dependent variable: Comfort-independent.

### Table 5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Standardized coefficient β</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HI</td>
<td>.337</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>.122</td>
<td>.007</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$R^2 = .129$. Dependent variable: Stimulation.

### Table 6

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Standardized coefficient β</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>.370</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VC</td>
<td>.213</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>−.186</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$R^2 = .217$. Dependent variable: Affiliation.
6. Discussion

In respect to Question 1, it is clear that there is a relationship between the two frameworks, cultural orientation and work values; however, the correlations are not strong or widespread, in that distinct clusters of cultural patterns are involved in predicting the various work value components. These findings also add support to the conceptualisation of the cultural patterns framework, in that there is evidence of convergence between similar components within each model.

For example, HC and VC supposedly reflect the individual as merged, or as part of the in-group, with the former emphasising equality and the latter serving and sacrificing for others. As expected, these are positively correlated with the affiliation component (see Table 2), while the competitive, independent characteristics of VI express a negative relationship with the same component. An inspection of the remaining output indicates similar patterns, and given that content validity of the
cultural framework has already been established, these findings also support the convergent validity of the model.

From a practitioner's perspective, these findings have a number of implications. By comparison, those with an HI cultural pattern seek the most out of work and value a job that allows autonomy, a variety of challenging tasks, and pleasant working conditions with prospects of good pay and promotion. In many respects these are desirable managerial qualities; however, finding entry-level jobs in the hospitality industry that can satisfy these needs may be problematic, particularly if there are many employees within an organisation that share the same cultural characteristics.

This issue should not be underestimated, as the behavioural consequences of not being able to satisfy work values have been linked to a reduction in motivation and dissatisfaction (Hertzberg et al., 1956). Apart from providing acceptable work conditions, human resources management techniques such as job rotation, vertical and horizontal job enrichment and a variety of training programs, could be used to motivate and retain employees with strong HI preferences.

For those with strong VI characteristics, achievement and stimulation components are more important. These individuals value a clean environment, good relations with superiors and some managerial responsibility, and need to be mentally alert and creative. Given that there is no relationship between VI and the comfort–independent component, aspects such as pay and lifestyle outside of work are not a priority for this type, and, taken together, VI types may be easier to manage than HI. A possible concern with VI relates to the inverse relationship with affiliation values, as teamwork and an inclination to help others are important attributes in the production and consumption of most hospitality products.

From a HC perspective, helping others and contributing to harmonious relationships are important aspects of the work setting, and the hospitality industry would appear to suit individuals with strong HC characteristics. Complementing this finding is a small but significant need for comfort–independent and achievement components, and taken together, this combination would appear to balance the excesses and gaps associated with HI and VI.

What is not known is how those with a strong HC orientation would perform or behave in settings where interpersonal relationships were strained and this would need to be monitored. Moreover, as stimulation values are not important outcomes of work for HC, jobs that require some kind of creative input and are mentally demanding may not suit individuals with these cultural patterns.

Preferences for affiliation and achievement, no preference for stimulation, and an inverse relationship with the comfort–independent component indicate that employees with VC characteristics have another distinct set of needs. In this instance, the presence of affiliation needs differs from HC in that it has less to do with equality and more to do with serving and sacrificing characteristics. Individuals with strong VC patterns may be more committed to the firm and more suitable in customer contact roles than others; however, further study would be necessary to confirm this.

Question 2 aimed to determine which dimensions of the two frameworks best-predicted work satisfaction and career aspirations, and it is clear that the
The explanatory power of both models are quite low. The components of the WVI, which has been used extensively for career guidance and job counselling purposes, accounted for only 11.6% of the variance in the dependent variable, indicating that factors outside the realm of this study exert considerably more influence.

Despite spending an average of 12 months working in the hospitality industry, and given that most turnover occurs in the first month (Woods, 1997), it is surprising to see that the comfort–independent component was the best predictor of work and career-aspiration satisfaction. Surprising, because factors influencing employee turnover in the hospitality industry have been reported to include low pay and poor working conditions, qualities that are incongruent with comfort–independent characteristics. The fact that respondents in this study are hospitality management students may explain this anomaly, as their future prospects are perhaps more optimistic than those who do not have formal qualifications.

As mentioned above, the ability to work in a team and get on with colleagues is an important attribute in labour-intensive service industries, so it is perhaps not surprising that the affiliation component was the second strongest predictor. Those who have achievement-type attributes appear least likely to be suited for a career in the hospitality industry.

The information displayed in Table 9 indicates that the cultural pattern of HC is the best predictor of work and career aspiration satisfaction, although the low $R^2$ values caution against the use of cultural patterns as predictor variables. Despite this caveat, the results reported here are still statistically significant, and would indicate that individuals who value comfort–independent attributes with a cultural orientation of HC will be most suited to a career in the hospitality industry.

7. Conclusion and research implications

The aim of this study was to examine the relationship between cultural orientations and work values, and the findings provide a rare insight into the relationship between these two constructs, as cultural orientation of respondents has not referred to their country of origin. Numerous studies that have investigated work/culture dynamics, where, for example, managers from two or more countries provided information on a topic, assume differences to be related to country of origin. Clearly, such an approach is problematic, particularly if the sample is from a country like the US, where respondents could be of many nationalities.

Two research questions were devised to guide the investigation, and in respect to the first, it was established that while the two frameworks were not strongly related, individuals with different cultural patterns did value different outcomes from work. An understanding of these differences will enable managers to enhance selection procedures and design jobs that complement the cultural orientations of individual employees. The findings related to the second research question can also assist managers by providing insights into the characteristics of individuals who are more likely to believe that the hospitality industry will satisfy their work and career aspirations.
From a theoretical perspective, it has been established that cultural orientations and work values are correlated, and of the two instruments that were used in this study, the horizontal and vertical, individualism and collectivism framework has demonstrated sound psychometric properties and appears to be a robust means of discerning differences in cultural orientations in individuals. The WVI components demonstrated acceptable reliability; however, the factor structure found in earlier studies was not replicated here. Moreover, caution needs to be taken when using this instrument for career guidance purposes, as it proved to be a weak predictor of work and career satisfaction in the hospitality industry.

7.1. Limitations

Despite the number of institutions involved in the study, and the extended data collection period, only 562 usable questionnaires were received. The length of the questionnaire (87 items) may have deterred students from responding (participation in the study was entirely voluntary).

The convenient nature of the sampling procedure, and the fact that the majority of the respondents were under 30, weaken the representativeness and generalisability of the findings. However, given that the hospitality industry employs many people in this age bracket, and the absence of research in this area, the findings should be viewed as providing foundation knowledge and a guide for future research activity.

Finally, while the length of time each of the respondents had spent working in the industry is known, the nature of the work is not. For example, some may have been working part-time while studying or undergone a practicum as part of their course, and this should be considered when interpreting the findings related to Question 2.

7.2. Future research

While it has been demonstrated here that there is a clear relationship between cultural orientations and work values, many questions remain. For example, future research could examine how long an individual will tolerate work that is incongruent with their values and identify the possible behavioural consequences: How long will HC or HI tolerate a job that does not meet their need for affiliation and stimulation? And are there differences in the way each would respond in such situations?

There is a need to examine each of the frameworks in conjunction with other organisational factors, such as commitment, work climate or organisation culture. This would overcome the limitation of using only one dependent variable and enable more detailed understandings of the characteristics associated with each of the cultural orientations and work value components. It is unlikely that individuals will have a strong preference for only one cultural orientation, most will probably have a blend of influences, and research that examines the ‘blend’ effect on attitudes or behaviour would be beneficial.

Finally, longitudinal studies could provide insights into the stability of both frameworks over time, and determine whether they are influenced by factors such as
age and changes in social conditions, or by training and development initiatives within organisations.

Acknowledgements

The author would like to thank Damian Morgan from Monash University, Australia, and the Glion Center for Cross-Cultural Hospitality Management Research, for assisting in the early stages of this project.

Appendix A

Creativity: work which permits one to invent new things, design new products, or develop new ideas.
Management: work that permits one to plan and lay out work for others.
Achievement: work that gives one the feeling of accomplishment in doing a job well.
Surroundings: work that is carried out under pleasant conditions; not too hot or too cold, noisy, dirty, etc.
Supervisory relationships: work that is carried out under a supervisor who is fair and with whom one can get along.
Way of life: work that permits one to live the kind of life he/she chooses and to be the type of person he/she wishes to be.
Security: work that provides one with the certainty of having a job even in hard times.
Associates: work that brings one into contact with fellow workers who you like.
Aesthetic: work that permits one to make beautiful things and to contribute beauty to the world.
Prestige: work that gives one standing in the eyes of others and evokes respect.
Independence: work that permits one to work in his/her own way, as quickly or slowly as he/she wishes.
Variety: work that provides an opportunity to do different types of tasks.
Economic return: work that pays well and enables one to have things he/she wants.
Altruism: work that enables one to contribute to the welfare of others.
Intellectual stimulation: work that provides opportunity for independent thinking, and for learning how and why things work.

Appendix B

Horizontal individualism: a cultural pattern where an autonomous self is postulated, but the individual is more or less equal in status with others. The self
is independent and the same as the self of others. The personal characteristic associated with this dimension has also been described as unique.

Horizontal collectivism: a cultural pattern in which the individual sees the self as an aspect of an in-group. That is, the self is merged with the members of the in-group, all of whom are extremely similar to each other. Equality is the essence of this pattern.

Vertical individualism: a cultural pattern in which an autonomous self is postulated, but individuals see each other as different, and inequality is expected. The self is independent and different from the self of others. Competition is an important aspect of this pattern.

Vertical collectivism: a cultural pattern in which the individual sees the self as an aspect of an in-group, but the members of the group are different from each other, some having more status than others. The self is interdependent and different from the self of others. Serving and sacrificing for the in-group is an important aspect of this pattern.

References

Introduction

A number of recent studies have used the term “image” in relation to a tourist destination (Baloglu and McCleary, 1999; Baloglu and Brinberg, 1997; Leisen, 2001; Ahmed, 1996; Echtner and Ritchie, 1993; Javalgi et al., 1992; Gallarza et al., 2002) and much of this work has focused upon image as a segmentation variable, the constituents of a destinations image and destination image measurement. While there have been numerous attempts to define “image”, there have been few attempts to identify how “image” as a construct differs from other commonly used tourism research constructs, such as perceptions or attitudes and for that matter dreams, hallucinations and imagination.

For managers, understanding the distinction between these constructs is of vital importance in order to fully understand their customers’ views regarding a service or product. For example, do questions such as, “what is your perception of London as a tourist destination?” “what is your attitude towards London as a tourist destination?” and “what image comes to mind when you think of London as a tourist destination?”, provide different insights into London as a tourist destination, and if so, how can understanding these differences assist in better managing our customer’s satisfaction levels and buying behaviour? The main aim of this paper therefore is to further develop our understandings of “image” as a construct as it relates to tourism destination management and explore the ensuing practical and theoretical implications.

Image or attitudes?

In reviewing the literature on destination image, Baloglu and Brinberg (1997) concluded that the image construct consisted of two components, cognitive and affective, the cognitive also referred to by the authors as perceptual, was concerned with beliefs and knowledge about an object or destination while the affective was related to feelings or emotions about an object. These authors then suggested that environments and places have perceptual and affective images and that places additionally have an overall image that is a summation of both perceptual and affective components.

By a rather circuitous route, Leisen (2001), arrived at the view that affective associations greatly influenced the image an individual’s has of a destination, and therefore destination choice, and she sought to determine what personal factors influenced such affective associations. The author
developed a scale that captured attributes that included climate, recreational activities, cultural traditions and cuisine and requested respondents to state the extent they agreed or disagreed with the various items. A question that ascertained respondent’s intentions to visit the destination was also included.

For Ahmed (1996), tourists perceive many images of their destination and the images influence their attitudes and behaviour. What this author appears to be suggesting is that an overall measure of destination image limits marketers ability to devise positioning strategies, and that ideally positive and negative images of destination attributes should be investigated. This author operationalised the image construct by rating respondents perception of 20 items on a bi-polar adjective Likert scale, where 1 represented the highest positive impression and 5, the highest possible negative impression. A factor analysis produced a four-factor solution and these were labelled, “outdoor recreational resources”, “outdoor recreational activities”, “culture” and “nightlife”.

All of the studies identified above have considered an affective component in the operationalisation of the image construct although only Baloglu and Brinberg (1997) have used a range of positive and negative emotions to capture it. The other studies did not appear to tap the emotional aspect at all, instead employed items that represented respondents’ perceptions of more physical characteristics of a destination. Moreover, while all of these authors cited numerous definitions of “image”, they did not arrive at a meaningful conceptualisation of the image construct that distinguished it from other constructs such as perceptions or attitudes, and in many instances the terms were used interchangeably. In fact, taken together, “image” as it has been conceptualised in these studies fits more closely with the three-component model of attitudes that has been popular in the psychology literature since the 1940s (Breckler, 1984).

The basic thesis of this model suggests that attitudes are evaluative statements formed through the interaction of cognitive, affective and behavioural components, where the cognitive component represents the beliefs and knowledge one holds regarding an object or person, the affective component represents ones feeling towards an object (sad, happy etc.) and the behavioural component is how one acts towards the object, and numerous studies have supported this conceptualisation (Boozin et al., 1991).

Moreover, recent research that has examined the affective component has indicated that emotions are better predictors of destination visitation and customer purchase intentions than the more commonly used cognitive component (White, 2003; Yu and Dean, 2001). The question is, are these authors actually measuring images or attitudes?

### Functional/Holistic Image Conceptualisation

For Echtner and Ritchie (1993), “… creating and managing an appropriate destination image are critical to effective positioning and marketing strategy” (p. 1), and these authors provided a broader conceptualisation of destination image than those discussed above. Their model resulted from a review of literature related to destination image as well as corporate, product and brand image and in essence, image for these authors consisted of two components, one attribute-based, the other holistic, and both of these contained functional, and “more abstract” psychological characteristics. Additionally, for these authors, images could be based on unique features, events, feelings or auras associated with a destination.

The tangible/attribute component of their model was operationalised by a scale that included items such as climate, price and friendliness of the locals, items similar to those used elsewhere to capture cognitive assessments (Baloglu and McCleary, 1999). The psychological/holistic component was captured by a single item “how would you describe the atmosphere or mood that you would expect to experience while visiting XXX?”, and responses to this item included emotions such as excited, fun and happy, and as such, resembled Baloglu and Brinberg’s (1997) affective component. The uniqueness component was determined by requesting respondents to list distinctive aspects of the various destinations.

The functional/holistic component of their model, which was posited to consist of a “mental picture” of the physical characteristics of a destination, was captured by a item that requested respondents to state “what images or characteristics” came to mind when thinking of the destination. Whether respondent had an actual picture of the characteristics in mind when they wrote their response would be difficult to determine and of course if they had a picture, the question is, is it any more powerful or revealing than their perception, or is it just a perception of a characteristic that was in some way different from the options included on the tangible/attribute scale. Moreover, it appears that for these authors there are images within images, in that their overall model was designed to conceptualise destination image, yet their functional/holistic component was
based on respondents image of tangible destination characteristics. At length, there are many questions remaining about what constitutes an “image” let alone, how it can be defined, and the following discussion will now turn towards philosophy and cognitive psychology in an attempt to gain other insights into this issue.

**Image as a cognitive function**

From the time when Aristotle wrote De Anima and Parva Naturalia, and until the twentieth century, the mental image, or quasi-perceptual experience as it has been termed, has been viewed as the primary form of human mental representation. Descartes’ theory of imagery ascribed a kind of spiritual function to the mental image process in that it was viewed as an immaterial and scientific inaccessible soul (Thomas, 1999). For others mental imagery has been described as an experience that resembles a perceptual experience but which “...occurs in the absence of the appropriate stimuli for the relevant perception” (Zalta, 1997) and imagery has been regarded as central for all thought processes and linked to memory and motivation, and representative of higher order thought processes.

The relationship between imagery and perception has been hotly debated in the psychology literature since the early 1970s and the dominant positions of this debate are known as pictorialism and descriptionism. These will now be reviewed along with a view that has attracted relatively less scholarly attention and has been referred to as traditional psychology. In effect, the simplest way of distinguishing between these positions is to recognise that for pictorialists and descriptivist, mental images are unconscious structures that cause a certain behaviour, while the traditional psychology approach views them as conscious states that generally produce effects that differ from perceptions (Birch, 2003).

Supporting the pictorial view, Kosslyn and Pomerantz (1977) developed a theory that proposed that visual imagery resembles visual perception, and brain scanning techniques have provided evidence that visual mental images are closely related to areas of the brain activated during the perception of visual stimuli (Kosslyn, 1994) and Gardner (1987) summarises this position as such:

...Images have two major components: The surface representation is the quasi-pictorial entity in the active memory that is accompanied by the subjective experience of having an image. The images are likened to displays produced on a cathode-ray tube by a computer program operating on stored data. In other words, the images are temporary spatial displays in active memory that are generated from more abstract representations housed in long-term memory. These initial abstract representations consist of propositions and other kind of non-imagistic information, such as that embodied in concepts (p. 327).

The construction of this quasi-picture occurs at a neural location that is termed the “visual buffer” and when it is formed it is recognised by consciousness as an image and information that was embedded in the long-term memory can be drawn from it. Another function called the “mind’s eye” reads and interprets this information from the surface display (Thomas, 1999). The structures and functions that create this process are said to be influential in certain kinds of problem solving and may be useful in forming conclusions, and a considerable amount of evidence supports this position (Kosslyn, 1980; Kosslyn, 1994; Finke et al., 1989; Shephard and Metzler, 1971).

While Kosslyn recognised the existence of quasi-perceptual experiences as being a distinct, non-language form of representation stored in a long-term memory function, other scholars have not agreed. For Sartre, “...an image teaches nothing because any information it contains must have been put there, and thus have already been in the mind of the imaginer” (Thomas, 2002). Further, from a philosophic perspective, two important questions challenge the role and function of images in cognitive processes; these questions are, do images refer? And, do images have content or meaning? If they cannot refer or do not have content then some other mechanism must be responsible for providing the reference and content (Birch, 2003). For example, an image should resemble the object that it is an image of, so if A is a mental image of a cup and B is the cup, then A resembles B and B resembles A, therefore, A refers to B and B refers to A; the reference is purely arbitrary. In relation to content, as images require an interpretation to function as images, they themselves cannot be considered to have content.

Pylyshyn (1973), advocating what has become to be known as the descriptivist position on the imagery debate posits that images have nothing to do with recollection or manipulation of information but are rather epiphenomenon that result from stored descriptive data (Birch, 2003). For Pylyshyn (1981), the data structures, that have been likened to an inner language (Foder, 1975), that create mental images can be viewed as descriptive propositions expressing relevant perceptual scenes. Furthermore, these language like representations have been held by descriptivist as sufficient to account for all cognitive processes. At length, for descriptivist, images can be reduced...
Destination image: to see or not to see?

Christopher J. White

The implications for destination image measurement as it relates to Kosslyn's model is that an image is similar to a perception but rather than being formed in response to a stimuli, that is, asking an individual about their views of a destination directly after they had been there, an individual must form an image from memory. Obviously, a reliance on memory suggest that some distortion or deterioration of real-world precepts could be possible and in fact mental images may just be generalised, abstract representations of precepts that are also far less detailed than visual perceptions.

There appears to be little evidence that an image, as defined by the pictorialist approach, can be accessed via an individuals affective reactions towards a destination as Baloglu and Brinberg (1997) propose, or that there are holistic abstract psychological feelings or auras embedded in the image (Echtner and Ritchie, 1993). Moreover, if imagery is used in solving certain kinds of problems, merely knowing that it can, does not guarantee that this function can be applied to the question of destination image, and if so, describe in what way or indicate how, this information can be accessed. If one were to adopt the descriptivist approach it is clear that images are of little importance and have no relation to logic and meanings and as such would be of absolutely no use in understanding or predicting an individuals disposition towards a destination.

An alternative perspective on the image debate was proposed by Richardson in 1969 and has been referred to as traditional psychology (Birch, 2003). His views differed from the pictorialist and descriptivist positions in that he insisted that there may not be a universal human cognition; some people may record their experiences as images while others may use words, and that mental images are conscious entities that can be categorised into different types, and the types differ subjectively according to the degree of conscious control one has over the image and the degree of image vividness. For example, an after-image or flash back to a traumatic event is usually outside an individuals control as are extreme hallucinogenic states. Conversely mental images of memory, imagination and thought, more closely resemble mental topics that provide an awareness of something that was, or something that may be.

Table I displays an expanded version of Richardson's image types as they relate to the degree of individual control.

The idea that a range of image types may exist has important implications for destination managers and researchers in that there may be different types of images (memory, imagination, thought etc.) involved in an overall image, and each particular type could have unique or particular relationships with a whole range of variables related to consumer travel behaviour. For example, there may be a relationship between the various image types presented above, and cognition and affect. Perhaps higher levels of cognitive processing are involved in images types where an individual has a high degree of control, such as "thought images", and higher levels of affect in images types that are not so much reliant on facts or reason, such as "imagination images". An investigation of these questions could provided a link between existing tourism destination image research and the work on image from the traditional psychology school.

The notion that images can differ in vividness, as suggested by Richardson, has attracted the attention of psychologists since the early 1900 (Friedman and Krus, 1983). The Betts questionnaire upon mental imagery was designed to capture the vividness of self-generated fantasy by requesting respondents to imagine a set of items and indicate on a seven-point scale how vivid each appeared (Koukounas and McCabe, 2001). This scale was later reduced to 35 items (Sheehan, 1967) and has been applied to variety of research topics. One such study reported a significant positive relationship between high vividness scores and achievement motivation (Friedman and Krus, 1983), while others have found a significant relationship between subjective sexual arousal and the capacity to form vivid images (Koukounas and McCabe, 2001). These findings attest to the importance of the vividness/behaviour relationship and may in fact open up further possibilities for destination image researchers. For instance, understanding the relationship between an individual's image vividness score and destination visitation intentions or travel motivations, may provide marketing researchers and practitioners with a more powerful explanatory, or segmentation tool.

Finally, the question of whether "image" as a term and a concept is any different from a perception or an attitude, consists of cognitive and affective components, embellishes feelings or auras, are merely words or are conscious entities that can be categorised into different types requires much more empirical attention before firm conclusions can be made. The work of Richardson discussed above, provides an optimistic platform for researchers interested in examining the image construct from perspectives that have to date not been considered in main stream tourism literature.
and hopefully the ideas and possibilities raised in this piece will stimulate and provide an initial direction for such activity.

Until more work is done to clarify understandings of what an image is, practitioners are recommended to focus on consumers attitudes of a destination or product and the tri-component model of attitudes, that consists of perceptions, feelings and intentions to buy or visit, is a relatively more understood, reliable and robust model. These components are rather straightforward to operationalise and certainly the work of Baloglu and Brinberg (1997), and more recently, White (2003), and Yu and Dean (2001) have tested scales related to the three components and have demonstrated that they are easy to administer and provide a reliable and valid means of obtaining necessary marketing and management intelligence.

| Table I Image types and their relation to degree of individual control |
|------------------------|-----------------|----------------|
| **Image type**         | **Control**     | **Description**                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| After-images           | No              | After-images are generally experienced as indistinct patches of colour that seem to “float” before the eyes. After-images are often caused by staring at bright lights or brightly coloured objects |
| Eidetic                | No              | Eidetic images, on the other hand, can be triggered by what appears to be simple visual inspection of a physical object. When the object is removed, a person capable of forming an eidetic image will retain a detailed memory image. Eidetic images appear to fade in most cases at rates that are not fully controllable by the subject |
| Hallucinogenic         | No              | Hallucinogenic imagery is only loosely controlled by conscious intentions to have imagery conform to the expectations of reality. An important difference between the psychotic and the normal person is that the normal person can eventually recognise that a hallucination is a mistake. In the less extreme forms of hallucinogenic states, the subject is completely aware that the events being experienced are not real |
| Memory                 | Yes             | Memory images are defined as those deriving directly from previous personal experience. After-images must, and hallucinations may, of course, also derive directly from previous experience, but memory images are under more control |
| Imagination            | Yes             | Imagination images are similar to memory images in terms of vividness and having no location in space, but they differ in that they contain elements that are not part of personal experience. In general, the contents of imagination images are consciously directed by us |
| Projected              | Yes             | Projected images are a special category, sharing some of the characteristics of eidetic images, imagination, and memory images. Projected images are those images of objects or shapes as they are imagined to be in the perceptual field projected images are used in solving spatial location problems in our environment |
| Thought                | Yes             | Thought imagery involves more than just an intentional shift (a shift in “attitude”) directed toward a single presentation. While imagination is important in that it may be used to free one’s self from previous suppositions, thought tends to re-impose requirements Thought images, then, give rise to non-imaged thought processes. These processes involve deriving the reasoned consequences of situations that were symbolically indicated by images |

Source: Taken from Birch (2003) (www.gis.net/tbirch/mi2.htm)

References


Abstract

Purpose – The purpose of this paper is to generate insights into the area of tourism destination image.

Design/methodology/approach – This paper was based on earlier work that identified a number of gaps in the literature related to destination image, and a qualitative design that incorporated structured interviews generated the results.

Findings – Indicated that when individuals (45) were requested to respond to questions that included the terms image and perceptions of a destination, the responses were mostly identical. There was, however, some differences in the content of a small but significant number of responses (15) to the image question. Moreover, these individuals were more animated than the others, and six of them used colours in their response.

Research limitations/implications – The representativeness and generalisibility of the findings are limited due to the small and convenient sample that formed the basis of this study.

Practical implications – These findings provide interesting possibilities for tourism destination researchers and question whether managers and marketers should use the term image when gathering the information.

Originality/value – This paper has contributed to the development of theory related to destination image and has presented insights that have not yet been considered in the tourism literature.

Keywords Opinion polls, Tourism, Qualitative market research

Paper type Research paper

Introduction

A recent review of literature related tourism destination image (White, 2004) suggested that the conceptualisation and operationalisation of image as a construct was fragmented and incomplete. Some authors viewed it as a cognitive assessment of various dimensions of destination attributes (Ahmed, 1996), another incorporated a behavioural element (Leisen, 2001) and yet another conceptualised image as consisting of a cognitive, or perceptual component and an affective, or feeling aspect (Baloglu and McCleary, 1999). Perhaps the most elaborate model of image was developed by Echtner and Ritchie (1993), who after reviewing tourism and marketing literature related to image, proposed that an image consisted of two components, one attribute based and the other holistic, both of which encompassed functional and psychological characteristics.

From an operational perspective, two of these studies measured, in one form or another, respondents perceptions of destination attributes, such as nightlife or cuisine (Ahmed, 1996; Leisen, 2001), another measured respondents perceptions (cognitions) and their affective dispositions towards the destination (Baloglu and McCleary, 1999).
while Echtner and Ritchie (1993) captured, amongst other things, respondents perceptions of physical attributes, the way they feel about the destination (affect) and a single item that requested respondents to state what images or characteristics came to mind when thinking of the destination.

At length, it is evident that image as a construct does mean different things to different people, but an important question that has not been adequately addressed, is that, is there anything to be gained, from a theoretical or practical standpoint of understanding the image an individual has of an object or destination? Perhaps understanding an individual’s perceptions, emotions or attitudes, constructs that are well known to social researchers, are sufficient.

The debate over whether an image is an image, that can be recalled and used to solve certain kinds of problems (pictorialists), or just a coloured word like representation that resembles a perception (descriptivist), has been hotly contested in the cognitive psychology domain for many years (Pylyshyn, 1973; Kosslyn, 1994), and has largely focused on the structures that form mental images. Unfortunately, while the vast majority of knowledge generated from these two dominant positions within the debate does little to address the image issue as it relates to tourism destination planning or management (White, 2004), a third perspective offers some possibilities.

After arguing against the notion of a universal cognition, Richardson (1969), proposed that some people may record experiences as images and others may use words. Moreover, for him, mental images are conscious entities that can be categorised by the degree of conscious control one has over the image content, and the degree of image vividness. For example, in extreme cases of hallucinogenic imagery, the individual is unlikely to recognise that the hallucination is a mistake, whereas in memory or thought imagery the mind has taken something under consideration in a more controlled way and the “something”, gives the content meaning.

The degree of vividness of an image has received some empirical attention with one study reporting a significant positive relationship between high vividness scores and achievement motivation (Friedman and Krus, 1983). Both the degree of vividness, and image type could make new and interesting independent variables for destination image researchers and the possibilities that exist here have been elaborated on elsewhere (White, 2004).

Despite the interesting possibilities arising out of the cognitive psychology debate, the issue of whether the content of an image differs from the content of a perception still remains elusive. That is to say, it is not yet clear whether any difference would exist in the content of an individual’s response depending upon whether the individual was requested to state their image of a destination or their perceptions of it. More explicitly, the aim of this paper is to determine whether a discernable difference, in the nature of responses to questions that incorporate the terms image and perception exist, and if so, what are the implication for researchers and destination managers.

The study
In order to address this problem, the present author conducted 45 interviews. There was no scientific basis for determining the size or composition of the sample and certainly no firm propositions established to guide the inquiry. A qualitative research design was deemed appropriate for this study because the available theory as it relates
specifically to tourism destination image is “immature”, and as such, there was a felt need to explore and describe the phenomena to assist in theory development (Creswell, 1994). In adopting this approach the present author recognised the limitations of this paradigm in respect to the representativeness and generalisability of the findings, however, the absence of positivistic rigidity allows for more flexibility in terms of the data collection process and interpretation of findings. Of the 45 participants, 29 different nationalities were represented and there were approximately equal numbers of male and female respondents and all respondents were fluent in English. The destination chosen to be the focus of the inquiry was Sri Lanka but it could have been anywhere as the destination is irrelevant to the purpose of this study.

Participants were asked two questions. The first, “What is your perception of Sri Lanka as a tourism destination?” And the second, “What image comes to mind when you think of Sri Lanka as a tourist destination?” And this form of question was chosen because it was similar to what Echtner and Ritchie (1993) used to measure image in their study. Anyone who had been to Sri Lanka was excluded from the study so in this sense there was no external stimulus in the form of actual visitation experience to influence participant’s responses. The interviews were not intended to probe deep knowledge of the subject area, in terms of how the perception or images were formed, and they lasted only a few minutes each. The words “your perception” and “what image”, in the first and second questions, respectively, were in all cases repeated twice to emphasise the difference between the two questions.

Preliminary interviews were conducted by the researcher so as to acquire a better awareness, or gain additional insights into the problem at hand by being a participant observer in the interviewee/interviewer interaction. This stage was not intended to clarify whether the participant understood the questions, because they were few and uncomplicated, but to “pick-up” on peripheral, non-verbal messages that may enrich the overall study.

As a result of this process two insights were revealed. Firstly, all of the trial participants hesitated for a number of seconds after they were asked the second question, and secondly, some participants were observed to be more animated when attempting to respond to that same question. It was as if they knew what they wanted to say but could not find the appropriate words, and therefore relied on their hands or facial expressions to construct the meaning. This awareness allowed the researcher to take these insights into consideration when conducting the study properly.

Clearly, the design of this study lacks the rigour of an experimental or clinical approaches however such on the spot solicitation of responses often characterises much of hospitality and tourism market research. Moreover, as it was not the intention to generalise the findings across specific market segments, the small and convenient sample that provided the data for this investigation was deemed to be suitable for the exploratory “work in progress” nature of this study.

Insights and discussion
In relation to the perception question, all of the respondents stated attributes such as beaches, culture, elephants, friendly people, dangerous, poverty, political unrest, nature and food. Mostly functional characteristics of a destination and these resembled items in Baloglu and McCleary’s (1999) cognitive scale and Echtner and Ritchie’s (1993) tangible/attribute component. All the participants had stated both positive and
negative attributes. For the second question, 30 of the participants pretty much restated the same or similar responses that they had made to the perception question, with one notable exception. That being, only five restated the negative attributes, and this may have occurred because the majority of participants had an aversion to dwelling on, or mentioning negative aspects more than once. Nevertheless, there were less negative associations from all participants when responding to the image question.

Interestingly, the remaining 15 participants’ responses to the image question were based on more generic descriptors. The most frequent of these were exotic, paradise and tropical, terms that are more abstract and general than the more specific descriptions that characterised responses to the perception question. Of these 15 cases, six actually referred to colours in their description; four mentioned green and one mentioned green and blue. Moreover, it was noticed that all of these 15 participants were more animated in their response to the image question compared to the other participants. For instance, while one participant was mentally searching for words, she was using her hands to “mould in air”, the shape of a dome, a shape characteristic of Eastern religious architecture. The first, and only word she used was “Ceylon”, the former name of that country, and this held strong meanings for her that was unable to be expressed in words.

As mentioned above, it was evident during the preliminary interviews that participants hesitated for some seconds before responding to the image question and it was established that all participants (45) adopted this practice. This may have been due to the fact that both questions appeared similar and it took some time for participants to recognise that the difference was related to the terms image and perception. It may also have been possible that participants actually tried to recall and use an image, in some kind of picture form in order to address the question, in line with the pictorialists view described above, and further research would be necessary to explore this issue. Table I summarises these findings.

In analysing these findings it appears that the majority of participants (30) in this study used the same type of words to describe the destination regardless of whether they were requested to state their perceptions or image. These findings converge with those of Echtner and Ritchie (1993) who reported that when requesting what images were evoked when thinking of the destination the most frequently stated responses were beaches (80.5 per cent), tropical climate (61.1 per cent), sun (44.3 per cent) and ocean (30.2 per cent), and while these were slightly different to the items included in their tangibles scale, they still reflected tangible characteristics of a destination.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nature of response</th>
<th>Question 1</th>
<th>Question 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>+ cognitive specific</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>− cognitive specific</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Generic</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Affective</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>−</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Animated</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colour</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hesitation</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table I.** Summary of responses to the perception and image questions

**Note:** $n = 45$
Tropical, a more generic descriptor was mentioned however it was associated with a more detailed descriptor, climate. In some sense this provides support for the view that for many individuals the use of the word image in a question is unlikely to provides more detailed or richer content than using the word perception.

One point of interest in these findings was that 15 of the participants who used more generic descriptors in replying to the image question were more animated in doing so, and it is possible that these individuals could have been using different mental processes when responded to this question. This may be a result of attempting to extract information from the long-term memory, in that the generic or generalised nature of the responses were due to fading memory effects. This particular finding suggested that while there may be some different processes occurring from one question to another, for some individuals, the actual content is unlikely to contain richer or more meaningful information.

Another interesting insight raised here, was the participants’ use of colour in describing an image, and that, the colour was predominately green. It is not known whether those participants actually saw a vivid green at that time, or green was more a word like representation that has obvious connections to tropical type environments. It should again be pointed out that a colour was mentioned by only 6 of the 15 who responded with generic statements to the image question and exactly what the relationship was between colour and generic descriptions can only be speculated upon here. One possibility may be that colour is the last aspect of a memory to fade; that is to say, the longer the information is stored in the memory the more likely the finer details will appear less clear and distinct and the residue will appear as a colour. As age was not controlled in this study, future research in this area could determine what influence the effects of aging has on the shape and form of responses to questions relating to image.

Another possibility is that colour could also have some richer symbolic meaning. If as some have posited (Jung), that images are connected to a psychic well or collective unconscious then maybe what we are looking for here is not picture like representations or a linguistic description, but more symbolic representations, that manifest as colour. Perhaps for some individuals, destinations have a particular kind of colour or blend of colours associated with them and it may be possible to observe an individual’s disposition toward a destination through colour descriptions or selection, and future research could investigate the relationship between colour, vividness of colour and destination appeal or visitation intentions.

Conclusion
In concluding this study, it was recognised that destination image had received considerable attention in the tourism literature over the last two decades and the conceptualisation and operationalisation of the construct has varied considerably within the tourism discipline. Insights from philosophy and psychology were drawn upon in an attempt to broaden understandings of the image construct as it relates destination management, and this review suggested that the dominant focus of this research was on the structures and processes that formed images, and there was little evidence to suggest that an image was much different than a perception. An alternative approach accepted that images can exist and could be classified according to the degree of vividness and degree of control an individual has over them and a number of suggestions for future destination image research were identified.
Despite the possibilities that these suggestions offered, the question of whether using the term image or perception would evoke different responses, still remained elusive, and this issue was explored using an interview/observation approach. For most participants, the content of their responses remained unchanged when addressing an image or perception type question although a significant number of participants appeared to be using different mental functions and expressions when dealing with the question that involved image, and these included the use of colour and animation. Some further research directions were provided on the basis of these findings.

References
Phase 3
Towards an Understanding of the Relationship between Mood, Emotions, Service Quality and Customer Loyalty Intentions

CHRISTOPHER J. WHITE

The purpose of this study was to explore the relationship between mood states, emotions, perceptions of service quality and consumer loyalty in an extended service context. A quantitative research design, using multivariate statistical techniques, facilitated the data analysis. The sample consisted of 220 students from a private university in Switzerland. The results indicated that all of the variables were significantly correlated and mood state was demonstrated to influence the way judgements were formed. The contribution of mood to explaining the variance in loyalty was however minimal.

INTRODUCTION

Recent work in the realm of customer satisfaction has highlighted the key role of affect in the formation of customer satisfaction judgements [Andreassen and Lindestad, 1993; Athanassopoulos et al., 2001; Bagozzi et al., 1999; Bloemer and de Ruyter, 1998; Stauss and Neuhaus, 1997]. Moreover, it has been established that affect in conjunction with cognitive assessments of a service encounter explain more variance in customer behavioural intentions than either separately [Liljander and Strandvik, 1997; White and Scandale, 2005; White and Yu, 2005].

The view that affective processes involve or somehow include emotions is rarely disputed and while emotions have been widely used to operationalise affect as it relates to behavioural intentions, little attention has been paid to another component of affect [Frijda, 1993], mood. The aim of this study is to review the literature on mood, in particular the role of mood in influencing customer judgements and intentions and to identify gaps or questions that can be empirically addressed.

When it comes to understanding the various themes, perspectives and opportunities relating to mood research, thanks should go to Harri Luomala and Martti Laaksonen [2000]. Through a clear and comprehensive literature review spanning six decades, these authors have detailed the evolution of mood definitions and
identified studies that have focused on the behavioural consequences of negative mood. At length, and in terms of the former, two main themes appear to emerge; the first attempts to answer the question ‘what are moods?’, and tends to focus on the dimensionality of the mood construct. The second suggests that moods have a purpose or function.

A further inspection of the 33 mood definitions considered by Luomala and Laaksonen [2000] suggests that moods are affective states that include emotions but can be differentiated from emotions in a number of identifiable dimensions. Namely, moods are less intense, longer lasting and are largely unintentional in that they occur in the absence of a referent object. They also incorporate some element of cognitive processing or are ‘moderately mediated’ by cognition. It is well known that cognitive processes which include perceptions or beliefs, and emotions, have measurable influences on behaviour [Bagozzi et al., 1999; de Ruyter et al., 1998; Inman et al., 1997; Morris et al., 2002; White, 2004; Yu and Dean, 2001], but what is the relationship between mood and behaviour?

**MOOD AND BEHAVIOUR**

In an effort to develop an integrative model of mood and behaviour, Gendolla [2000] addressed two assumptions that exist within the mood literature. The first was that mood informs and influences cognitive processes such as behaviour-related judgements and appraisals, and the second is that an individual is hedonically driven and will seek to maintain a positive mood (pleasure) or avoid pain (repair negative mood). Moods also, in the view of this author, are not themselves motivational but impact on the motivation process, and therefore behaviour, and have no stable motivational effects.

Despite the purported instability of the impact of mood on motivation, findings reported in studies related to mood and behaviour suggest that there are some consistent patterns. Gardner [1985], for example, demonstrated congruence between mood states and judgements of services, and it has been established elsewhere that individuals in a positive mood make more optimistic judgements about evaluations and expectations than those in negative moods [Forgas, 1995; Hsu and Liu, 1998].

Additional evidence has indicated that individuals in positive moods recall more positive and fewer negative experiences than those in negative moods [Prakash, 1984–1985] and while some incongruent judgements are possible [Luomala and Laaksonen, 2000], congruency has been generally accepted as the default effect [Gendolla, 2000]. From an information processing perspective, evidence suggests that individuals in negative moods are likely to pay more attention to the problem at hand than those in positive moods [Shapiro et al., 2002].

Despite the considerable attention given to understanding the impact of mood on psychological constructs such as memory, judgement and decision making [Isen, 1984], problem solving, compulsive behaviour and stress [Luomala and Laaksonen, 2000], little has been done that specifically focuses on customer satisfaction with
service encounters and even fewer have examined the impact of mood on consumer loyalty [White and Scandale, 2005].

In developing a conceptual framework of the interrelationship between mood and consumer satisfaction, Prakash [1984–1985] hypothesised that individuals in a positive mood would be more satisfied than those in either neutral or negative moods. This view was supported and further developed by Knowles et al. [1993], who posited a congruent relationship between mood state and the ability to recall accurate information about a service encounter. Additionally, they proposed a congruent effect between mood and evaluations of a service encounter and behavioural responses toward the encounter.

In a study that focused on the relationship between customer satisfaction, value attainment, positive mood and loyalty, de Ruyter and Bloemer [1999] posited that mood was independent from the affective component of satisfaction in that mood was related to the overall service process, whereas the emotional component was related specifically to the service offering. The findings revealed that there was a significant relationship between positive mood and loyalty and that there was a significant positive relationship between satisfaction and positive mood. As customer satisfaction has been shown to have both cognitive and affective components [White and Yu, 2005], it is unclear from the findings in this study which component influenced the relationship. Moreover, the addition of positive mood to satisfaction made a minimal contribution in explaining the variance in loyalty.

Further support for the congruence effect was provided by Mattila and Enz [2002] who found that consumers’ post-purchase mood was positively related to their overall evaluation of the organisation and the actual service encounter. However, in this case, and in contrast to observations made by de Ruyter and Bloemer [1999], mood was found to have higher correlations with the service encounter than the overall assessment. Additionally, mood was found to be a better predictor of service encounter and overall evaluations than customers’ displayed emotions. Mattila and Enz [2002] did not consider the impact of mood on customer loyalty.

**SUMMARY AND RESEARCH QUESTIONS**

Despite considerable attention paid in the psychology domain to understanding mood, surprisingly little has been done in the services management realm, particularly as it relates to customer loyalty, and this study aims to further extend knowledge in this area. To date, there are no studies that have examined the relationship between mood and self-reported emotions in a customer service context. Mood has also been linked to cognitive processes, and posited to inform judgements and perceptions, although there is little empirical evidence available to support this purported link. As such, the following research question has been formulated to address this gap.

**Research question 1**  
*What is the relationship between mood, perceptions of service quality, emotions and loyalty?*. The link between emotions, cognitive processes assessed through service
quality perceptions and customer loyalty has been extensively tested and well documented, and while it has been proposed that individuals in different mood states will exhibit different behavioural responses towards a service, the influence of mood states on emotional and cognitive processes in predicting customer loyalty is unknown. As such, research question 2 aims to address this gap.

Research question 2
In what way do positive and negative mood states influence the role of emotions and perceptions of service quality in predicting customer loyalty?

Some studies have indicated that mood as a predictor variable made a negligible contribution to the explanation of variance in customer loyalty while another study found that mood was the best predictor of dependent variables that were closely related to loyalty. The following research question aims to clarify this uncertainty.

Research question 3
Will the addition of mood to emotions and perceptions of service quality explain more variance in consumer loyalty? The study will now proceed with an overview of each of variables involved in the study and the identification of appropriate instruments.

METHOD
There are four constructs under consideration in this study, service quality, emotions, mood and loyalty, and each of these will now be discussed. Service quality has been described as being similar to but not the same as an attitude and it is believed to result from a comparison between a consumer’s expectations of a service and their perceptions of the actual performance, although some have questioned whether the expectations component was theoretically useful [Cronin and Taylor, 1992]. Perceptions of service quality have been posited to consist of five determinants and therefore evaluation of service quality will be based on the extent to which a consumer believes a service provider has performed on each of these [Parasuraman et al., 1994].

The assessment of service quality has been seen to be largely a cognitive process [Choi et al., 2004; Montoya and Horton, 2004] and as mood has been posited to consist of or be related to cognitive processes, the inclusion of an item to capture participants’ cognition was included. As such, participants were requested to agree or disagree with the statement, ‘Overall, the quality of service I have received at . . . has been of a very high standard’. The item was accompanied by a seven-point scale.

As mentioned above, the role of emotions in predicting customer behavioural intentions has began to attract considerable attention and number of well tested emotion frameworks have existed in the marketing realm for many years [see Izard, 1977]. More recently, emotion frameworks developed specifically for service contexts have demonstrated consistent findings across many studies and provide a valid and reliable way of predicting a broad spectrum of customer purchase intentions [White and Yu, 2005]. The framework adopted for this study was chosen because it
had been applied in a similar context, that is, an educational institution, and had demonstrated strong psychometric properties. The scale can be found in Appendix 1.

Early research into the area of customer behavioural intentions was limited by the ability to fully account for the variety of possible behaviours a consumer may adopt. Cronin and Taylor [1992] used a one-item measure of purchase intentions while Boulding et al. [1993] focused on purchase intentions and willingness to recommend. A more comprehensive treatment of the customer behavioural intentions construct was proposed by Parasuraman et al. [1994], consisting of 13 items that aimed to capture five dimensions, and since that time the scale has been used and refined in a number of studies [Bloemer and Kasper, 1995; de Ruyter and Bloemer, 1999; White and Yu, 2005; Yu and Dean, 2001]. The loyalty subscale within the behavioural intentions battery has demonstrated excellent consistency across many studies and has been chosen here to capture participant’s loyalty intentions. The scale is shown in Appendix 2.

As suggested by Luomala and Laaksonen [2000], the salient feature of mood definitions are their heterogeneity, and the measurement of mood is no exception. Broadly, three main options appear to dominate: the first and second are known as passive and active manipulation [Prakash, 1984–1985] and the third as self-report. Passive manipulation techniques involve participants being exposed to bogus positive/negative feedback, irritating music and depressing journal articles or newspaper stories [Luomala and Laaksonen, 2000]. Another passive technique involves using participants who are on holiday, or during pleasant weather, as these have been thought to induce positive mood states [Luomala and Laaksonen, 2000].

Passive manipulation techniques have also involved exposing participants to 15 minutes of videotaped films. In one such study, segments of four films were selected that were intended to induce a strong negative mood, a mild negative mood, a neutral mood and a positive mood and participants were randomly assigned to one of the four conditions [Morton, 1991]. While passive manipulation techniques are widely used, it is difficult to accept that ‘comedy capers’, for instance, will have a consistent and universal effect and the assumption that all people on holiday are in a good mood is equally problematic.

Active manipulation involves the use of hypnotism to induce emotional experiences but, apart from the fact that relatively few people are hypnotisable [Prakash, 1984–1985], inducing anything other than a positive mood may harm the participant. Another active technique uses what is known as the Velten Mood Induction Procedure, which is administered orally and to individuals. Individuals are required to read 60 statements on cards, firstly to themselves then aloud, and gradually the statements become more elating or depressing [Sinclair et al., 1994]. This method has been widely used and despite the time-consuming nature of the procedure, it has received some support [Prakash, 1984–1985].

The self-report method is relatively straightforward and basically involves requesting participants to express their mood at a particular time. A number of instruments are available to measure the extent or intensity of participants’ moods and one of the most common is known as the Mood Short Form [Mattila and Enz, 2002; McPhail and Mattson, 1996; Swinyard, 1993]. This scale consists of four bipolar...
measures, sad/happy, bad mood/good mood, irritable/pleased and depressed/cheerful and, despite the popularity of this scale, there are some obvious shortcomings. For instance, can one summate, sad, bad mood, irritable and depressed and get bad mood? Perhaps the combination of these feelings equate to anger for some people and something else for others. Why not just ask participants if they are in a good mood or bad mood and reject the other items? What happens if one is in a bad mood and feels pleased? Does this mean that the positive mood is lessened or the negative mood is enhanced? Additionally, as mood has been described as similar to, but different from an emotion, can emotions such as sad and happy be used as measures? So many questions from a short form.

Given that mood has been defined as a transitory feeling state that may be conscious or not, and has no referent object, then trying to articulate such a phenomenon or find words to describe it may not be appropriate, and another alternative has been offered as a way of addressing these deficiencies. After recognising the dilemma posed by constraining participants to specific objective comparisons or choices when measuring affective constructs, Fisher [2000] proposed that a faces scale, which uses facial expressions instead of numerical or written descriptions, may be more appropriate. Such scales have been developed and tested as measures of anxiety [McKinley, 2002] and pain and have demonstrated strong reliability and validity [Keck et al., 1996].

Given the specific characteristics of mood, as compared to an emotion or a belief, a faces scale appears to overcome many of the limitations associated with other mood measurement techniques discussed above. Unlike the active manipulation techniques it is non-intrusive and easy to administer, there are no assumptions made regarding the universality of intended effects, and problems pertaining to the Mood Short Form are also overcome. It is for these reasons that a seven-face scale will be used to measure participants’ mood and will be accompanied by the statement, ‘Please circle the face that best represents your mood today’. The item will be treated as an interval level of measurement.

Participants in this study were progressing through an undergraduate degree in Switzerland and were in their fifth semester of a seven-semester programme delivered in English. It could be described as an extended service encounter as all participants had at least two years’ experience with the institution, with 12 months remaining before the participants would complete the programme. The questionnaire was in English and a total of 220 usable responses were obtained.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

The data was screened to ensure that assumptions relating to the use of principal components, cluster, regression and correlation analysis [Coakes and Steed, 1999] were not violated. The emotions scale was subjected to a Principal Components Analysis with varimax rotation and a two-factor, positive and negative solution that explained 64 per cent of the total scale variance was obtained. The Cronbach alpha coefficient for the positive and negative emotion scale and the loyalty scale were .81, .86 and .86
respectively, and the items within each scale were summated and averaged and used as single variables in the subsequent analyses. A simple cluster analysis that specified a two cluster solution for the mood scale was generated and the membership of each saved, thus providing two broad mood states that will be referred to from now on as good mood (n = 79) and bad mood (n = 141).

Results pertaining to the first research question can be found in Table 1. These results indicate that mood is significantly correlated with all other constructs. At this level of analysis, the weaker relationship between mood and service quality when compared to both emotions lends some support for the view that mood is primarily an affective state [Gardner, 1985] that is also significantly related to perception of service quality and loyalty intentions.

In terms of the second research question, Table 2 displays the results of two regressions, reflecting a positive and negative mood state. The independent variables were service quality (SQ), positive emotions (PE) and negative emotions (NE) and the dependent variable was loyalty intentions. The adjusted R-squared values of .61 and .59 for the bad and good mood states respectively are quite high when one considers findings reported in many scholarly articles. This finding indicates that the three predictors are capable of explaining around 60 per cent of the variance in loyalty.

Of particular interest here are the standardised β coefficients as they indicate the extent to which each independent variable contributed to explaining the variance in the dependent variable [Hair et al., 1998]. The best predictor of loyalty for those in a bad mood was SQ (.507) followed by the negatively signed NE (–.193) and then PE (.185). The best predictor of loyalty for those in a good mood was PE (.379) followed by NE (–.294) and SQ (.271). The negative sign implies that for every increment of negative emotions, loyalty declines by .193 and .294 respectively.

Clearly there are different things happening in each state. For those in bad moods loyalty is more likely to be influenced by cognitive aspects of service provision, such as the ability of the firm to deliver a reliable, dependable and friendly service. This finding also suggests that those in a bad mood may use service quality attributes as a point of reference when evaluating a service.

There is some evidence of a unique and statistically significant emotion effect occurring, but these are considerably weaker, and of these NE are better predictors of loyalty than PE. Positive emotions therefore play a minor role in influencing loyalty intentions for those in bad moods. Moreover, and contrary to recent findings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Mood</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Loyalty</td>
<td>.218**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive emotions</td>
<td>.249**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative emotions</td>
<td>−.226**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service quality</td>
<td>.176**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).
[Yu and Dean, 2001], emotions are not the best predictors of loyalty intentions for those in bad moods.

For good moods, PE best predict loyalty, so the way one feels about a service provider, be it positive or to a lesser extent negative, is more important than cognitive deliberations regarding the quality of service. From a theoretical perspective, the stronger predictive ability of SQ perceptions for those in bad moods may support Shapiro et al.’s. [2002] view that individuals in bad moods tend to be more analytical and detailed in their deliberations than those in good moods, who appear more likely to be influenced by the way they feel.

From a practitioner’s perspective the findings related to research question 2 are of special importance, with some actions relatively straightforward and others not. In terms of the former, it would appear useful to consider mood in customer feedback strategies. This may include adding a faces scale to existing questionnaires, or devising some other way of gauging participants’ mood states for other data collection methods. Negative feedback may have more to do with an individual’s mood than the quality of service delivery, and if mood can be controlled then more meaningful interpretations of data would be possible.

In terms of the latter, if we knew what kind of mood a customer was in then we could adopt a mood-specific encounter strategy. For instance, selling to customers in bad moods may involve focusing on quality dimensions such as reliability or empathy and providing logical argument and evidence of how a service will be performed. Whereas those in positive moods may not want the facts but want to keep feeling good, and a more light-hearted approach that increases feelings of well-being would be more appropriate.

The difficulty is in accurately and reliably determining the kind of mood the consumer is in, and this is made more complicated in service transactions that rely on telephone or email. In spite of this challenge, what is clear from these results is that for consumers in different moods loyalty is influenced by different criteria.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Good and bad moods</th>
<th>Model</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R²</th>
<th>Adjusted R²</th>
<th>Std. error of the estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bad mood</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.786(a)</td>
<td>.618</td>
<td>.610</td>
<td>.71789</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good mood</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.781(a)</td>
<td>.609</td>
<td>.594</td>
<td>.77873</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Standardised coefficients</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bad mood 1</td>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>2.911</td>
<td>.004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service quality</td>
<td>.507</td>
<td>6.896</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive emotions</td>
<td>.185</td>
<td>2.464</td>
<td>.015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative emotions</td>
<td>−.193</td>
<td>−2.357</td>
<td>.020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good mood 1</td>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>2.676</td>
<td>.009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service quality</td>
<td>.271</td>
<td>3.037</td>
<td>.003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive emotions</td>
<td>.379</td>
<td>4.141</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative emotions</td>
<td>−.294</td>
<td>−3.318</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The information provided in Table 3 is related to the final research question. A hierarchical regression analysis was performed where mood was entered at the first model, and as indicated by the adjusted R-squared value, mood alone explained a statistically significant 4.9 per cent of the variance in loyalty. After SQ, PE and NE, which formed the second block, were entered, the whole model, including mood, explained 60.8 per cent of the variance. The R-squared change value for model 2 is .567, indicating that SQ, PE and NE explain an additional 56.7 per cent of the variance in loyalty when the effects of mood are statistically controlled for.

Despite the fact that mood does make a statistically significant contribution to explaining the variance in loyalty, 4.9 per cent is rather small, and therefore the inclusion of mood along with SQ and PE and NE does not greatly enhance the overall predictive ability of the model and this reinforces the findings of de Ruyter and Bloemer [1999].

### CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

Three research questions were posed here in order to enhance understanding of the relationship between mood states, positive and negative emotions, perceptions of service quality and customer loyalty, and this is the first time that all these constructs have been systematically examined. Mood was significantly correlated with all variables, supporting the view that it encompasses emotional, cognitive and behavioural intention components.

Loyalty, for individuals in bad moods, is much more likely to be influenced by assessments of service quality than positive or negative emotions, while those in a good mood are more likely to be influenced by positive emotions. Finally, mood was found to explain a small, albeit significant, amount of variance in consumer loyalty when added to the other variables.

Given the limited amount of research conducted in this area, more work is necessary to confirm the findings presented here, and replication studies would be an important step in this direction. Because of the correlational nature of the data analysis techniques used in this study, causal relationships have not been examined and this could provide another fruitful avenue for exploration. Finally, expanding the loyalty component to include complaining and switching intentions and using dimensions of service quality instead of a single item measure would enable more specific practical and theoretical understandings.

### TABLE 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>( R )</th>
<th>( R^2 )</th>
<th>Adjusted ( R^2 )</th>
<th>Std. error of the estimate</th>
<th>( R^2 ) change</th>
<th>F change</th>
<th>df1</th>
<th>df2</th>
<th>Sig. F change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.221[a]</td>
<td>.049</td>
<td>.044</td>
<td>1.17328</td>
<td>.049</td>
<td>11.048</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>216</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>.785[b]</td>
<td>.615</td>
<td>.608</td>
<td>.75114</td>
<td>.567</td>
<td>104.666</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>213</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Predictors: mood.
b. Predictors: mood, service quality, positive emotions and negative emotions.
REFERENCES


**APPENDIX 1**

My experience at . . . makes me feel: 1 = never, 7 = often

Happy
Hopeful
Positively surprised
Angry
Depressed
Guilty
Disappointed
Regretful
Humiliated

**APPENDIX 2**

Please select a number that best represents your views on the following scales: 1 = very unlikely, 7 = very likely

I would say positive things about . . .
I would recommend . . . to someone else
I would encourage friends to study at . . .
I would consider . . . as my first choice if I wished to pursue further study
I would pay a higher price for the benefits I received at . . .
Satisfaction emotions and consumer behavioral intentions

Christopher White
Charles Darwin University, Darwin, Australia, and
Yi-Ting Yu
Glion Institute of Higher Education, Bulle, Switzerland

Abstract
Purpose – The purpose of this study is to develop and refine the theoretical framework underpinning consumer satisfaction emotions and re-examine the emotions/behavioral intentions link.
Design/methodology/approach – A quantitative research design was adopted for this study. An extensive and critical review of literature related to consumer satisfaction emotions and consumer behavioral intentions led to the identification of two research questions. A self-completion questionnaire was developed and administered to hospitality management graduates in Switzerland.
Findings – The PCA suggested that satisfaction emotions were best conceptualized as a three-dimensional construct that included positive, negative and what the present authors have labeled “bi-directional” emotions. Moreover, a positive statistically significant relationship between “bi-directional” emotions and consumer complaining behavior was established through correlation analysis.
Research limitations/implications – The respondents were studying at a private institution in Switzerland, and as such, the socio-economic background of the respondents may not be representative of education consumers generally, and of consumers of services in industries other than education.
Practical implications – The findings reported in this paper indicate that the emotions framework that was developed could provide a valuable resource for managers as segmentation tool, and as an instrument for measuring and monitoring consumer behavioral intentions.
Originality/value – This paper has identified a relationship between specific satisfaction emotions and consumer complaining behavior. As a consequence, a more comprehensive satisfaction emotions scale has been developed that captures a broader range of consumer behavioral intentions. This information should benefit practitioners and researchers alike.

Keywords Customer satisfaction, Behaviour, Surveys, Statistical analysis, Switzerland

Paper type Research paper

An executive summary for managers and executive readers can be found at the end of this article.

Introduction
There is no doubt that significant scholarly attention has been devoted to the area of customer satisfaction (Fournier and Mick, 1999; Garbarino and Johnson, 1999; McQuitty et al., 2000; Oliver, 1999). Unfortunately, while the focus of many satisfaction studies has been on the relationships between satisfaction and other constructs, such as loyalty and service quality (see Athanassopoulos, 2000; Colgate and Stewart, 1998; Lee et al., 2000; McDougall and Levesque, 2000; Mittal et al., 1999; Mittal et al., 1998; Shemwell et al., 1998; Yoon and Kim, 2000), basic understandings and definitions of satisfaction as a construct have yet to be established and commonly accepted, thus making it difficult, if not impossible, to compare results across studies (Giese and Cote, 2000; Lee et al., 2000; Yu and Dean, 2001). As a consequence of this inconsistency, the development of satisfaction measurement has yet to reach the mature stage (Athanassopoulos, 2000).

Rather than treating satisfaction as a simple one-dimensional construct, some researchers’ have attempted to study satisfaction at a deeper level, arguing that satisfaction was multi-dimensional, and incorporated cognitive elements related to beliefs and expectations of a product/service, and affective elements that included emotions (e.g. Athanassopoulos, 2000; Liljander and Strandvik, 1997; Stauss and Neuhaus, 1997; Yu and Dean, 2001), although much more work is still needed in this area. Fournier and Mick (1999), for instance, suggested that most research still focuses on the cognitive aspects of satisfaction and that the emotional component has been underrepresented in the literature.

In light of the fact that only a relatively small portion of satisfied customers return to the same service or product (Oliver, 1999; Stauss and Neuhaus, 1997), satisfaction researchers should really be thinking more seriously about exploring the role of emotions in the satisfaction-behavioral intention relationship before conclusions can be reached as to whether the impact of satisfaction on behavioral intentions is significant or not. The aim of this study is to develop and refine the conceptual framework underpinning consumer satisfaction emotions and re-examine the emotions/behavioral intentions relationship.
**Literature review**

**What is consumer satisfaction?**

While satisfaction appears to conceptually overlap with numerous variables, some distinctions have been made between satisfaction, and other closely related constructs such as perceived service quality (Danaher and Haddrell, 1996; Lee et al., 2000; Spreng and Mackoy, 1996), perceived product value and attitudes (Bagozzi et al., 1999; Roest and Pieters, 1997). Roest and Pieters (1997), for example, developed a theoretical framework to distinguish satisfaction, perceived service quality, perceived product value and product attitude and these authors identified six dimensions that were used to differentiate these constructs and they were time, basis, object, content, context and aggregation.

Similar conclusions were drawn in a study conducted by Giese and Cote (2000) who after reviewing satisfaction literature from 1969 to 1997 suggested that the satisfaction construct consisted of three basic elements, namely:

1. response;
2. focus; and
3. time.

The response component could be cognitive or affective, the focus was the product or service provided, and the time component was usually during consumption. These three elements were then used to analyze interview data from 135 interviewees to determine whether their findings were consistent with the literature. The results indicated that consumers tended to view satisfaction as an affective construct, prompting the authors to conclude that satisfaction was an “affective summary response” towards the product or service consumed.

Early work in the area of satisfaction suggested that it was a result of a comparison between a consumer's expectations of the service/product and the actual experience (Oliver, 1980). This view, which is also known as the disconfirmation of expectations paradigm, was tested alongside positive affect, negative affect and expectation beliefs and the results indicated that satisfaction was a function of all of these when evaluating automobiles. Satisfaction with cable television however was a function of positive affect, negative affect and expectation beliefs and the results indicated that satisfaction was an “affective summary response” towards the product or service consumed.

Further support for the notion that satisfaction included an affective component has proliferated in recent years although few of them (e.g. Andreassen, 2000; Liljander and Strandvik, 1997; Staus and Neuhaus, 1997; Oliver, 1993) have actually used emotion items or scales to measure the affective component. For instance, Odekerken-Schröder et al. (2000), while agreeing that satisfaction contained both a cognitive and affective evaluation of a product/service, requested participants to grade their satisfaction level on a ten-point single item scale. This raises the issue of whether the word “satisfaction” alone is sufficient enough to capture the emotional component, as other researchers have expressed concern about single item measures of satisfaction, citing issues of reliability and the limitations of such practices to predict future loyalty behavior (Danaher and Haddrell, 1996; Peterson and Wilson, 1992; Staus and Neuhaus, 1997).

Given that there are literally hundreds of emotions, the question of what types of emotions should be included on such a scale is a formidable one. A study conducted by Machleit and Eroglu (2000) identified three different emotion typologies that were developed by psychologists for understanding human emotions in general, not consumption emotions specifically, and one of the aims of their study was to compare these typologies to determine which best explained the emotions experienced by shoppers in a variety of retail contexts.

The results suggested that the predictive ability of two of the typologies were similar and this was not surprising considering they were conceptually alike and shared similar items and in short, the emotions that were common to both of these models included joy, sadness, surprise, disgust, anger and fear (Machleit and Eroglu, 2000) and it is fair to say that many of these emotions appear in contemporary emotion scales. Moreover, it is generally accepted that emotions can be categorized as being either positive or negative (Bagozzi et al., 1999; Liljander and Strandvik, 1997; Machleit and Mantel, 2001).

A study conducted by Yu and Dean (2001) raised questions concerning the two-dimensional, positive/negative, conceptualization of the emotion construct as one of the emotions, anger, loaded on both the positive and negative dimensions in their study. This finding suggested that there might be another emotion dimension in addition to positive and negative emotions, especially when the alpha coefficient dropped by only 0.1 when the anger item was removed. Oliver and Westbrook (1993) offered additional support for this view in arguing that more than one dimension existed for negative affect.

Dubé and Menon (1998) provided further substantiation for a multi-dimensional view in a study that identified five dimensions of emotions. The items representing positive emotions combined to form one dimension, a second dimension included the items “jittery” and “excited”, that the authors labeled arousal, and items associated with negative emotions loaded on the other three dimensions. From a theoretical perspective these findings suggested that the emotional component may in fact be best conceptualized as a multi-dimensional concept and clearly more work is needed to enable better understandings of this issue.

**Consumer behavioral intentions and satisfaction emotions**

Recent studies relating to customer loyalty have tended to adopt behavioral (stochastic) and/or attitudinal (determinist) approaches (Chaudhuri and Holbrook, 2001; Lee and Cunningham, 2001; Lee et al., 2001; Odin et al., 2001; Rundle-Thiele and Mackay, 2001). The behavioral approach has generally focused on market share, brand allegiance, exclusive purchase, elasticity's, and/or price until switching (Rundle-Thiele and Mackay, 2001), while the attitudinal approach tended to focus on attitudes towards loyal/disloyal acts, brand preference, commitment or attitude toward the brand measures, and/or probability of purchase.

Both behavioral and attitudinal approaches have been heavily criticized (see Bloemer et al., 1999; Bloemer and Kasper, 1995; Lee and Cunningham, 2001; Odin et al., 2001) however given that the focus of this study is on a service industry, and much of the research on consumer loyalty as it relates to such industries is still in the exploratory stage (Bloemer et al., 1999), this study will adopt an attitudinal...
loyalty perspective. This approach has been deemed more suitable for service industries given the difficulties associated with obtaining behavioral data in a service industry context, and that an attitudinal approach lends itself to a survey style methodology (Rundle-Thiele and Mackay, 2001).

While the overwhelming number of studies that have investigated the outcomes of overall satisfaction have indicated that a significant relationship exists between satisfaction/dissatisfaction and loyalty behaviors such as switching, complaining, positive word of mouth and repurchase intentions (see Alford and Sherrell, 1996; Athanassopoulos, 2000; Ennew and Binks, 1999; Mittal et al., 1998; Szymanski and Henard, 2001; Tax et al., 1998; Yoon and Kim, 2000), some have argued that the relationship may not be that straightforward (Mittal et al., 1998; Stauss and Neuhaus, 1997), and this uncertainty has prompted some academic interest in the role of (satisfaction) emotions in influencing and predicting consumer behavior.

In one such study, McQuitty et al. (2000), argued that pleasant surprise was positively linked to satisfaction levels, and negatively linked to the probability of switching behavior, while Yu and Dean (2001), using a satisfaction emotions scale that was based on a scale developed by Liljander and Strandvik (1997) established significant relationships between satisfaction emotions and positive word of mouth, willingness to pay more and switching behavior. They were however unable to establish a relationship between satisfaction emotions and complaining behavior. This raises a concern that the satisfaction emotions adopted by Liljander and Strandvik’s (1997) may not be sufficient to provide a comprehensive picture of the satisfaction emotion domain, or alternatively, that satisfaction is not related to complaining behavior (Oliver, 1999).

Other work that has focused on satisfaction emotions and consumer behavioral intentions has indicated that positive emotions tended to be associated with positive outcomes and negative emotions tended to associate with negative outcomes (Babin and Babin, 2001; Machleit and Mantel, 2001). For instance, excitement, positively associated with both patronage intention and hedonic shopping value, and shame has been found to be negatively associated with patronage intentions (Babin and Babin, 2001), and while considerable support for this view is available (Yu and Dean, 2001), other research has indicated that negative emotions seem to have a stronger impact on post-choice evaluation as compared to positive emotions (Inman et al., 1997).

This conflicting position may be explained by the kinds of emotions measured in both studies; Inman et al.’s (1997) study focused on regret versus elation, and disappointment versus rejoicing, while Yu and Dean’s (2001) study focused on happy, hopeful, positively surprised, angry, depressed, guilty and humiliated. It should also be noted that unlike Inman et al.’s (1997) study, the negative emotions dimension in Yu and Dean’s (2001) study was less reliable and had less significant correlations with behavioral intentions dimensions when compared to the positive emotion dimension.

Since the development of a theoretical framework capable of explaining satisfaction emotions is not yet complete, it is too early to reject the possibility that a more comprehensive list of satisfaction emotions would be able to explain a broader variety of behavioral intentions, and the emotions of regret and disappointment may hold such a promise, as work other than Inman et al. (1997) has linked regret to switching behavior and disappointment to complaining, and negative word-of-mouth behavior (Inman and Zeelenberg, 2002; Zeelenberg et al., 2000; Zeelenberg and Pieters, 1999).

Moreover, Zeelenberg and Pieters (1999) have provided considerable support for the view that while other negative emotions can be experienced during or after the service encounter they are not directly linked to the decision-making process, and considering consumer behavioral intentions involve significant decision-making, particularly in repurchase decisions, the inclusion of regret and disappointment may enhance an emotions framework ability to explain consumer complaining behavior.

In summarizing the main points raised above, it is clear that conceptualizing the emotions construct as a two-dimensional positive/negative entity is questionable and to date, emotion frameworks have been unable to explain a variety consumer responses to a service, namely complaining, and the emotions of regret and disappointment may overcome this deficiency. To this end, the following research questions have been devised to guide an empirical investigation of this issue.

**RQ1.** Will the inclusion of regret and disappointment into an existing satisfaction emotion framework provide support for a two dimensional conceptualization of the satisfaction emotion construct?

**RQ2.** Will the inclusion of regret and disappointment establish a statistically significant relationship between satisfaction emotions and consumer behavioral intentions, specifically consumer complaining behavior?

### Methodology

#### Instrumentation

The emotions scale adopted in this study was originally developed by Liljander and Strandvik (1997), and it was chosen because previous studies had reported good reliability statistics and a stable factor structure, and it has been used to examine the relationship between satisfaction and loyalty in educational contexts (Yu and Dean, 2001). Moreover, R-squared values reported in Liljander and Strandvik’s (1997) and Yu and Dean’s (2001) studies, indicate that this model, when compared to the models tested by Machleit and Eroglu (2000), was superior in predicting consumer satisfaction. The scale consisted of three positive emotion items and four negative emotion items, and two other emotions, regret and disappointment. A seven-point Likert scale, where “1” was never, and “7” often, was used to determine the extent the participants experienced each emotion when considering the service supplier. The questionnaire can be seen in Table I.

Early research into the area of consumer behavioral intentions was limited by the ability to fully account for the variety of possible behaviors a consumer may adopt. For example, Cronin and Taylor (1992) used a one-item measure of purchase intentions to capture the construct while, Boulding et al. (1993) focused on purchase intentions and willingness to recommend. A more recent study that developed an 18-item behavioral intentions scale, reported reasonable levels of reliability and validity, but also focused mainly on repeat purchasing and as a result was not deemed suitable for this study. A broader conceptualization of the consumer behavioral intentions construct was proposed by Parasuraman et al. (1994) and this scale consisted of 13 items that aimed to capture five dimensions; loyalty to company, propensity to switch, willingness to pay more, external
response to a problem and internal response to a problem, and since that time this scale has been used and refined in a number of studies (Bloemer et al., 1999; de Ruyter et al., 1998; Yu and Dean, 2001; Zeithaml et al., 1996), related to services loyalty.

Despite the intuitive appeal of this model there have been a number of concerns regarding the replication of the original factor structure and the cohesiveness of the sub-scales, as indicated by coefficient alphas. Yu and Dean (2001) for example reported a four-factor solution that consisted of positive word of mouth, complaining behavior, switching behavior and willingness to pay more, and reliability coefficients that ranged from 0.94 for the loyalty dimension to a low of 0.45 for the willingness to pay dimension.

Regardless of the concerns raised above, the behavioral intentions scale has been chosen for use this study because to date, it provides the most comprehensive conceptualization of the consumer behavioral intentions construct, and has been used in studies that have relevance to this study which allows for a more meaningful comparison (Yu and Dean, 2001). The scale was adapted to suit the contextual characteristics of this particular study and the adaptations related to the removal of two items that were intended to capture respondents’ propensity to switch, as these were not applicable to the institution that provided the focus of this study. A seven-point Likert scale where “1” was very unlikely, and “7”, very likely was used and the final version of the questionnaire can be seen in Table I.

Sample
The data collection site was one campus of a multi-campus educational institution catering for international students who were progressing towards the completion of a Bachelor degree. The students were entering their final year and had changed campus for such purpose, so they had previous experience with the institution, but were unfamiliar with the new environment. Respondents were requested to complete a questionnaire, in English, that was designed to capture their emotional reactions towards the service provider and their behavioral intentions. A total of 347 usable questionnaires were obtained from a possible 425 students, a response rate of 82 percent, and the average age of the respondents was 23 years. Of these, 60 percent were female and 40 percent male and there were 35 different nationalities represented within the group. Despite the variety of nationalities represented, all courses were conducted in English and admission standards at the institution required a level of that language that compares to other English speaking universities worldwide. Participants therefore had no difficulty in completing the questionnaire.

Data analysis
The internal consistency of the various scales used in this study was determined by computing Cronbach’s coefficient alpha. In order to establish the dimensionality of the scales a principle components analysis with varimax rotation was used and this was chosen because the researchers believed that only a small proportion of specific and error variance would be represented in the total variance, and the aim of this exercise was to determine the minimum number of factors needed to explain the maximum amount of variance within the data set (Hair et al., 1998). As principle components is robust to assumptions of multi-collinearity and singularity (Coakes and Steed, 1999) the main concern was the factorability of the correlation matrix and this was determined by using Bartlett’s test of sphericity and the Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin (K-M-O) measure of sampling adequacy.

Strengths of the relationship between variables were ascertained by computing a Pearson’s product-moment correlation coefficient and as such the assumptions of normality and linearity needed to be tested. Skewness and kurtosis statistics provided evidence of normality and scatter plots were generated to determine linearity of the relationship between variables.
greater than 1 were extracted and the K-M-O measure of sampling adequacy was 0.766 and Bartlett’s test of sphericity was again high and significant. One item, complain to staff, was removed prior to the analysis because of low inter-item correlations. The final solution explained 73.25 percent of the overall scale variance and the alpha coefficients for the four components were 0.91, 0.64, 0.50 and 0.52 respectively. The first component included positive word of mouth intentions, the second component included intentions related to complaining, the third component included both switching items and the negatively signed “continue if prices increased” item, and the fourth dimension related to positive intentions.

The variable, “continue if prices increase”, negative sign indicated that the variable was moving in the opposite direction to the others loading on that component. For example, as the propensity to switch or change increased, the willingness to continue if prices increased, would decrease (Hair et al., 1998). For the purposes of distinguishing between the components, the first will be labeled positive word of mouth (positive WOM), the second, complaining behavior, the third switching behavior and the fourth, willingness to pay more.

Table IV displays the Pearson product moment correlations between the summed item component scores of the emotion and the behavioral intention scales. Skewness and kurtosis statistics indicated that no extreme values were present in the data set and while scatter plots for dimension scores did indicate weak relationships among some variables, there was no evidence of a curvilinear effect between any combinations of variables. Therefore the assumptions of linearity and normality have not been violated. Interestingly, while there was no significant relationship between complaining behavior and negative emotions, there was however a strong and significant association between bi-directional emotions and complaining behavior.

In order to isolate the effects of the two additional items, regret and disappointment, further analysis was conducted to determine the relationship between them and the four dimensions of behavioral intentions. It is evident that the emotion of regret was not significantly related to complaining behavior but had a stronger negative relationship with positive WOM than disappointed. It is also clear that disappointed was significantly related to complaining behavior.

Discussion

RQ1. Will the inclusion of regret and disappointment into an existing satisfaction emotion framework provide support for a two dimensional conceptualization of the satisfaction emotion construct?

Clearly these findings are influential in a number of important ways. First, in reference to Table II, the three component structure both confirms and questions the results of previous studies, in as much that a single dimension of positive emotions emerged indicating that positive emotions appear unique and distinct from other emotions despite the type of items used to represent this component (see Dubé and
Menon, 1998; Liljander and Strandvik, 1997; Machleit and Eroglu, 2000; Yu and Dean, 2001). However, this is not the case with the negative emotions as anger loaded with disappointed, to form a third component distinct from the other negative emotions. It appears that negative emotions do consist of separate dimensions and this is consistent with Oliver and Westbrook’s (1993) findings, that suggested that anger and guilt belonged to different negative emotion dimensions.

The “anger” and “disappointed” component has been labeled as bi-directional because it is possible that an individual can be angry and disappointed with themselves for consuming the service, but at the same time be angry and disappointed with the provider for failing to satisfy their needs. This may explain why anger loaded on the more inner-directed negative emotion dimension and formed a unique dimension in Yu and Dean’s (2001) study, as there were no other bi-directional emotion options included in their scale. Dubé and Menon (1998), isolated a dimension they labeled “other attributed negative emotions”, that consisted of emotions such as hostile, frustrated, lonely and uncared for, that these authors posited were attributed to the service provider, although they bear little resemblance to the bi-directional component found here.

These results provide a fairly robust conceptualization of satisfaction emotions in that the component structure was clear and unambiguous and supported by strong reliability statistics. The 0.68 score for the bi-directional component does not quite meet the acceptable level (0.70) as expressed by Nunnally (1978) however this is likely to be an artifact of the limited number of items contained therein, rather than a fundamental problem of scale cohesiveness.

The results displayed in Table III identified another clear and easily interpretable component structure, when compared to the results reported on the same scale in other studies (Yu and Dean, 2001). The first component, that has been labeled positive word of mouth, is characterized by a strong reliability statistic (0.91) and the three items that comprise this component were also represented in the first dimension of Yu and Dean’s (2001) study.

The second dimension contained both complaining items and again the small number of items may have influenced the slightly less than desirable reliability coefficient. The third component contained the switching behavior items, and the fourth component has been labeled “willingness to pay more” because it encapsulates an individual’s propensity to pay more, or do more business with the firm in future. With the exception of the first component, the structure of this particular scale has not demonstrated much consistency across studies (Odin et al., 2001; Rundle-Thiele and Mackay, 2001), however general patterns have emerged that indicated that the scale has demonstrated some degree of convergent validity, and therefore suitable for use in understanding the relationship between satisfaction emotions and consumer behavioral intentions.

RQ2. Will the inclusion of regret and disappointment establish a statistically significant relationship between satisfaction emotions and consumer behavioral intentions, specifically consumer complaining behavior?

Table IV displays the strength and direction of the relationships between the summed component scores for the emotions and the behavioral intention scale. As expected, and in line with previous findings (Babin and Babin, 2001; Machleit and Mantel, 2001; Yu and Dean, 2001) there is a significant and strong positive relationship between positive emotions and positive WOM and a significant relationship with willingness to pay more which reinforces the value of understanding and developing positive emotions in order to encourage these two important consumer behaviors. Moreover, the inverse significant relationship between positive emotions and switching behavior suggests that high levels of positive emotions are associated with lower levels of behaviors relating to switching suppliers for more attractive prices or switching when experiencing problems with a service provider.

In all instances, the bi-directional component had stronger positive associations with complaining behavior and switching intentions than the negative emotions component and of particular interest is the significant relationship between bi-directional and complaining behavior components, as previous studies had not been able to establish a connection between emotion dimensions and complaining intentions (Yu and Dean, 2001). The fact that the disappointed item featured in the bi-directional component reinforces Zeelenberg and Pieters’ (1999) findings by indicating that this particular emotion does correlate with complaining intentions. Moreover, the stronger negative relationship between regret and positive WOM (see Table IV) further supports Zeelenberg and Pieters’ (1999) findings that highlighted a relationship between this emotion and word of mouth intentions.

It is important to note that in Zeelenberg and Pieters’ (1999) study, the disappointment/complaining behavior relationship was established by determining participants’ behavioral tendencies, and not their actual experience of the service. When participants’ actual experience was obtained, the relationship between these two variables was not significant. On the basis of the findings in this study, it appears that there is a relationship between participants’ actual experience and complaining intentions. This relationship has not been fully explained in previous satisfaction emotion studies and there appears little doubt that the inclusion of the disappointed item (see Table IV) has enhanced the emotion scale’s ability to capture the

| Table IV Correlation analysis results: satisfaction emotion dimensions and behavioral intentions |
|-----------------------------------------------|-----------------|----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
|                                             | Positive emotions | Negative emotions | Bi-directional | Disappointed | Regret |
| Positive WOM                               | 0.581*           | −0.285*          | −0.337*        | −0.333*        | −0.415*        |
| Complaining behavior                       | −0.097           | 0.102            | 0.290*         | 0.169*         | 0.087          |
| Switching behavior                         | −0.108*          | 0.267*           | 0.337*         | 0.305*         | 0.291*         |
| Willingness to pay more                    | 0.324*           | −0.068           | −0.198*        | −0.185*        | −0.142*        |

Note: * Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (two-tailed)
complaining behavior element of the behavioral intentions construct. Furthermore, from a theoretical perspective it is evident that the inclusion of the additional items has reinforced the notion that satisfaction emotions are multi-dimensional and that a tripartite model of positive, negative and bi-directional emotions may best conceptualize and operationalize this construct.

**Conclusion and implications**

The significant role of consumer loyalty in explaining market share and relative price is well documented (Chaudhuri and Holbrook, 2001) and the recent concentration of research on satisfaction emotions suggests that this construct is a better predictor of loyalty behaviors than traditional cognitive measures. To date however, a statistically significant relationship between emotion dimensions and consumer complaining behavior has not been established and it was proposed in this paper that the scales used previously have not adequately represented the emotion construct. In order to overcome this limitation the emotions of regret and disappointment were added to an existing emotions scale developed by Liljander and Strandvik (1997) and the results reported here have advanced theoretical understandings of the satisfaction emotion/behavior relationship in two important ways. First, it was demonstrated that satisfaction emotions can be conceptualized as a three-dimensional construct of positive, negative and bi-directional emotions, and second, there was a statistically significant relationship between the bi-directional component and consumer complaining behavior.

**Implications for practitioners**

It is clear, that after reviewing many of the studies discussed above, that emotions play an integral part in influencing consumer satisfaction and behavioral intentions. Practitioners responsible for gathering such information should certainly consider incorporating the emotions framework that was tested in this study, into their existing satisfaction measurement strategies. The emotions scale used here has demonstrated strong reliability and validity and an additional nine items may not be such a high price to pay if one considers the potential benefits associated with understanding a consumer’s emotional reaction to a service or product.

From a managerial perspective and for purposes of segmentation, these findings suggest that practitioners should focus on developing the aspects of their offerings that stimulate positive emotions, because customers in this segment are highly likely to say positive things about the firm, be more willing to pay more for the services they receive and be less likely to switch. In order to do this, the interplay between a consumer’s cognitive and emotional experiences, need to be understood and managed. For example, if there were strong associations between a consumer’s perception of the physical environment where the service was consumed, a hotel lobby for example, and their positive emotions, then resources could be directed toward this particular aspect of the offering in order to stimulate the desired emotional response.

In many respects the bi-directional component requires as much attention as the positive emotions component because of the unfavorable significant correlations it has with all of the behavioral intentions dimensions. In terms of complaining intentions, if this segment’s propensity to complain was directed toward the company then it would make them easily identifiable and allow employees or complaint handlers the opportunity to recover lost ground. Unfortunately, as the item complain to staff was removed from this analysis, and the items representing complaining behavior related to complaining to outside agencies and other customers’, more work is necessary to clarify whether they would in fact complain to the firm or just switch to a competitor without announcing their dissatisfaction. Despite this uncertainty, complaining to others, be they customers or external sources is not at all desirable, and managers should do their utmost to open up opportunities and channels, within the organization that encourage and direct customer complaints to internal sources for resolution.

Given the importance of positive WOM behavior, particularly for services that are largely intangible, managers should also pay careful attention to bi-directional, and to a lesser extent, negative emotion segments because of the significant negative relationship between these components and WOM. Such attention may involve examining the firm’s communication strategy, as overpromising or creating unrealistic expectations may stimulate the emotions of disappointment and anger. At the same time, managers should recognize that unresolved service shortfalls experienced by consumers may also stimulate these emotions, and training employees to promptly recognize and take responsibility for reducing the frequency and intensity of these emotions, will be important in encouraging positive WOM, and reducing the propensity to switch.

Considering that the bi-directional component has a significant and stronger relationship with all the behavioral intention components, than the negative emotion component, one may question whether there is a need to identify a negative emotion segment at all. That is to say, it may be possible to omit emotions such as guilty, humiliated, regretful and depressed and just use anger and disappointed in conjunction with the positive emotions. However the fact that the relationship between negative emotions and complaining behavior and willingness to pay more was not significant, may suggest that there are some distinctive characteristics of this component that managers should consider.

For instance, given that the segment is less likely to complain to other customers or external agencies, suggests that there is not the urgency to act, as there would be for the bi-directional segment, in order to reduce the possibility of complaint behaviors. Moreover, they may be easier to appease than bi-directional segment, more likely to pay more and more willing to return to the organization, and as such recovery strategies could be different than those used for the bi-directional segment and likely to cost less.

**Recommendations for future research**

Although this study established the relationship between bi-directional emotions and complaining behavior, it is important to note that the study was undertaken “during” the service provision, and according to Zeelenberg and Pieters (1999), what is established during consumption may be different from the post consumption experience. Moreover, Zeelenberg and Pieters’ (1999) study measured the “amount” (how much) of regret and disappointment that was experienced, and this study measured the frequency (how often) of occurrence, and while some recent research has examined this issue, it is unclear how different descriptors

---

*Satisfaction emotions and consumer behavioral intentions*

Christopher White and Yi-Ting Yu

*Journal of Services Marketing*

Volume 19 · Number 6 · 2005 · 411–420
influence results, and more work is needed to gain deeper understandings of these issues.

Future research could also examine the influence that the service context, or kind of service, has on the types of emotions that are evoked and whether the relationship between emotions and behavioral intentions alter as a result. For example, this study focused on an education provider and in the vast majority of cases, the participants did not actually pay for the service, this was done by their parents or another party, and intuitively, this is likely to influence some aspects of the emotion/behavioral intentions relationship. As it is currently not known whether the same types of emotions and behavioral intentions are consistent across cultures and gender, further investigation of these issues would make an interesting extension to this study. Finally, while the behavioral intentions scale that was used in this study is the most comprehensive available, issues of low reliability and inconsistent factor structure weaken the ability to make firm conclusions and future research could focus towards developing a more stable behavioral intentions model.

References


Christopher White and Yi-Ting Yu


Journal of Services Marketing

Volume 19 · Number 6 · 2005 · 411–420
Satisfaction emotions and consumer behavioral intentions

Christopher White and Yi-Ting Yu


Executive summary and implications for managers and executives

This summary has been provided to allow managers and executives a rapid appreciation of the content of this article. Those with a particular interest in the topic covered may then read the article in toto to take advantage of the more comprehensive description of the research undertaken and its results to get the full benefits of the material present.

Satisfaction emotions and consumer behavior

Many previous researchers have indicated that a significant relationship exists between customer satisfaction/dissatisfaction and loyalty behaviors such as switching, complaining, positive word-of-mouth and intentions to repurchase the product. However, some have argued that the relationship may not be so straightforward. This has prompted interest in the role of satisfaction emotions in influencing and predicting consumer behavior. In particular, it appears that conceptualizing the emotions construct as a two-dimensional positive/negative entity is questionable: to date, emotion frameworks have been unable to explain consumer-complaining behavior. White and Yu advance the view that including the emotions of regret and disappointment may help to overcome this weakness.

Positive, negative and “bi-directional” emotions

Their research among hospitality management graduates in Switzerland indicates that satisfaction emotions can be conceptualized as a three-dimensional construct of: positive emotions (happy, happy, positively surprised); negative emotions (guilty, humiliated, depressed); and bi-directional emotions (angry, disappointed). The researchers use the term
“bi-directional” because it is possible that people can be angry and disappointed with themselves for consuming the service, and at the same time be angry and disappointed with the service provider for failing to satisfy their needs. Moreover, White and Yu show that there is a statistically significant relationship between the bi-directional component and customer complaining behavior. The researchers advise business people to consider incorporating the positive, negative and bi-directional emotions framework into their existing strategies for measuring customer satisfaction.

The positive component
White and Yu urge managers to focus on developing those aspects of their service that stimulate positive emotions, because this category of customers is highly likely to say positive things about the firm, be more willing to pay more for services received, and be less likely to switch to another service provider.

The bi-directional component
Managers must also pay significant attention to the bi-directional component, because it has significant links with all the behavioral intentions dimensions. In terms of complaining intentions, if this segment’s propensity to complain was directed towards the company, it would make it easy for the firm to identify this category of customers and help front-line employees or those specifically charged with handling complaints to recover lost ground. The bi-directional and, to a lesser extent, negative emotion segments are also linked to negative word-of-mouth. Managers should examine their firms’ communication strategies, as promising too much or creating unrealistic expectations may stimulate the emotions of disappointment and anger. Managers should also recognize that unresolved service shortfalls experienced by consumers might also stimulate these emotions. Training employees promptly to recognize and take responsibility for reducing the frequency and intensity of these emotions will be important in encouraging positive word-of-mouth and reducing the likelihood that customers will switch to another provider.

The negative component
The bi-directional component has a significant and stronger relationship with all the behavioral intention components than does the negative emotion component. The fact that the relationship between negative emotions and complaining behavior and willingness to pay more is not significant may suggest that there are some distinctive characteristics of this component that managers should consider. For example, given that this segment is less likely to complain to other customers or external agencies, it may not be as important for managers to act to reduce the possibility of complaint behaviors among this segment as it would be among the bi-directional segment. Moreover, the negative segment may be easier to appease than the bi-directional segment, more likely to pay more, and more willing to return to the organization. Recovery strategies for the negative segment could therefore be different from those used among the bi-directional segment, and would be likely to cost less.

(A précis of the article “Satisfaction emotions and consumer behavioral intentions”. Supplied by Marketing Consultants for Emerald.)
Phase 4
Culture, Emotions and Behavioural Intentions: Implications for Tourism Research and Practice

Christopher J. White
Charles Darwin University, Casuarina, NT, 0909, Australia

The motivation for pursuing this topic was stimulated by the view that theory relating to tourist behaviour, while plentiful, was descriptive and lacked empirical support. A critical multi-disciplinary review of contemporary theories of human behaviour led to the identification of a theoretical perspective that shows some promise as a predictor of tourist behaviour. The review additionally established that the role of cultural values, and emotions as predictors of behaviour or behavioural intentions, have been under-represented in the tourism literature. Emerging evidence suggests that tourism practitioners have much to gain by taking emotions into consideration, and tourism researchers have more work to do in order to understand the culture/behaviour link. A number of models have been identified as suitable for operationalising these constructs and the review concluded with recommendations for future research.

Keywords: behavioural intentions, emotions, cultural values, tourism industry

Introduction

Culture has been described by Hofstede (1980) as being a collective phenomenon because it is shared by members of similar social environments and is derived through learning rather than genetically and, as such, is distinct from personality and human nature. Within any given society, there are different levels of culture – national, individual, generational, organisational and so on – and considerable effort has been devoted to understanding the constituents of culture at these levels and identifying ways to best explain and predict how cultures differ. One construct that has received more attention than others is that of values, mainly because they are among the first things that people learn and are more enduring than attitudes or perceptions, and also because values have been the vehicle through which dimensions of culture have been established (Robbins, 2001).

At the national cultural level, there are a number of well-known and -tested theories (Hofstede, 1980; Schwartz, 1999; Singelis et al., 1995) and while the number and names of the various dimensions of these theories differ, two broad cultural orientations are common to all. These orientations, which result from responding to problems common to all societies, are the conception of the self in relation to others and relation to authority. These orientations have been referred to as individualism versus collectivism and high versus low power distance, or what some refer to as vertical and horizontal authority relations, and have been discussed by social scientists since the 19th century (Triandis, 1995).

Advances in theoretical understandings of cultural orientations have been applied to the prediction of job satisfaction (White, in press, a), lifestyle analysis
(Sun et al., 2004), managerial behaviour (Smith et al., 2002; Sun et al., 2004), responses to marketing stimuli (Lowe & Corkindale, 1998), service quality (Furrer et al., 2000), product evaluation (Crotts & Erdmann, 2000), occupational choice (Brown, 2002), persuasion (Aaker & Maheswaran, 1997), social behaviour (Lee, 2000; Triandis, 1994) and behavioural intentions (Maio & Olson, 1995; Mattila, 1999).

Despite the acceptance of cultural orientations as predictors of a range of behaviour, correlations between cultural values and behavioural intentions have traditionally been low (Smith et al., 2002), prompting the search for other predictor variables. Some researchers have begun to examine the relationship between affect or emotions, culture and behaviour (Eid & Diener, 2001; Maio & Olson, 1995; Markus & Kitayama, 1991; Mesquita, 2001). However, in the main, this work tends to be conceptual rather than empirical and while the emotion–behavioural intention relationship has attracted considerable attention in a variety of contexts (Baloglu & Brinberg, 1997; Baloglu & McCleary, 1999a, 1999b; Liljander & Strandvik, 1997; Stauss & Neuhaus, 1997; White & Scandale, 2005; White & Yu, 2005; Yu & Dean, 2001), little is known about how values and emotions interact, particularly in tourism or service industry context. This review therefore aims to analyse each of these constructs and provide potential research opportunities and options for tourism or service industry researchers and practitioners.

**Literature Review**

**Consumer behaviour**

A review of any good introductory tourism text will demonstrate that there is no shortage of theoretical models related to consumer behaviour in a tourism context (e.g. Cooper et al., 2005); however, quantity, in the view of some, does not equal quality. Swarbrooke and Horner (1999), for example, posited that generally the models are not supported by empirical evidence, and that they do not realistically represent the way decisions are made. Others have claimed that they are not predictive, and with few exceptions do not consider the constraints involved in making decisions (Pizam & Mansfeld, 1999). The study of human behaviour has a long history that has involved considerable empirical investigation across many academic disciplines, and it is surprising that much of this work has not yet filtered into the tourism domain. The following discussion critically reviews the most dominant models within this literature and, where possible, considers the implications from a tourism perspective.

One of the most influential models developed to explain human behaviour and its antecedents was proposed by Fishbein and Ajzen in 1974. What originally began as the theory of reasoned action (TRA) was later refined to become the theory of planned behaviour (TPB) (Ajzen, 1991) and this can be viewed in Figure 1.

The rationale behind this model is that human behaviour is influenced by beliefs about the outcomes of behaviour, which in turn produce a positive or negative attitude towards the behaviour. Beliefs about the normative expectations of others leads to subjective perceptions of social pressures, and beliefs about control give rise to perceptions of the degree of control one has over factors
that may impede or facilitate the behaviour. The beliefs that are more strongly held are more likely to influence behavioural intentions (Ajzen, 2002). Since the early 1990s, over 700 research article titles have included the term TPB (source EBSCO database) and given this recognition and considerable support for the model, a deeper look at its constituent parts is warranted.

According to earlier conceptualisations of the attitude component of the model, attitudes develop as a result of the value, positive or negative, that one expects to gain from a particular behaviour (Ajzen, 1991). This expectancy–value model of attitudes attracted some attention in the late 1970s and early 1980s; however, the results pertaining to the relationship between salient beliefs and global overall measures of attitude have consistently yielded low correlations. This realisation led Ajzen (1991) to concede that:

Various factors may be responsible for relatively low correlations between salient beliefs and attitudes. First, of course, there is the possibility that the expectancy–value model is an inadequate description of the way attitudes are formed and structured. (Ajzen, 1991: 192)

The normative beliefs component of the TPA model is concerned with the likelihood that the behaviour will be endorsed as favourable or unfavourable by an important referent. If the strength of each belief is multiplied by the individual’s willingness to comply with the referent(s), the result then becomes the subjective norm. For Ajzen (1991), the concept of subjective norm should not only consider whether others would approve or not, but also whether the referents themselves would perform the particular behaviour.

A study that aimed to describe smoking habits among female teenagers of three different nationalities (Hanson, 1996) found significant relationships between attitudes, subjective norms, perceived control and smoking intentions, for only one group. Subjective norm was the only variable that was not significantly related to intentions in the remaining groups, suggesting that national culture may influence the subjective norms component of the TPB. Other studies have omitted the subjective norms component from their analysis, citing reasons that include poor past performance, and while there is evidence to support this view (Godin & Kok, 1996), some research has indicated that it may play a distinct

**Figure 1** The theory of planned behaviour
role in influencing intentions and behaviour (Trafimow & Findlay, 1996). For Armitage and Conner (2001), fluctuations in reliability may be a result of single item measures that many researchers use to tap this construct, and more work would be useful in understanding this issue.

The measure of perceived behavioural control (PBC) was added to the TPB to account for behaviours that were not under complete volitional control of the individual. As indicated in Figure 1, PBC is posited to influence both intentions and behaviour. That is, in conditions of complete control, the intention–behaviour relationship should be optimal; however, where the behaviour is not under complete volitional control, PBC would moderate the intention–behaviour relationship. Intuitively, the relationship between control and behaviour is obvious, and evidence suggests that the inclusion of the PBC component in TPB has increased the predictive ability of the model (Davies et al., 2002), although as indicated in Table 1, the increases are likely to be small.

As the TPB suggests, the collective weight of the attitudes, subjective norms and perceived control components are posited to influence behavioural intentions and then actual behaviour. Intentions have been described by Ajzen as ‘... the cognitive representation of a person’s readiness to perform a given behaviour, and it is considered to be the immediate antecedent of behaviour’ (2002). Support for the intentions–behaviour relationship has received mixed reviews but a recent meta-analytical study that examined 187 independent studies using the TPB reported a statistically significant relationship (39% of the variance) between what individuals intend to do and what they actually do (Armitage & Conner, 2001). Additionally, Boldero (1995) found that intentions correctly classified over 90% of behaviours, and individuals with stronger intentions were more likely to behave in accordance with them than those with weaker intentions. Other commentators have also recognised the importance of strong cogni-

### Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relationship</th>
<th>N of tests</th>
<th>R^av</th>
<th>R^2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multiple correlation (BI+PBC) with behaviour</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>0.52</td>
<td>0.27***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BI–behaviour correlation</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>0.47</td>
<td>0.22***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PBC–behaviour correlation</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>0.37</td>
<td>0.13***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Per cent variance added by PBC to behaviour</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>0.02***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiple correlation (ATT+SN+PBC) with BI</td>
<td>154</td>
<td>0.63</td>
<td>0.39***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATT–BI correlation</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>0.49</td>
<td>0.24***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SN–BI correlation</td>
<td>137</td>
<td>0.34</td>
<td>0.12***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PBC–BI correlation</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>0.43</td>
<td>0.18***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Per cent variance added by PBC to BI</td>
<td>136</td>
<td>0.24</td>
<td>0.06***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavioural belief–ATT correlation</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>0.50</td>
<td>0.25***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Normative belief–SN correlation</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>0.50</td>
<td>0.25***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control belief–PBC correlation</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>0.52</td>
<td>0.27***</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Armitage and Conner, 2001

***p < 0.001.

BI = behavioural intention; PBC = perceived behavioural control; ATT = attitude; SN = subjective norm
tive support in the formation of intention and the performance of actual behaviour (Bagozzi & Yi, 1989). Table 1 displays the findings of the Armitage and Conner (2001) study.

Despite an abundance of research involving the TPB there is a distinct lack of evidence that supports the efficacy of this model in predicting tourist behaviour. Tourism is a service industry, and as services are largely intangible, the decision to take a holiday, for example, is likely to be more complicated than purchasing a good that can be tested or inspected before consumption. Moreover, the cost of a holiday usually involves relatively high amounts of discretionary income, and for Swarbrooke and Horner (1999), a significant emotional investment.

Of the empirical work that has applied the TPB to examine leisure and recreational pursuits, areas that are closely related to the tourism experience, all have reported favourable outcomes. Oh and Hsu (2003), examining gambling behaviour, modified the TPB to include a past behaviour variable, and reported that the model demonstrated good predictive validity and recommended it as a useful tool for future research. Other studies focusing on the choice of leisure activities and hunting intentions have reported strong correlations between the components of the TPB and participants’ behavioural intentions (Ajzen & Driver, 1992; Hrubes et al., 2001). Despite this optimistic outlook, there have been some concerns with the TPB, and the following discussion examines these in depth.

**Problems with the TPB**

Few disagree with the positive link between intentions and behaviour; however, regardless of the popularity of the TPB, there exists much debate about conceptual and methodological aspects of the model. Not only have cultural values been neglected, but some assert that the inclusion of other variables, such as personal norms, self-identity, past behaviour or perceived need, can increase the predictive validity of the model (Norman & Smith, 1995; Sparks & Guthrie, 1998). This has prompted others to claim that the list of potential variables is unlimited (Davies et al., 2002). Furthermore, Ogden (2003) argued that the significant correlations could merely be an artifact of the cognitive similarities between the variables in the model. She also asserted that the nature of the items in a study may create, rather than assess cognitions, which in turn could influence behavioural intentions.

In an attempt to address some of these problems Davies et al. (2002) produced an 84-page manuscript that investigated seven propositions related to the TRA, the TPB and a model of altruistic behaviour first proposed by Schwartz in 1970 (Thogersen, 1996). The Schwartz model is cited in Figure 2 and was included because the focus of Davies et al.’s study was related to recycling of household waste – a behaviour that these authors held to involve considerable altruism.

For Schwartz, altruistic behaviour starts with social norms that are represented by the attitudes and values of specific referents, and these exist at the cultural or structural level of a society. Social norms are then adopted by individuals on the personal level and become personal norms that represent strong moral attitudes towards a behaviour. The development of personal norms is not only influenced by the existence of social norms but also by the frequency of the behaviour. That is to say, initially social norms may direct the behaviour, but as the behaviour is repeated the norms may be internalised to form personal norms
Whether or not personal norms influence behaviour depends on the relevance of the norms to the situation, and is more likely to guide behaviour when an individual has a high awareness of the consequences of a certain behaviour and acknowledges some form of responsibility.

In addition to evaluating the utility of the TRA and TPB, Davies et al. (2002) sought to determine how the inclusion of variables that captured past experience, personal norms, behavioural choices, affect and respondents demographics would interact. A selection of these results can be found in Table 2.

It is clear that the findings presented in Table 2 do not lend much support for TRA or TPB models as they stand alone, and the $R^2$ value of the TPB in this study falls well short of the 22% reported in Table 1. The addition of affect and personal norms to the TPB substantially improves the predictive ability of the model (19%), although the authors indicated that the addition of affect made little difference to the prediction of intentions. The Schwartz model, at 15%, also left a considerable amount of variance unexplained. A possible explanation for the low values reported in this study may rest with the way behaviour was operationalised. Instead of relying on respondents’ self-reported behaviour, the actual behaviour in this instance was observed, overcoming problems of distortion that have been associated with the former method (Pieters & Verplanken, 1995).

The integrated model proposed by these authors consisted of personal norms, affective evaluation, acceptance of responsibility, subjective norms, PBC and a component that they termed attitudes, which included the pros and cons of the behaviour, and whether the individual is cognisant of the behavioural choice. These, along with demographic variables, are reported to have explained 48% of the variance in recycling behaviour, and demographics alone accounted for 26% of this amount. In effect, the proposed model, when demographics are removed, explained only 3% more variance than the extended (affect + personal norms) TPB, and 5% less variance than the multiple correlations of the components of the TPB and behaviour reported in Armitage and Connor’s (2001) meta-analysis.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>$R^2$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TRA</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TPB</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TPB + affect</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TPB + personal norms</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TPB + affect + personal norms</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schwartz model</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrated model + attitudes + choice + demographics</td>
<td>48%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
There are a number of concerns related to this study that may also impact on the findings. First, not including the affect and social norm items (which were not mentioned), there appeared to be over 70 items in the questionnaire, so response fatigue is surely a threat. Second, the gap between the time when respondents completed the questionnaire and the behavioural observation stage was two weeks, and items in the questionnaire may have raised the participants’ awareness of recycling, in turn eliciting a behaviour (two weeks later) that was not consistent with their beliefs. Observing the recycling behaviour over a longer time period may in fact reveal weaker predictive power and more congruence between intentions and behaviour than what has been reported.

Third, without actually sighting the scale used to capture the affect component it is difficult to appraise how well this was represented. The only item reported asked respondents whether they felt ‘good’ about recycling, and there is surely more to affect than just ‘good’ or ‘not good’. Finally, the role of ethnicity or culture in influencing behaviour was not considered an issue that according to some continues to be neglected (Dodgson et al., 2003). This is despite the awareness that cultural values have been posited to have a direct and indirect influence on behaviour (Eid & Diener, 2001).

In an attempt to focus more specifically on the role of values and behaviour, Lee (2000) adapted a model first proposed by Triandis (1994) to understand aggression, sexual behaviour and conflict resolution, in order to explain consumer purchase intentions. The expanded antecedents for attitude toward the purchase included habit, past experience, personal norms, purchase affect and referent expectations and, unlike the TPB, the PBC was posited to influence only the actual behaviour, not intentions. For Triandis (1994), most of the components in this model are influenced by the situation where one finds oneself, and what he terms subjective culture. Subjective culture refers to:

> The ideas, the theories, the political, religious, scientific, aesthetic, economic, and social standards for judging events in the environment are human made and shape the way people view their environment. (Triandis, 1994: 87)

Many of the aspects contained within this model may be accounted for within the normative beliefs–subjective norms components of the TPB, the social norms–personal norms components of the Schwartz model, and in various parts of the integrative model proposed by Davies et al. (2002) and Triandis (1994). However, it may be done in much the same way as Schwartz suggested social norms precede all other elements in his model and identified a causal, rather than an interactive, relationship between subjective culture and the intervening psychological processes that lead to a behaviour. While this clearly places the role of subjective culture in a prominent position, operationalising such a broad concept, as Lee (2000) conceded, is problematic, and while acknowledging the limitations, she chose the cultural syndromes of individualism and collectivism (I-C) (Singelis et al., 1995) for such purposes.

One concern regarding Lee’s operationalisation of the model was the limited number of items used to capture each component, and this may have been in response to the number of components (12) that comprised the model. For example, the attitude toward the purchase component was measured with only three 7-point items, and these were not distilled from a larger pool of items.
Additionally, the affect component consisted of only two emotion items, and this falls well short of other emotion frameworks (Izard, 1977; White & Yu, 2005). At length, the trade-off between the length of the questionnaire and the reliability and validity of the components has cast serious doubts over the integrity of these findings.

After reviewing the multi-attribute models above, it seems that, overall, the TPB has proven to be the most robust and consistent option available. Whereas others have shown promise in some areas, conceptual and/or methodological shortfalls render the findings suspect, and raise questions as to whether more work would really contribute to better understandings. While the search for new attributes to explain more variance in intentions and behaviour will no doubt continue, perhaps the real focus may lie in further examination and refinement of components within the models discussed above, and two areas that appear to require more attention are the concepts of affect and cultural values.

The fact that affect has virtually been neglected has not gone unnoticed (Davies et al., 2002), and intuitively, when one considers how often they did something because they ‘felt’ like it, the notion that all behaviour is a result of rational and planned process begins to weaken. Ajzen himself appears to have recognised this shortcoming, as a recent publication of a scale that he employed to operationalise the attitude component of his model contained the emotions pleasant–unpleasant (Ajzen, 2002). Moreover, as the decision to purchase tourism products can involve a significant emotional investment, the inclusion of an affective component in a model of tourist behaviour seems too important to omit.

The idea that affect can influence behaviour is not a new one; indeed, the tri-component model of attitudes (see Figure 3) proposes that attitudes are formed by the interaction of beliefs, affect and behavioural intentions, and has received attention since the 1940s (Bootzin et al., 1991). In this view, the cognitive component consists of knowledge and perceptions that take the form of beliefs about an object. The affective component consists of the emotions, moods and feelings one has toward the object and the conative component is the likelihood or tendency that one will behave in a particular way toward the object. The non-linear characterisation of this model sets it apart from the multi-attribute models discussed above. In some respects it challenges the proposition of causal-

![Figure 3](C:\edrive\CIT\2005g\cit2005g.vp)

**Figure 3** The tri-component model of attitudes
ity, in that unlike the models discussed above, beliefs do not precede all other components; and also, the notion that all decisions are based on an ordered and rational process. The following discussion will develop in more detail two of these components, namely the affective and behavioural, and then examine the relationship between these two components and cultural values. The cognitive component of the model will not be considered further as beliefs and knowledge regarding the attributes of a product or service are usually specific to the offering being considered, and as such, cannot be generalised across situations or categories.

**Affect, emotions and behavioural intentions**

As mentioned above, affect has been posited to encompass both mood and emotion. However, given the considerable amount of literature that is available on each of these constructs, this review will focus solely on the latter. Recent work has illuminated the role of emotions in contributing to the explanation of variance in behaviour (Stauss & Neuhaus, 1997; White & Yu, 2005; Yu & Dean, 2001). For example, White (2003) and White and Scandale (2005) found that emotions and cognitive beliefs regarding a tourist visitation intentions accounted for 45% and 50% of the variance in consumers travel intentions, while (Yu & Dean, 2001) found that emotions and cognition accounted for 33% of the variance in word-of-mouth behavioural intentions. Further support for the role of affect in predicting purchase intentions was provided in a study that involved over 23,000 responses to 240 advertising messages, and the results indicated that affect was a much stronger predictor (accounting for more than twice the variance) of an individual’s behavioural intentions than was a cognitive component (Morris et al., 2002).

Other studies in this area have reported R² values exceeding 0.60 (Liljander & Strandvik, 1997) and when these values are compared to those in Tables 2 and 3 the affect–behavioural–cognitive model of attitudes appears to be at least comparable or perhaps a better alternative for the prediction of tourist behavioural intentions. Moreover, when compared to the multi-attribute models, there are fewer components, which should positively impact on questionnaire design, thus reducing respondent fatigue concerns. These findings question the notion that behavioural intentions are a result of reasoned processes and perhaps this is best expressed in the words of Trafimow et al. (2004):

> We began our investigations with the traditional premise that people’s behavioral intentions are the result of a reasoned process. In contradiction to this traditional premise, the between-participants analyses demonstrated that exactly the reverse was actually true. This finding, which has been replicated across three studies, suggests that researchers should give affect more credit as a determinant of behavioral intentions than has been true in the past. (Trafimon et al., 2004: 220)

Starting with the assumption that the environment can impact on an individual’s emotions, Mehrabian and Russell (1974), building on previous research (Morris et al., 2002), identified three emotional states that they posited mediated the relationship between the environment and human behaviour. Their model was based on three independent dimensions – pleasure, arousal and dominance.
(PAD) – and it was believed that these defined all emotional states. Using an adapted version of the PAD, Baloglu and Brinberg (1997) found that tourism destinations have distinctive positive and negative affective associations, while a later study found that the affective component was more likely to influence an individual’s overall image of a destination than a cognitive component (Baloglu & McCleary, 1999a). Similar patterns have emerged in other studies related to destination image (White, 2003; White & Scandale, 2005) that used the model, which appears to provide a robust option for capturing individuals’ affective states in relation to an environment.

A study conducted by Machleit and Eroglu (2000) tested three emotion models to determine which best predicted a variety of retail shoppers’ behaviour and experiences. One of these was the PAD and the other two were developed specifically for use in a marketing context (e.g. Izard, 1977). These were similar in that they shared the emotions of joy, sadness, surprise, disgust, anger and fear. The results indicated that the predictive ability of the two marketing frameworks was similar and that both of them outperformed the PAD model, suggesting that when it comes to emotions and consumption settings, as opposed to broad environments, alternatives other than the PAD might be more suitable. The implications of these findings for tourism practitioners suggest that the PAD may be useful for determining behavioural intentions at a holiday destination or wilderness area and the marketing frameworks may perform better in souvenir shop/retail travel kind of environment.

Building on previous work related to consumption emotions (Izard, 1977; Liljander & Strandvik, 1997; Stauss & Neuhaus, 1997; Zeelenberg & Pieters, 1999), White and Yu (2005) demonstrated that emotions can be conceptualised as a three-dimensional construct consisting of positive, negative and ‘bi-directional’ emotions. The latter included the emotions of anger and disappointment and are referred to as bi-directional because it is possible for a consumer to feel angry and disappointed with themselves for selecting a service, and also with the service provider for being responsible for the negative experience. The identification of this third dimension advanced understandings of the emotions construct and, correlations with a range of behavioural intentions that to date no other model has managed to achieve. The individual emotions that comprise each dimension can be found in Table 3.

From a practitioner’s perspective the emerging work related to emotions and the prediction of consumer behavioural intentions is too important to ignore, and this is particularly so for those involved in an industry such as tourism. Capturing the way people feel about a destination or product, alongside traditional cognitive attribute belief measures, can greatly enhance planning decisions and provide unique insights into the way consumers view potential or existing offerings.

Table 3 Emotion dimensions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Positive emotions</th>
<th>Negative emotions</th>
<th>Bi-directional emotions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Happy</td>
<td>Depressed</td>
<td>Disappointed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hopeful</td>
<td>Guilty</td>
<td>Angry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positively surprised</td>
<td>Regretful</td>
<td>Humiliated</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Behavioural intentions**

Early research into consumer behavioural intentions failed to fully account for the range of behaviours a consumer may adopt. Cronin and Taylor (1992) used a single-item measure of purchase intentions, while Boulding et al. (1993), used purchase intentions and willingness to recommend, and clearly such a narrow definition of a complex construct limited the usefulness of the findings. In 1994, Parasuraman et al. proposed an expanded model that encompassed five dimensions: loyalty to company, propensity to switch, willingness to pay more, external response to a problem and internal response to a problem. This particular model has received considerable attention since its inception (Bloemer et al., 1999; de Ruyter et al., 1998; Yu & Dean, 2001; Zeithaml et al., 1996).

While there is no doubt that conceptualising consumer behavioural intentions as a five-dimensional construct has enriched theoretical and practical applications and outcomes, there have been concerns raised regarding the number of dimensions and the reliability of some of the subscales within the model. A study conducted by Yu and Dean (2001) reported a four-dimension solution and that captured areas they labelled positive word of mouth, complaining intentions, switching intentions and willingness to pay more. The alpha coefficient for the positive word of mouth dimension was a healthy 0.94; however, the willingness to pay dimension registered only 0.40 – a figure that is considerably lower than the 0.70 recommended by Nunnally (1978). The four-factor model was further supported in a later study (White & Yu, 2005). Despite these shortfalls the behavioural intentions scale appears to be the most comprehensive conceptualisation of the consumer behavioural intentions construct available. The model can be cited in Table 4.

**Table 4 Model of consumer behavioural intentions**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Loyalty to company</th>
<th>Propensity to switch</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Say positive things about the firm.</td>
<td>Do less business with the firm in the future.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommend the firm to someone else.</td>
<td>Would consider shopping at another firm that offers more attractive prices.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Encourage friends to shop at the same firm.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do more business with the firm in the future.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Would consider this firm as my first choice in the future.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Willingness to pay more</th>
<th>External response to a problem</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Continue with the same firm if the price increases.</td>
<td>Complain to other customers if I experience problems.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pay a higher price for the benefits currently received.</td>
<td>Complain to external agencies if I experience problems.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Try to switch to another firm if I experience problems.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Internal response to a problem</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Complain to the firm’s staff if I experience problems.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Understanding values

Before reviewing studies on cultural values and behaviour there are some issues related to different types of values that have implications for researchers, and need to be addressed. The most important of these relates to the ‘level of analysis’. For example, at the organisational level, an individual may choose to adopt the behaviours and attitudes that are valued by the organisation in order to remain or progress within that environment. When the individual leaves the organisation to go home, another set of values is likely to guide and order behaviours that are appropriate to that context, and so on.

In addition to organisational values, individuals are governed by personal, cultural, social and religious values and each of these value systems is likely to influence an individual’s choices and behaviours. For example, the way someone acts or behaves in the company of their friends may be different from the way they act or behave in front of their parents, or at work. Little is known about how these different value systems interact to influence attitudes or behaviours, although some studies have found significant correlations between personal and cultural value frameworks (Cukur et al., 2004) and another established that work and cultural values, while correlated, were still distinct domains (White, 2006). In discussing the relationship between personal and cultural value systems, Rohan (2000: 265) proposed that cultural value systems are ‘… people’s perceptions of others’ judgments about best possible living or functioning, that is, others’ value priorities’; therefore, when one focuses on ‘others’, then cultural value priorities are at issue.

A further distinction between personal and cultural values was made by Schwartz (1999), who proposed that the dimensions of cultural values are different from individual values and that the validity of cultural level values should be determined by the social or cultural group, not the individual person. For Schwartz (1999), personal value priorities are both a product of shared culture and personal experience and members of different cultural groups are socialised to adopt shared social values. He adds:

... the average priorities attributed to different values by societal members reflect the central thrust of their shared enculturalisation. Hence the average priorities point to the underlying, common cultural values. (Schwartz, 1999: 26)

In other words, cultural level dimensions can be determined by averaging the value scores across samples, whereas individual level dimensions that are found within samples, or cultures, are determined by covariation in the mean scores of individuals. The implication of this reasoning is that the same set of values, or instrument, can generate both personal and cultural dimensions depending upon the level of statistical analysis. For example, Schwartz’s (1999) theory of cultural values was validated by using 45 items out of the 57 that comprised the Schwartz Value Survey (SVS) (Schwartz, 1992), an instrument designed to discern the value priorities of individuals.

These items were extracted because analysis of the original data set indicated that they held equivalent meaning across all the nationalities involved in the study. Not surprisingly, this analysis generated a similar value relationship
structure as the individual analysis had some years earlier. For example, values that correlated to form the dimensions of power and achievement in the SVS, correlated in a similar manner at the culture level analysis, except, in this instance, the dimensions were labelled hierarchy and mastery respectively. Perhaps what is actually happening here is in fact an indication of common individual values at the country level and not cultural values.

If culture is a collective phenomenon that includes beliefs, attitudes, values, norms and roles that are learnt and shared by people who live in the same social environment (Hofstede, 1991; Triandis, 1995), then the identification of cultural values must happen in relation to others. That is, an individual may indicate a high importance for the value of ambition when asked if it were a guiding principle in their life, but indicate a different value if asked to agree or disagree with a statement such as my friends and family believe ambition is important. An individual can value ambition, but because of the shared ownership of values at the cultural level, the intensity and valence of the response may alter according to the cultural context. The notion that values at various levels form distinct constructs, that at times need to be reconciled, is not a new issue (Rohan, 2000). The implications of this in terms of measuring values are that, first, one must be clear about what level of values they are focusing on, and second, that a different approach is necessary at each level.

Cultural values

After reviewing various definitions of values, Schwartz and Bilsky (1987) identified five features that are common to all. They are (1) concepts or beliefs, (2) about desirable end states or behaviours, (3) that transcend specific situations, (4) guide selection or evaluation of behaviour and events, and (5) are ordered by relative importance. These characteristics have led many academics to argue that value systems are primarily cognitive structures (Schwartz & Bardi, 2001) that occupy core positions within attitudes and beliefs, although it has also been argued that values are linked to affective processes (Rohan, 2000). Cultural values form specific norms that are implicitly or explicitly shared by members of a society and serve to instruct individuals and economic and political institutions, for example, how to function or act in specific circumstances.

Schwartz (1999) identified seven cultural value types (extracted from the 10 he identified for measuring individual values) that were based on what he claimed were three issues that all societies confront. The first related to the nature of the relationship between the individual and the group, the second related to maintaining the social fabric and how authority or power roles are decided and accepted, and the third, the way in which a society relates to the natural and social world.

Similar dimensions were proposed by Hofstede (1980), whose landmark study identified four broad values areas that could purportedly be used to distinguish one culture from another. One of these related to relationships with authority, another to the relationship between the individual and the group, the third to control of aggression, and the last was concerned with the social implications of being born a male or female. A fifth was added sometime later to more fully account for Asian cultural differences (Hofstede, 1991).
The work of Hofstede has received considerable acclaim, and his model frequently appears in academic articles related to cross-cultural research. Despite the popularity of his work, some have questioned whether there are four dimensions of cultural values, and whether the items in his questionnaire are capturing work and not cultural values (White, in press, b). The Schwartz model has been extensively tested with large and, at times, near representative samples (Schwartz, 1992, 1994; Schwartz & Bardi, 2001; Schwartz & Bilsky, 1987, 1990) and it is possibly the most comprehensive theoretical representation of the personal values construct.

Applying it at the cultural values level is another matter, and in the view of the present author, the responses to his survey items are not formed in relation to others. For example, the SVS consists of 54 values that include wealth, authority and freedom, and each of these is accompanied by a short descriptor. Respondents are requested to indicate to what extent each item is an important guiding principle in their lives, and clearly this method is suitable for capturing individual values. However, as discussed above, the importance an individual places on each value may change if they are required to consider the value within a broader cultural, or ‘others’, context.

A close inspection of these two models indicates that there are similarities between them. For example, they both recognise the cultural syndromes of individualism and collectivism (Cukur et al., 2004), and these two constructs have been extensively used by social scientists for well over a century (Watson, 2002) to explain cultural differences (Voronov & Singer, 2002). Another similarity is that both incorporate a component that Hofstede (1980) labelled ‘power distance’, which refers to the authority relations between members of a society. These two components have been combined by other scholars (Triandis, 1995) to form four distinct cultural patterns. A description of each pattern can be found in Table 5.

This model, known as Horizontal and Vertical, Individualism and Collectivism (H&V, I&C), has been attracting considerable attention for some time, and

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 5 Characteristics of the HandV, IandC model</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Horizontal Individualism: a cultural pattern where an autonomous self is postulated, but the individual is more or less equal in status with others. The self is independent and the same as the self of others. The personal characteristic associated with this dimension has also been described as unique.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Horizontal Collectivism: a cultural pattern in which the individual sees the self as an aspect of an in-group. That is, the self is merged with the members of the in-group, all of whom are extremely similar to each other. Equality is the essence of this pattern.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vertical Individualism: a cultural pattern in which an autonomous self is postulated, but individuals see each other as different, and inequality is expected. The self is independent and different from the self of others. Competition is an important aspect of this pattern.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vertical Collectivism: a cultural pattern in which the individual sees the self as an aspect of an in-group, but the members of the group are different from each other, some having more status than others. The self is interdependent and different from the self of others. Serving and sacrificing for the in-group is an important aspect of this pattern.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
numerous studies have supported its convergent and discriminate validity (Abraham, 1998; Choiu, 2001; Oshi et al., 1998; Singelis et al., 1995; White, 2005; White, in press, a, b). Another feature of the H&V, I&C is that it is operationalised by a scale of 32 items, which is considerably less than the SVS, making it a more economical and viable alternative to other cultural value frameworks. Moreover, an inspection of the items within the H&V, I&C questionnaire indicates that a substantial number of them are framed in reference to others. While the names and number of the dimensions differ from one model to another, there is general consensus that values guide or influence behaviour, and the following discussion examines this relationship in more detail.

Values and behaviour

Research in the area of values and consumer behaviour in a tourism context has been largely ignored (Crotts, 2004), which is surprising given that a considerable amount of tourism activity involves interactions between people from different cultures. From a cross-cultural perspective, much of the work that has been done focuses on differences in cultural characteristics (Reisinger & Turner, 1999), or satisfaction with some aspect of a travel experience (Poon & Yong, 2005). This information, while interesting, is mostly descriptive, and for some time it has been recognised that only a relatively small portion of satisfied customers return to the same service or product (Oliver, 1999; Stauss & Neuhaus, 1997). Moreover, a text that was written specifically on cross-cultural behaviour in tourism, and praised for ‘being the first to focus on this link’ (Thyne, 2004), completely neglected to consider any theoretical perspectives related to behaviour (Reisinger & Turner, 2003). Some empirical work that has examined the national culture/behaviour link in a tourism context has tentatively supported the view that national culture (not cultural values specifically) does influence consumers’ evaluation of a service, their repurchase intentions and their willingness to recommend the service to others (Crotts & Erdmann, 2000), but obviously, more research is needed to confirm these findings.

Outside the tourism realm, numerous studies have evidenced the relationship between personal values and the formation of perceptions and behaviour (Maio & Olson, 1995; Rohan, 2000; Schultz & Zelezny, 1999); however, the link between cultural values and behaviour rests more with assumptions than with empirical support (Rohan, 2000). Hofstede’s (2001) review of studies related to his model reported significant cultural level correlations between his value dimensions and attitudes and behaviour; however, the strength of the conclusions drawn from this work has been questioned on the basis of sample size and issues of defining behaviours across cultures (Schwartz, 1999). In contrast to Hofstede’s findings, other work that has examined the values–behaviour relationship at the country level has reported very few correlations (Briley & Wyer, 2001; Smith et al., 2002).

Sun et al. (2004) found differences in behaviour between individuals in collectivist and individualistic countries. The results indicated that those from individualistic cultures were happier and more optimistic about the future, more likely to sample unusual experiences, and more likely to tolerate risk and uncertainty than those from collectivist cultures. In a study conducted by Aaker and Maheswaran (1997), participants from collectivist cultures were found to exhibit
similar information-processing strategies to those with an individualistic cultural orientation. That said, differences were noted in attitudinal outcome and these authors suggested that, when it comes to persuasion, collectivists were more likely to be influenced by ‘consensus cues’ than attribute information. Finally, a study that focused on consumer complaining intentions (Huang, 1994) found that American respondents were more likely to voice their complaints to retailers than respondents from Taiwan, but that the Taiwanese were more likely to stop buying the brand.

In terms of cultural values, it appears that there is fairly strong evidence for and against the likelihood of cultural values influencing behaviour, and clearly more work is necessary in order to enable better understandings of the relationship between these two areas, particularly in a tourism context and the H&V, I&C and behavioural intention models discussed above provide an excellent means for pursuing such a study.

Cultural values, emotions and behaviour

Markus and Kitayama (1991), in reviewing the relationship between culture, cognition, emotion and motivation, posited that individuals in different cultures can have different construals of the self and of others, and the interdependence of the two, and the way the construals are constructed can determine the nature of individual experience. These authors cite the differences between Asian cultures, where the emphasis is on fitting in and harmonious interdependence with others, and the US, where the expression of uniqueness and independence from others is typically found. Emotions, therefore systematically ‘...follow, and also foster and reinforce, an independent or an interdependent construal of the self’ (p. 235). In the view of these authors, emotions such as anger and frustration (ego-focused) should be more often experienced and expressed by individuals with independent selves, and emotions of shame and sympathy (self-conscious) would more likely to be experienced and expressed by individuals with an interdependent self.

More recent empirical support for this claim has been provided by Fischer et al. (1999). They found that the Dutch rated individualistic values more important than did Spanish nationals, who rated collectivistic values more highly. Their findings found systematic differences in the way that self-conscious emotions of shame and pride were conceptualised. More specifically, the findings revealed that the Spanish were less likely to report their pride, or to share their pride experiences with others, and the Spanish additionally reported less social approval of pride. In terms of shame, the Spanish respondents were more concerned with the social implications of shameful events; however, they were more likely to share their experiences with others than the Dutch.

A study that investigated emotions in collectivist and individualist contexts determined that emotions were shaped in a manner that was congruent with the ideas and practices of the culture in which they occurred (Mesquita, 2001). The findings suggested that emotions in collectivist cultures were more closely aligned with assessment of social worth, reflected reality rather than the inner world of the individual, and were not confined to the subject self.

The implications for emotional expression in cultures of a collectivist nature is that happiness, for example, will be less likely to be expressed in the event that it
contrasts and disrupts the emotional state of others (Mesquita & Walker, 2003). The outward expression of anger has been frowned upon in cultures of a collectivist nature, where harmonious social relations are valued (Markus & Kitayama, 1991). In terms of behaviour, and in response to standardised vignettes, American respondents reported aggressive outputs, such as bellowing at another person much more frequently than Japanese respondents, who, despite feeling the same emotion, were more likely to do nothing in a similar situation.

Further evidence to support the role of cultural influences on decision-making came from research that used the TRA to predict behavioural intentions in collectivist and individualistic cultures. The results indicated that normative beliefs were most important in the former and that personal attitudes (considered more affective) were more influential in the latter (Suh et al., 1998). This pattern was further sustained in a study that involved almost 7000 respondents from 40 different countries, and at length, emotions, as compared to norms, were by far the best predictor of life satisfaction for individualists; whereas, for collectivists, both norms and emotions were equally important. Clearly, and with few exceptions (White & Scandale, 2005), and in contrast to the universalists’ assumption that emotions do not vary substantially across cultures, the overwhelming evidence suggests that cultural orientations, in particular individualism and collectivism, can influence the way emotions are regulated and expressed.

These findings create a number of challenges for practitioners, not the least of which is being able to obtain frank feedback on service performance from guests that for cultural reasons are reluctant to express their true feelings. Aggregating questionnaire item scores provided by guests with different cultural orientations is likely to mask important differences and delay attempts to rectify service shortfalls. Moreover, it has been demonstrated that individuals from the same country do not all share the same cultural values (White, in press, a), therefore it would be wrong to assume that all Chinese, for example, have a collectivist cultural orientation. Cultural orientations therefore need to be determined for each individual, which in turn will lengthen and complicate the information collection process, until shorter forms of cultural value measures become available.

Another challenge that these findings pose for practitioners is in designing communication strategies that can stimulate a desired emotional response to a service or destination, in audiences with different cultural value orientations. It would follow that if cultural values and emotions are linked, and emotions are related to behavioural intentions, then some adjustment to advertising material may be necessary. The extent and nature of the adjustment is likely to be influenced by factors other than just cultural values, and more qualitative and quantitative research is needed to enlighten decisions regarding this issue.

**Conclusion**

The preceding discussion began by reviewing literature and empirical findings related to understanding and predicting human behaviour. The notion that all behaviour is rational and planned and stems from cognitive beliefs that then influence norms and attitudes was challenged and an alternative conceptualisation was presented. This alternative, known as the tri-component model of atti-
tudes has been relatively under-investigated in the tourism literature, and it would appear to hold much promise as it overcomes many of the limitations associated with more popular theories.

Two potential predictors of behaviour that had not been adequately represented in the tourism literature, emotions and cultural values, were both analysed in terms of their individual relationship with behaviour or behavioural intentions, and their combined effects on behaviour. Three models were identified as being suitable for operationalising behavioural intentions, emotions and cultural values, with the aim of facilitating current and future activities of researchers and practitioners alike.

This review served two purposes, first, to ‘round up’ and elaborate on areas that have important implications for tourism management professionals and academics, and second, to provide avenues for future research. In terms of the latter, more work is needed in order to understand the relationship between emotions, cultural values and cognition, as some have suggested that cultural values serve cognitive functions while others have posited that they have an affective element. The causal relationship between these constructs has also been disputed with some suggesting that emotional processes precede cognitive processes, and others suggesting that cognitive processes and cultural values precede affect (Lee, 2000).

It is not yet clear whether the addition of cultural value variables to affective and cognitive measures will explain more variance in consumer behavioural intentions. To take this one step further, it would be interesting to observe how each of the cultural patterns identified by Triandis (1995) interact with emotion and cognitive dimensions to influence a range of consumer behavioural intentions. Finally, more attention needs to be devoted to understanding the relationships between different levels of values, and how the different levels function in guiding and influencing behaviour. Such a study may provide unique insights into why the behaviour of tourists on holiday often differs from their behaviour at home.

**Correspondence**

Any correspondence should be directed to Christopher J. White, Charles Darwin University, Coordinator: Hospitality & Tourism Higher Education, Casuarina, NT 0909, Australia (christopher.white@cdu.edu.au).

**Reference**


Culture, Emotions and Behavioural Intentions

The Dynamic Role of Consumption Emotions: Implications for the Service Quality, Satisfaction and Word of Mouth Model.

Christopher J White

RMIT University, School of Economics, Finance & Marketing
(Christopher.white@rmit.edu.au)

Abstract

The aim of this study was to determine the validity of a three factor model of emotions and to simultaneously examine the relationship between emotions and the service quality – satisfaction – word of mouth intentions process. The findings indicated that a three factor model was more appropriate than a two factor conceptualisation, and after minor modifications, demonstrated an acceptable fit to the data. Additionally, an examination of the role of emotions on overall service quality (OSQ), overall satisfaction (OS) and word of mouth intentions (W of M) at two time periods within an extended service encounter, revealed for the first time the complexity of the relationship, and a number of theoretical and practical considerations are discussed.

1. Introduction

Consumption emotions have for some time now been the focus of academic interest (Alford & Sherrell, 1996; Bagozzi, Gopinath, & Nyer, 1999; Foxall & Greenley, 1999; Izard, 1977; Oliver, 1993; White & Yu, 2005). Emotions have been found to be significant predictors of firm loyalty (Yu & Dean, 2001), customer satisfaction (Mano & Oliver, 1993) and behavioural intentions (Morris, Woo, Geason, & Kim, 2002), and while few question that emotions influence human behaviour, the cause of emotions is still being debated (Nyer, 1997).

Put simply, differences in perspective as to the cause of emotions relate to whether emotions result from a cognitive appraisal of an event (Bagozzi et al., 1999), or can be formed without any prior evaluation, or with non cognitive information processing (Izard, 1977; Zajonc, 1980). From a practical position the cognitive model has a long tradition, and evidence that certain appraisals have been shown to cause emotions (Roseman & Evdokas, 1994) is lending support for this widely accepted view (Nyer, 1997).

One such appraisal model can be found in Figure 1, which displays positive and negative discrete emotions and specifies conditions for their occurrence. The five appraisals are motive consistent / inconsistent with positive or negative emotions, appetitive (reward) / aversive (absence of punishment), agency or attribution of the cause, probability of whether an outcome is certain or uncertain and finally perceived control potential. This model not only identifies the proximity of various emotions to each other, but also indicates how changes in appraisals can transform one emotion into another. For example, if one does not believe they have the potential to control the attainment of a reward, frustration changes to sadness, additionally, sadness changes to regret if one believes that an uncontrollable non attainment of a reward was cause by the self rather than circumstances (Roseman, Antoniou, & Jose, 1996).

Such contributions to the emotion literature, have the potential to compliment and extend existing emotion frameworks (Izard, 1977; Richins, 1997; Russell, 1980) and provide a fruitful avenue for future research. The Roseman, et al. (1996) model does not however take into consideration all emotions and fails to account for possible interactive effects, or ways in which several emotions combine to influence an event or construct. These concerns have prompted some to suggest that a fewer number of higher order emotion dimensions could be a more effective way of operationalising the emotion construct (White & Yu, 2005).
The common way of measuring emotions in marketing is by self-report, usually via questionnaires, and various multivariate techniques are used to analyse the data (Bagozzi et al., 1999). With few exceptions (Nyer, 1997; Ruth, Brunel, & Ottes, 2002), the tendency has been to focus on broad general factors, as opposed to discrete emotions, as discriminate validity between measures of related emotions has been lacking (Bagozzi, 1993), and because of the large number of potential emotions that have been studied in consumer research. Laros & Steenkamp (2005) for example reported over 300 emotion words that had been used in 10 studies, and while some attempts have focused on identifying a set of basic emotions that can account for all, it has been shown that emotion theorists cannot agree on what constitutes the basic set (Ortony & Turner, 1990). Uncertainty also exists regarding the number and content of the broad factors; Richins (1997), found 16 dimensions that included anger, shame and joy, while Russell, Weiss, & Mendelsohn (1989) found two, pleasure and arousal. Most studies however, that have included emotions of a positive and negative nature have found that items load on two positive and negative dimensions of the general term, affect.

A recent study, White & Yu (2005) reported findings on emotions in an extended service context and these authors identified a three dimensional model of emotions, that with associated factor loadings can be cited in Table 1. Joining positive and negative affect was a dimension these authors labelled bi-directional, which comprised of the emotions angry and disappointed and these differed from other negative emotions (eg. guilty, regret and humiliated) in that it is possible for a consumer to be angry with a service provider, and disappointed with themselves for selecting that provider.

### Table 1  Three dimensions of emotions and factor loadings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Component</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. Positive Emotions</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hopeful</td>
<td>.882</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Happy</td>
<td>.847</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positively Surprised</td>
<td>.749</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2. Negative Emotions</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guilty</td>
<td>.836</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humiliated</td>
<td>.752</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Depressed</td>
<td>.701</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regretful</td>
<td>.561</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3. Bi-Directional</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Angry</td>
<td>.838</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disappointed</td>
<td>.797</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As indicated in Table 2, this particular dimension was found to be statistically associated with a range of behavioural intentions, that included complaining, a link that had not been previously established. The exploratory nature of this work was unable to confirm the validity of this three dimensional conceptualisation prompting the following research question:

Research question 1. Will the three dimension model of emotions provide a significant improvement over the two dimensional positive / negative affect model?

Table 2  Correlations between emotion dimensions and consumer behavioural intentions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Positive emotions</th>
<th>Negative emotions</th>
<th>Bi-directional</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Positive WOM</td>
<td>.581**</td>
<td>- .285**</td>
<td>- .337**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complaining</td>
<td>-.097</td>
<td>.102</td>
<td>.290**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switching behavior</td>
<td>-.108**</td>
<td>.267**</td>
<td>.337**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Willingness to pay more</td>
<td>.324**</td>
<td>-.068</td>
<td>-.198**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

** Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed)

Source White & Yu, 2005

An emotion framework by itself is of little value to practitioners’ or theory development, and as a consequence emotions have been utilized to understand constructs such as customer satisfaction (Westbrook & Oliver, 1991), post purchase processes (Westbrook, 1987), in conjunction with cognition in forming satisfaction judgements (Homburg, Koschat, & Hoyer, 2006), the prediction of behavioural intentions (Morris et al., 2002) and service quality (Chui & Wu, 2002; Jaing & Wang, 2006). With few exceptions, the majority of this work has been cross-sectional, and as a result, failed to fully capture the nature of customer service usage over time (Bolton & Lemon, 1999). Moreover, as the causal link between service quality, satisfaction and behavioural intentions has been well documented (Caruana, 1999; Spreng & Mackoy, 1996; Spreng, Shi, & Page, 2005; Taylor & Baker, 1994; Teas, 1993), to date, no study has actually observed the way emotions interact with these constructs during this process, and the following discussion summarises what relationships are know to exist.

The notion that customer satisfaction is largely an affective state, that includes emotions, has received substantial support for at least two decades (Giese & Cote, 2000; Westbrook, 1987; Westbrook & Oliver, 1991; White & Yu, 2005). Oliver, (1993) found that positive and negative emotions influence satisfaction in a positive and negative direction respectively. Nyer (1997) found that satisfaction and joy were highly correlated and summed both items to form a composite score. The single item explained 58% of the variance in positive word of mouth with a significant standardised path coefficient of .76.

White (2006) reported that a measure of overall service quality, positive and negative emotions were all significantly correlated with loyalty intentions and together explained 57% of the variance in that construct. Jaing & Wang (2006) examined the relationship between the emotions of pleasure and arousal and satisfaction and service quality, and found that arousal significantly predicted both, in a hedonic service context, while pleasure was significantly associated with both constructs in both contexts. Taken together, these finding indicate that emotions can influence service quality, satisfaction and behavioural intentions, including positive word of mouth, however given an absence of work that has examined the simultaneously influence of emotions on each of these construct and over time, specific hypotheses cannot be stated with reasonable certainty, as such the following research questions have been devised to shed light on this problem:

Research question 2. What is the relationship between emotions, and the service quality, satisfaction and word-of mouth-intentions model over time?

2. Methodology
2.1 Procedure
Data was collected from university undergraduate students taking the same course at the start of a semester and towards the end of the semester. Respondents were requested to complete a questionnaire, that was designed to capture their emotional reactions towards the institution where they were studying, their perceptions of service quality, overall
satisfaction and their word of mouth intentions. A similar questionnaire, that included the same emotion framework, was distributed 12 months later to a new cohort of students taking the same course.

After screening the three data sets for missing values, outliers and normality, a total of 188, 145 and 160 usable responses were obtained from the three time periods respectively. The data from time 3 was used to cross validate the emotions model. The data from time 1 and 2 was used to examine the effect of emotions on the service quality – satisfaction – intentions model. The average age of respondents was 24.5 years and of these, 55% were female and 45% male, and there were 30 different nationalities represented within the sample.

2.2 Measures
Each of the nine emotions (see Table 1) were accompanied by a seven-point Likert scale, where ‘1’ was never, and ‘7’ often, and participants were requested to indicate how frequently they experienced each emotion during the service encounter. Word of mouth intentions were captured using three items from a behavioural intentions battery, developed by Parasuraman, Zeithaml, & Berry (1994). This scale has consistently demonstrated strong reliability across a variety of contexts (Bloemer, de Rutyer, & Wetzels, 1999; Yu & Dean, 2001; Zeithaml, Berry, & Parasuraman, 1996). Each item was accompanied by a seven-point Likert scale where ‘1’ was very unlikely, and ‘7’, very likely. Overall satisfaction and service quality were measured on a single seven point strongly disagree / strongly agree scale. Participants were requested to indicate the extent they agreed or disagreed with the following statements, ‘Overall, I am very satisfied with my experience at …….’ and ‘Overall, the quality of service that I have received from ……. has been of a very high standard’.

2.3 Data analysis
As mentioned above, the data was screened to ensure the assumptions relating to Confirmatory Factor Analysis and Structural Equation Modelling were met and the study will now proceed with the presentation on results.

3. Results
In relation to the first research question, data from times one and two were pooled and confirmatory factor analysis was used to determine whether the two or three factor models provided a better fit the data. The three factor model as proposed by White and Yu was found to be a poor fit \( \chi^2 = 119.94, \nu = 24, p = .000, \text{AGFI} .859, \text{CFI} .905, \text{RMSE} .110 \), however it provided a slightly better fit to the data than the two factor positive / negative conceptualisation, \( \chi^2 = 162.26, \nu = 26, p = .000, \text{AGFI} .810, \text{CFI} .865, \text{RMSE} .126 \). As such the three component model was respecified in order to identify the true model and improve model fit. After examining the Critical ratios, Standardised residual and Modification indices, and taking into consideration the theoretical underpinnings of the emotion domain, regret and positively surprised were identified as being responsible for model misspecification and were removed. The respecified model was a substantial improvement on the original, with the AGFI, CFI & RMSEA fit indices indicting an acceptable data model fit (\( \chi^2 = 24.18, \nu = 11, p = .012, \text{AGFI} .947, \text{CFI} .980, \text{RMSEA} .060 \)). Additionally, the factor structure coefficients displayed in Table 3 empirically support the discriminate validity of the respecified model.

![Fig. 2 Respecified three component emotion model.](image)
Table 3  Factor structure for Tri component model of satisfaction emotions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Bi-directional</th>
<th>Negative</th>
<th>Positive</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>depressed</td>
<td>.422</td>
<td>.732</td>
<td>-.294</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>angry</td>
<td>.707</td>
<td>.407</td>
<td>-.283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>disappointed</td>
<td>.735</td>
<td>.424</td>
<td>-.295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>humiliated</td>
<td>.373</td>
<td>.647</td>
<td>-.260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>guilty</td>
<td>.377</td>
<td>.655</td>
<td>-.263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>happy</td>
<td>-.372</td>
<td>-.373</td>
<td>.928</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hopeful</td>
<td>-.306</td>
<td>-.307</td>
<td>.765</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For cross validation purposes, the model was tested on data from an independent sample (time 3). Confirmatory factor analysis was used to determine the extent to which the respecified tri component solution was based on chance relationships; that is, to determine whether the same model would hold across two distinct populations. The manage groups option in AMOS was used for this purpose and the estimates for the paths in both groups were calculated simultaneously, with direct path estimates allowed to differ across both groups. The chi-square for this model was 42.976 with 22 degrees of freedom. To determine the significance of the observed differences, the parameter estimates in both groups were constrained to be equal and this model produced a chi-square of 43.570 with 26 degrees of freedom, and a chi-square difference test across the constrained and unconstrained models clearly indicated there were no significant differences. Taken together, these findings support the respecified three dimension conceptualisation of the emotions construct.

Having identified a suitable emotion model the second objective if this study was to examine the relationship between the emotions, service quality, satisfaction and WOM intentions. Figure 3 displays the full model with a path from each of the emotion dimensions leading to OSQ, OS and W of M. As OSQ and OS are single items the error variances have been set at 0.23, the smallest value found for the other estimated error variances (Anderson & Gerbing, 1988). The associated λ has been set to .90 as single item reliability has been shown to be high (Anderson & Gerbing, 1988), and this figure was based on the assumption that 90% of the observed score variance was actual true variance. In testing the measurement model for the word of mouth construct, two items ‘recommend the ….. to others’ (recom), and ‘encourage others to apply’, were found to be highly correlated (.95) and as essentially they were measuring the same thing, the ‘encourage’ item was removed, leaving two items to represent this construct. The other being ‘say positive things’. The respecified word of mouth measurement model provided an excellent fit to the data.

Table 4 provides the mean, alpha coefficients and correlations between the constructs for both time periods. It is evident that as the semester progressed, perceptions and feelings toward the institution decreased. The alpha coefficients were at acceptable levels in both time periods (Nunnally, 1978) and OS and W of M correlated strongly both times.

Table 4  Means, alpha coefficients and correlations between the constructs prior to modelling, for time 1 and 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>α</th>
<th>Bi-directional</th>
<th>Negative</th>
<th>Positive</th>
<th>OSQ</th>
<th>OS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bi-directional</td>
<td>4.26</td>
<td>.70</td>
<td>.635**</td>
<td>-.505**</td>
<td>-.255**</td>
<td>.386**</td>
<td>.505**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>2.84</td>
<td>.70</td>
<td>-.339**</td>
<td>.466**</td>
<td>.389**</td>
<td>.505**</td>
<td>.799**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>4.90</td>
<td>.82</td>
<td>-.403**</td>
<td>-.276**</td>
<td>.513**</td>
<td>.416**</td>
<td>.799**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OSQ</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>.70</td>
<td>-.510**</td>
<td>-.201*</td>
<td>.720**</td>
<td>.749**</td>
<td>.852**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OS</td>
<td>4.54</td>
<td>.83</td>
<td>-.711**</td>
<td>-.185*</td>
<td>.720**</td>
<td>.749**</td>
<td>.852**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W of M</td>
<td>4.96</td>
<td>.88</td>
<td>-.581**</td>
<td>-.231*</td>
<td>.727**</td>
<td>.657**</td>
<td>.852**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

** Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>α</th>
<th>Bi-directional</th>
<th>Negative</th>
<th>Positive</th>
<th>OSQ</th>
<th>OS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bi-directional</td>
<td>4.37</td>
<td>.67</td>
<td>-.466**</td>
<td>.503**</td>
<td>.389**</td>
<td>.505**</td>
<td>.799**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>2.95</td>
<td>.73</td>
<td>-.510**</td>
<td>-.201*</td>
<td>.720**</td>
<td>.749**</td>
<td>.852**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>4.54</td>
<td>.83</td>
<td>-.711**</td>
<td>-.185*</td>
<td>.720**</td>
<td>.749**</td>
<td>.852**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OSQ</td>
<td>3.82</td>
<td>.70</td>
<td>-.476**</td>
<td>-.201*</td>
<td>.720**</td>
<td>.749**</td>
<td>.852**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OS</td>
<td>4.23</td>
<td>.73</td>
<td>-.581**</td>
<td>-.231*</td>
<td>.727**</td>
<td>.657**</td>
<td>.852**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W of M</td>
<td>4.21</td>
<td>.93</td>
<td>-.581**</td>
<td>-.231*</td>
<td>.727**</td>
<td>.657**</td>
<td>.852**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

** Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

* Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).
In order to test for invariance across time periods, the manage groups option was again used and the estimates for the paths in both groups were calculated simultaneously with direct path estimates allowed to differ across both groups. The chi-square for this model was 128.5 with 64 degrees of freedom, $p = 0.000$, AGFI .868, CFI .961, RMSE .055 which indicates an acceptable fit. When the parameters for both groups were constrained the chi-square was 148.7 with 75 degrees of freedom. The chi-square difference test ($\chi^2 20.20, \nu 11$) indicated a significant difference across the free and constrained models, and Figures 4 and 5 indicate the specific paths that differ significantly at each time.

Fig. 3 Full model with paths leading from the emotions to OSQ, OS and W of M. Paths also depict the causal relationship between the non emotion constructs.

Fig. 4 Time one with non significant paths removed
4. Discussion

Results pertaining to the first research question indicated that neither model provided an acceptable fit to the data, although the three dimensional model demonstrated a slight improvement across a range of fit statistics. The respecified model (Fig. 2) however, has provided substantial evidence for a valid and reliable three factor conceptualisation of the emotion construct. The Bi-directional component included the emotions of angry and disappointed and according to the Roseman et al., (1996) framework above, anger (they did not consider disappointed), is a result of a belief that a controllable attainment of a reward, was denied because of some other individual. The negative dimension included emotions similar to those that result from beliefs that a reward, or avoidance of punishment, is controllable, but were denied, or occurred because of the self.

Clearly, from a practitioner’s viewpoint, the three dimension model has distinct advantages for both diagnosing service shortfalls and developing service recovery strategies. Firstly, it enables decision makers to distinguish between customers who believe that they created the problem, and those who attributed the cause to external sources. Customers who experience ‘self-cause’ negative emotions may not defect as readily as others, however, as it has been shown that they are less likely to complain (White & Yu, 2005), the firm should proactively seek to contact these customers and rectify the problem. Those who experience bi-directional emotions, are likely to have attributed the cause to an external source, and as these are more likely to complain, customer service personal should be encouraged to view the service encounter as an opportunity to not only sell, but also rectify any problems the customer may have before leaving the store.

The second research question led to an examination of the relationship between emotion dimensions, and the service quality – satisfaction – word of mouth intentions process. The results pertaining to this question can be found in Figures 4 and 5 and clearly there are different things happening at different times. For time one, positive emotions and bi-directional emotions were both significant predictors of OSQ and of these the bi-directional emotions were stronger predictors (-.52 to .33). Positive emotions were also the strongest predictor of OS ($\beta = .51$), and in conjunction with OSQ, explained 45% of the variance in OS. Negative emotions were not significantly related to OSQ or OS and none of the emotion dimension directly influenced W of M. In this instance, the bi-directional or externally attributed dimension is associated with OSQ, which seems reasonable, as anger and disappointment in this instance appears directed toward the service provider.

As displayed in Table 4, the mean scores in time two indicated a downturn in the participants’ experience with the service and Figure 5 provides insights into the role of emotions in this context. Together the variables explain 76% of the variance in W of M, an increase of 12% from the previous time period, so as things got worse, the amount of variance explained in W of M increased. In this instance, all three components of emotions are significantly associated with OS, and together with OSQ, explain 81% of the variance in OS. Interestingly, the path from negative emotion to OS is positive indicating that as negative emotions increase by one standard deviation, OS increases by .20. Bi-
directional emotions in time 2 are the strongest predictor of OS, the negative sign indicating that as bi-directional emotions increase, OS declines, and positive emotions are a significant predictor of OSQ, OS and W of M.

These findings indicate that the role of emotions when applied simultaneously to OSQ, OS and W of M are more complex than one might expect. The pattern and strengths of the relationships change significantly over time periods, and emotions account for more variance in all dependent variables as the service experience declines. Unlike the pattern in time one, emotions in time two are all actively engaged in influencing each stage of the SQ, OS and W of M process and along with SQ, explain an additional 31% of the variance in OS. These findings reinforce previous work (Jaing & Wang, 2006; White, 2006) that reported that OSQ, a construct that has been considered cognitive, has a substantial emotion component, with positive and bi-directional emotions explaining 32 and 39 percent of the variance in OSQ in times one and two respectively. Practitioners and theorists therefore should consider including emotions when investigating service quality related matters.

One of the notable differences between times is the role played by bi-directional emotions. In time one it was the strongest predictor (-.52) of OSQ and while that relationship weakened in time two (-.27), it was also significantly associated with OS (-.46). Clearly an increase in bi-directional emotions has a significant negative impact on both perceptions of service quality and satisfaction judgements. The question then becomes, what can be done about it? The first action would be locate the source of anger and disappointment and if possible, rectify it or let the consumer know you are working towards solving the issues. Shifting the attribution from the service provider (other-caused), to circumstance-caused, could, according to Roseman et al., (1996) change anger to frustration, which may not influence OS the same way as anger. Likewise, if the other-cause of the anger and disappointment can be changed to self-caused, then anger may become guilt, as the customer takes some responsibility for the events, and as the findings reported here suggest, negative emotions such as guilt can have a significant positive impact on OS.

Another important aspect of the findings in this study is the role of positive emotions. In time one, the only significant predictor of W of M was OS, and if taken in isolation, one may believe that keeping the customer satisfied is sufficient for ensuring W of M. Clearly, this is not the case in time two and it appears that as the general service experience declines, the emotions of happy and hopeful have a direct influence on positive word of mouth intentions. Service providers therefore should aim to keep customers happy, and as this can be difficult to do on a constant basis, fostering hope should also occur. Reminding customers that the firm is committed to quality and are constantly upgrading systems to improve service delivery is one way of reinforcing a sense of hopefulness.

The aim of this study was to determine the validity of a three factor model of emotions and to simultaneously examine the relationship between emotions and the service quality – satisfaction – word of mouth intentions process. The findings indicated that a three factor model was more appropriate than a two factor conceptualisation, and after minor modifications, demonstrated an acceptable fit to the data. Theorist and practitioners now have a valid and reliable alternative when focusing on matters related to consumption emotions. Additionally, an examination of the role of emotions on OSQ, OS and W of M at two time periods with an extended service encounter, revealed for the first time the complexity of the relationship and a number of theoretical and practical considerations were discussed. Future research could involve applying the three factor model to other service contexts and different populations, as a further test of the models robustness. Qualitative work that examines ways in which bi-directional emotions can be redirected or softened would certainly assist in supporting some of the observations made above and provide invaluable assistance for service practitioners wishing to take the next step towards successful customer emotion management.

Reference list


